



Tim Rainey,
Executive Director

**CALIFORNIA WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
SPECIAL PRESENTATION NOTICE**

Gavin Newsom,
Governor

Angelo Farooq,
Chair

**Wednesday, April 20, 2022
10:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m.**

Presentation: The Impact of High Road

Meetings of the California Workforce Development Board (CWDB) are open to the public except when specifically notified otherwise in accordance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act. The board may take action regarding any item listed on the agenda, unless listed as information only. Times are approximate and subject to change. Agenda items may be taken out of order to accommodate speakers and to maintain a quorum. This meeting may be canceled without notice.

A full packet with additional details regarding the scheduled agenda items will be available at least 24 hours prior to the meeting at: <https://cwdb.ca.gov/meetings/>.

Public Viewing and Comments

The meeting will be livestreamed for public viewing on the CWDB YouTube channel at: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC8j2IMLyol-6ifdLHGTXLiQ>.

The public is welcome to comment on any agenda item. Therefore, consistent with [Executive Order N-29-20](#), public comments may be made by:

- Sending an email to BoardPublicComment@cwdb.ca.gov. Emailed comments should be submitted by 8:00 a.m. on the meeting date. In the subject line, please identify the agenda item being addressed.
- Posting on YouTube during the meeting. Posted comments should identify the agenda item being addressed and be submitted prior to or during the discussion of the agenda item.
- If unable to submit comments electronically, please mail written comments to the address listed below. All mailed comments should be received by close of business the day before the scheduled meeting.

California Workforce Development Board
800 Capitol Mall, Suite 1022
Sacramento CA 95814

Public comments timely received will be read aloud during the public comment period for the agenda item specified. Failure to submit a timely comment or identify the agenda item being addressed may prevent your comment from being read at the meeting.

Any and all written comments provided to CWDB, including all contents of emails, will be available to the public in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, Government Code section 11125.1.

Accommodations

Individuals who require accommodations for their disabilities (including interpreters, sign language translation, alternate document formats, or other auxiliary aids) are requested to contact the California Workforce Development Board staff at (916) 657-1440 at least five business days prior to the meeting in order to ensure the availability of the requested accommodation. Please visit the California Workforce Development Board website at <http://www.cwdb.ca.gov> for additional information.

Contact Person

If you have any questions concerning the agenda, you may contact:

California Workforce Development Board
800 Capitol Mall, Suite 1022
Sacramento CA 95814
T: 916-657-1440
BoardPublicComment@cwdb.ca.gov

**CALIFORNIA WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
SPECIAL PRESENTATION AGENDA**

**Wednesday, April 20, 2022
10:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m.**

***Note:** The Impact of High Road presentation is strictly informational. No action will be taken at this meeting.*

1. Introduction and Preview

Director Rainey introduced the presentation by describing how workforce development prior to the establishment of the High Road largely dealt with outputs. These outputs include but are not limited to the acquisition of training certificates and employment status, which traditionally focus on fixing the worker. High Road Training Partnership (H RTP) programs are meant to instead focus on the experience of the worker, accessibility, and whether or not we impact poverty systemically. H RTP projects focus less on fixing the worker, and instead deal with issues around recruiting, stability, economic mobility. Director Rainey then likened the approach of the High Road to an allegory that was once put forth by an MIT professor who claims that these sorts of structural problems resemble a crowded basketball game at a high school gym, in which there are more spectators than seats. The less advantageous approach, the “low road” would be to train people to be more aggressive. The “low road” approach is described as disadvantageous because essentially, if implemented, people remain locked in competition. And so there is a need to think bigger, a need to be bold. The High Road vision calls for a shift away from competition, and to instead, improve access to good jobs, create more good jobs, invest in certain firms, and to divest from the “low road” while improving existing jobs.

Furthermore, it was established that High Road Construction Careers (HRCC) would not be covered, as that initiative is very involved and unique. Thus the details of such projects would need to be shared in a separate meeting. Director Rainey then shared the agenda with the group.

2. Overview of H RTP Initiative Timeline and Lessons Learned

Director Rainey then shared an introductory presentation.

