



## CAAL-Skills Workforce Metrics Dashboard Report 2022

### Chapter 2: Report Overview

The California Workforce Development Board (CWDB) assists the Governor in setting and guiding policy in the area of workforce development. The CWDB is responsible for assisting the Governor in performing the duties and responsibilities required by the federal Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) of 2014.

California's [Unified Strategic Workforce Development Plan](#) directs its work in providing guidance to the statewide workforce development system.

The production of this report would not have been possible without the ongoing support and participation of the CAAL-Skills partner agencies and the diligent work of the Employment Development Department (EDD) Labor Market Information Division.

This document can be found on the CWDB's website at [cwdb.ca.gov](http://cwdb.ca.gov)

California Workforce Development Board  
800 Capitol Mall, Suite 1022  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
T: 916-657-1440  
F: 916-657-1377

## Table of Contents

2	Report Overview .....	1
2.1	Purpose of the Report.....	1
2.2	Report Structure .....	1
2.3	Participating Partners and Programs .....	3
2.3.1	California Employment Development Department – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act – Title I .....	3
2.3.2	California Department of Education (CDE) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title II Program.....	9
2.3.3	California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title III Program .....	9
2.3.4	California Department of Rehabilitation (DOR) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title IV Program - Adults .....	9
2.3.5	California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office (CCCCO) – Career Technical Education (CTE) Program .....	10
2.3.6	California Employment Training Panel (ETP) – Incumbent Worker Training Program.....	11
2.3.7	California Department of Industrial Relations (DIR), Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS) – State Certified Apprenticeship Program .....	13
2.3.8	California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) Program .....	13
2.3.9	California Department of Social Services (CDSS) – Welfare to Work Program.....	14
2.4	About the Data.....	14
2.5	Reported Outcomes.....	16
2.5.1	Data Comparisons with Benchmarks .....	16
2.5.2	Outputs.....	17
2.5.3	Reading the Data Tables .....	20
2.6	Limitations.....	21

## 2 Report Overview

### 2.1 Purpose of the Report

#### Goal of Report

The workforce metrics dashboard created by AB 2148 and AB 1336 is intended to show state legislators, policymakers, program administrators, and those served by programs how the state's workforce and education programs are performing. A workforce metrics dashboard answers basic questions by using a small number of common metrics to report education and employment outcomes across workforce development programs.<sup>1</sup> Dashboards are designed to be easily understood by policymakers and the general public, who may not be technical experts in methods of program measurement. Some of the basic questions dashboards answer include:

- Do participants complete skills training?
- Do they get jobs?
- How much do they earn?<sup>2</sup>

The present workforce metrics report expands upon the coverage of the inaugural 2018 report to more completely fulfill the mandate of AB 1336, by incorporating first fruits of the CAAL-Skills data-sharing program.

#### New Partners

Thanks to the data-sharing agreement that underpins the CAAL-Skills pilot program, the present workforce metrics report incorporates program performance outcomes for the following additional programs which could not be included in the inaugural 2018 report:

- California Department of Education (CDE) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title II Program
- California Department of Rehabilitation (DOR) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title IV Program – Adults
- California Department of Social Services (CDSS) – Welfare to Work Program<sup>3</sup>
- California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Wagner-Peyser Job Services Title III Program<sup>4</sup>

### 2.2 Report Structure

The workforce metrics dashboard report identifies both cross-program and individual program outcomes for individuals enrolled in the following programs:

- Community college career technical education (CTE) programs;

---

<sup>1</sup> National Skills Coalition. [Using Dashboards for State Workforce Planning](#). February 2015.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid

<sup>3</sup> Program outcome data for CalFresh E&T could not be included in this report, due to dissimilarities between program exit data provided and the definition of program exit used by other participating CAAL-Skills programs.

<sup>4</sup> Data for workforce development programs administered by CDCR is expected to be available for inclusion in next year's report. If CDCR participates, the CAAL-Skills system will be further able to facilitate the evaluation of correctional programs and provide insights into the workforce programs accessed by and available to those previously incarcerated in state correctional institutions.