The first slide discussed prior challenges faced by the workforce. Disadvantageous tendencies that have come to encumber workforce

development initiatives include, a proclivity to blame poor labor market conditions on the workforce, a tendency to focus too much on fixing the worker, and a general scarcity of good jobs. A fundamental hindrance is that there are not enough good jobs for the number of people who need good jobs.

The next slide established a need to improve access to good jobs, create a greater abundance of good jobs by subsidizing H RTP companies and employers that treat workers as an asset to investment, and improving existing jobs, thus improving the retention of talent.

The slide that followed discussed the core principles of the High Road-of equity, quality jobs, and climate resilience.

Director Rainey detailed the original H RTPs, which initially received \$9 million in WIOA funding in 2016. H RTP Funds were released in three solicitations from 2016 to 2019. He discussed the data generated by partnering research institutions, such as UC Berkeley and UCLA. The above mentioned institutions also helped in the process of authoring foundational documents. Director Rainey added that UCLA conducted a process evaluation in the summer of 2019, and that an executive summary was produced in the spring of 2021. Among the materials created are the foundational documents, and single pagers on topics such as Equity, Job Quality, and Climate, along with the High Road Framework.

Essential elements for this undertaking include an industry led approach to problem solving, ensuring that partnerships retain a level of prioritization, and the prioritization of worker voice, all along with industry-driven training solutions, as “work is coalition building and sustaining.”

Director Rainey then discussed current H RTPs and their funding levels. In June 2021, \$19 million from the Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund (GGRF) was granted to existing and new grantees, or 22 total grants, with 4,300 staff members to be trained, and an evaluation set to take place in March of 2023, under the supervision of UCLA. The 2021-22 Budget is set at \$110.5 million.

At this point, Director Rainey stopped to take questions.

Ms. Zabin: Asked about Shrayas Jaktar’s work and focusing on the type of work he does.

Director Rainey: Says that the team in question was, at that time, in the process of being assembled. He also claimed that policy and program(s) were in the process of working together.

Director Rainey: Went on to introduce Deputy Director Aida Cardenas to everyone and she was very excited.

Deputy Director Cardenas: Shared a map of the current HRTPs around California. At this point, it was said that neither doubling the numbers nor aimlessly increasing the quantity of projects, were paramount, and that the effectiveness of individual projects, and their propensity to meet the needs of working Californians were of the utmost importance.

Deputy Director Cardenas then introduced Deb Moy, thus beginning the showcase.

Ms. Moy began with a video about California Transit Works. Everyone in the video was happy and there were buses and people smiling.

3. Showcase: Presentations from Thriving High Road Training Partnerships

I. California Transit Works ([CTW](#))

Mr. Brauer: We want to show that labor is important in partnerships. Being an industry partner and bringing worker voice into the equation. Adaptability. H RTP dollars and general fund dollars were a great start, but it was just a start to help grow this.

Ms. Moy then claimed that transit serves underserved communities and more than 50% of the people in the program come from these disadvantaged communities. Then she stated that the California Transit Works came from a consortium of H RTP programs, not individual H RTP programs.

The main principles of CTW were then established. The principles are (were?) Industry Driven, Worker Centered, Community Oriented and Measurable Results. At the time of the meeting, there were six H RTP's across the state.

Ms. Moy then implored Mr. Russell Anderson to present about electric buses and the workforce that will be needed to make the transition to zero- emission buses, or ZEBs.

According to Mr. Anderson, California will begin to use zero emission buses (ZEBs), and due to this change, effective training will be very important.

Ms. Babauata: This speaker discussed employees and retention. She claimed that it had been tough recruiting and retaining workers. They connected with the community colleges to implement a pre-apprenticeship program at Santa Rosa College, and states that there is interest in also

building a similar program at College of Marin. They sought to work with underserved communities to recruit workers. Setting up employees for success was then established as an effective retention strategy (to retain current staff levels).

Mr. Gamble (Mission College – Santa Clara): Claimed that there were 7 active Transit apprenticeships, 5 CTE Certificates and 3 Non-Traditional apprenticeships. He then discussed the investments made by several different groups around the state.

Mr. Gibson: He discussed their apprenticeship program. He claimed that the plan, at that time, was to grow the apprenticeship programs and prepare the communities to transition into transit careers.

Deputy Director Cardenas discussed the HRTP further.

Ms. Moy thanked the Board for their support.

See the [Full Presentation Linked Here](#)

II. Shirley Ware Education Center

Rebecca Hanson, the leader of this particular HRTP project introduced Sonya Allen-Smith, and implored her to begin the presentation for the Shirley Ware Education Center.

Ms. Allen-Smith: Her* current role is with Kaiser Permanente as Radiologic Technologist. She wanted to share her experience coming into healthcare. For 20 years, worked in nonprofits that served heavily impacted areas. She entered the X-Ray program. Healthcare field gave me so many opportunities I didn't know even existed. She became involved with the unions. Put together some emotional intelligence, which really helped sending partners get out into the workforce. She claimed that she was without the resources that many individuals have now with HRTP and the Ed fund. She only had her grandmother. She was able to get a Masters through the Education Fund. She lauded the Ed Fund as a life changing program.

Ms. Hanson: Over the past year, 27,000 students have been helped by this program. Opportunities to partner with other HRTP partners and build out the public education partnerships that support these ongoing career pathways have grown in abundance.

Mr. Scott: Claimed that he would not be [there] without the Board's support. He was the first HRTP partner contact, and he described promoting job quality and family benefits. Apprenticeships have been

important assets, especially in a workforce that is mostly women and people of color. Apprenticeships promote retention. Mr. Scott provided a list of success stories.

The presentation was briefly opened up for questions.

Mr. (Bob) Beecher: Did Kaiser Permanente not offer tuition assistance to students? And how many people that start these programs finish them?

Ms. Hanson: Yes, they do. They complement what we are able to provide them. It is usually a tuition reimbursement, but at times these monies can be provided up front.

To Mr. Redlo's second question, Ms. Hanson responds with: 90% of entrants complete the program.

See the [Full Presentation Linked Here](#)

4. Testing the Efficacy of High Road: Evaluation Framework

Deputy Director Cardenas: The Challenge of capturing these partnerships and making sure these programs are being promoted in communities throughout the state. Great to see the great work after five years of establishing these HRTPs

Mr. Kotamraju: Having a robust research and administration staff is conducive to the cultivation of a strong analytical database. The HRTP work that is being done is central to the task of aligning the executive team's research and strategic planning.

Ms. Gonzalez Vasquez (UCLA Labor Center): For the last four years, the UCLA Labor Center has been involved in evaluating the HRTPs and their work and successes/challenges. When initiative started, there was a lack of information out there regarding the High Road approach. They took a two-prong approach in evaluating the various projects.

Ms. Gonzalez Vasquez went into the evaluation key takeaways on HRTPs.

Mr. Kotamraju thanked Ms. Gonzalez Vasquez for her report.

Mr. Redlo: Lauded the efforts of Ms. Gonzalez Vasquez. We have found payment for training is the key to success. It would be nice to see some data, especially in healthcare. Would be nice to see the qualitative measures around being paid while they learn, as opposed to not being

paid while they learn. Many of the funds out there have barriers around that. Would be worthwhile to have this information.

Ms. Hanson: These workers need flexibility and support. If you have a job where you are supported and encouraged, it is big. One almost needs the wages to participate.

Ms. Gonzalez Vasquez: Said that she was hoping to look at these aspects more in the next phase of work.

Ms. Moy: Claimed that there are many aspects to evaluate, and that the foundations of strong partnerships are being found. Without such foundations, certain desired outcomes are not reachable.

Director Rainey: All the HRTPs are at very different levels. As you expand and scale your work, you have to consider that.

See the [Full Presentation Linked Here](#)

5. From HRTP to High Road: Policies and Standards

Ms. Zabin: Urged the Board and the project-participants to measure where wages have improved because of actions of the Board in terms of HRTP partners.

Director Rainey: Praised the point made by Ms. Zabin.

Mr. Kotamraju: Claimed that the board actively seeks continual improvements in these processes, and then affirmed that reporting has been shifted to a third party to help in evaluation work.

Director Rainey: There is more work we are doing to institutionalize the HRTP work. Integrating everything about High Road into our other work. Embed High Road principles in all aspects of our work.

Adjourn

Director Rainey adjourned the 12:04pm

Board Member comments recorded in the Zoom chat:

10:05:55 From John Brauer, CA Labor Federation To Everyone:

John Brauer, California Labor Federation

10:05:57 From Ana Luz (she,her), UCLA Labor Center To Everyone:

Ana Luz Gonzalez-Vasquez, UCLA Labor Center

10:06:02 From Pete Callas CDE To Everyone:

Pete Callas, California Department of Education

10:06:04 From Rebecca Hanson, Education Fund (she/her) To Everyone:

Rebecca Hanson, SEIU UHW Joint Employer Education Fund and Shirley Ware Education Center

10:06:07 From Rob Gamble Mission College To Everyone:

Rob Gamble Mission College

10:06:09 From Deb Moy To Everyone:

Deborah Moy, California Transit Works!

10:06:10 From Manny Saucedo - Team Leyva To Everyone:

Manny Saucedo Senator Connie Leyva

10:06:10 From Tarik Scott (he/him) To Everyone:

Tarik Scott

SEIU UHW & Joint Employer Education Fund/Shirley Ware Education Center

10:06:20 From JAVIER ROMERO To Everyone:

Javier Romero, EDD Workforce Services Branch

10:06:25 From Abby iPhone To Everyone:

Abby Snay, LWDA

10:06:25 From Jamaine Gibson To Everyone:

Jamaine Gibson

Director of Apprenticeships and Workforce Development

Amalgamated Transit Union

10:06:41 From LAURENCE FRANK To Everyone:

Larry Frank-UCLA Labor Center, former President, LA Trade Tech College

10:06:45 From Avin Sharma, Port of LA To Everyone:

Avin Sharma
Director of Labor Relations & Workforce Development
Port of Los Angeles
asharma@portla.org

10:07:01 From Bob Redlo, (he,him) To Everyone:

Bob Redlo, CWDB Member, Director Bay Area Health Workforce Partnership

10:07:01 From Russell Anderson To Everyone:

Russell Anderson, CTW Director Bus Maintenance Training

10:07:54 From Sandra Sanchez To Everyone:

Sandra Sanchez, Interim Vice Chancellor, Workforce & Economic Development,
California Community Colleges Chancellor's office

11:00:23 From Rob Gamble Mission College To Everyone:

I have to leave for a graduation, 20 more trained professional drives. Thanks you again for inviting us.

11:00:37 From Deb Moy To Everyone:

Thanks Rob!

11:36:03 From AIDA CARDENAS To ANNA CHAMPE(Privately):

Hi Anna, do you happen to know how many folks listened in on the YouTube site?

11:57:05 From Rebecca Hanson, Education Fund (she/her) To Everyone:

In fact as we add programs our outcomes make look "worse" if we make more entry points and work to get the right services in place

12:00:33 From Rebecca Hanson, Education Fund (she/her) To Everyone:

Thank you so much, need to join another meeting but so grateful for this work and all of you!

12:02:29 From Ana Luz (she,her), UCLA Labor Center To Everyone:

Thank you, everyone!

12:02:35 From Deb Moy To Everyone:

Thank you, everyone!

12:02:47 From John Brauer, CA Labor Federation To Everyone:

Thank you all

12:02:48 From Bob Beitcher To Everyone:

Thanks to all!

12:02:49 From Manny Saucedo - Team Leyva To Everyone:

Thank you. Great presentation

12:02:51 From Tarik Scott (he/him) To Everyone:

Thank you for having us. Great conversation!

12:02:54 From Mona Babauta, Golden Gate Transit (SF North Bay) To Everyone:

Thank you! This was so enlightening for me.