- Employment Training Panel (ETP) incumbent worker on-the-job training programs;
- Workforce Investment Act (WIOA) Title I
  - i. Adult,
  - ii. Dislocated Worker, and
  - iii. Youth federally funded career services and training programs;
- Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) programs for those displaced by a trade-related layoff;
- State certified apprenticeship programs.
- California Department of Education (CDE) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title II Program
- California Department of Rehabilitation (DOR) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title IV Program – Adults
- California Department of Social Services (CDSS) – Welfare to Work Programs
- California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title III Program<sup>5</sup>

The remainder of Chapter 2 completes the report overview, by identifying and describing each of the participating programs and partners participating in this report. Inclusion of federally-generated statewide estimates for state population demographics of California’s workforce, as well as average pay levels in a range of industries, is also discussed. The chapter introduces the report’s data tables, describing the WIOA performance accountability indicators that were employed to measure and report program performance outcomes. Finally, limitations in data collection and analysis are clarified.

Chapter 3 introduces statewide statistics obtained from the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics providing demographic information about California’s workforce, as well as average earning data in key industries, and explains the function of these estimates in providing a base of comparison for program outcomes. Caveats concerning use of these estimates are discussed.

In Chapter 4, the extent of cross-program participation across fiscal years 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 is provided according to numbers served. (At this time more extensive data revealing outcomes for cross-program participation is not available). For the purposes of cohort timing with base wage data and Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages data, a measurable program year is defined according to state fiscal year 7/1/201X-6/30/201X.

In the inaugural 2018 workforce metrics dashboard, Program Years were defined in a different manner than in the present report: specifically, that report presented data for the Program Years 2013-14 and 2014-15, with the 2013-14 “Program Year” defined as 10/1/2012-9/30/2013 and, for Program Year 2014-2015, from 10/1/2013-9/30/2014.

---

<sup>5</sup> As discussed, Program outcome data for CalFresh E&T could not be included in this report, due to dissimilarities between program exit data provided and the definition of program exit used by other participating CAAL-Skills programs. It is anticipated that program outcomes will be reportable for fiscal year 2018 and beyond.

Detailed individual program outcomes are reported in Chapters 5-15, including employment rates and median earnings for program participants recorded in the second and fourth quarters post-exit. (Please see Section 2.5.2 below for a complete list of program outputs). In an effort to use common measures that harmonize state and federal workforce and education performance reporting requirements, the State Workforce Board and its partners have agreed to utilize Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) employment and wage metrics. Chapter 16 provides a brief conclusion and discussion of next steps.

Appendices providing detailed information on performance measures, inputs, outputs, and performance measures, are included at the end of this report.

## **2.3 Participating Partners and Programs**

### **2.3.1 California Employment Development Department – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act – Title I**

The Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act was signed in June 2014, replacing the Workforce Investment Act of 1998 (WIA). While structurally similar to its predecessor, WIOA imposed key changes in program structure and reporting requirements, some of which have been alluded to earlier in this report. Despite these changes, the Adult and Dislocated Worker programs still offer a similar set of services and serve the same general populations as their WIA analogs. The present section focuses specifically on describing Title I programs under WIOA, including changes from service descriptions under the analogous WIA title programs under which services were provided for the years reported on in the 2018 Workforce Metrics Dashboard report. The report's use of performance accountability measures introduced by WIOA is discussed later in this chapter.

WIA's supersession by WIOA constitutes a change from reporting conditions for the inaugural workforce metrics dashboard report. WIOA took effect on July 1, 2015, meaning that the change in law occurred precisely following conclusion of the first program year this report covers.

During FY 2014-2015, the first year this report covers, participants in programs that came to be defined by WIOA were enrolled under the corresponding WIA titles. Due to WIOA's re-classification of services (discussed earlier in this chapter), some discrepancies exist between how the same type of services were defined in FY 2014-2015 versus in FY 2015-2016.

Specifics of classification inconsistencies from WIA to WIOA and how they were resolved are addressed in Chapter 5. In general, WIA-to-WIOA classification inconsistencies were addressed by classifying WIA services under their WIOA definitions.

Because the first program year, FY 2014-2015, concluded immediately before WIOA took effect, there was no need to follow individual participants between WIA and WIOA enrollments. The period of program enrollment for the first cohort of CAAL-Skills participants concluded right

before WIOA went into effect in July 2015.

### **WIOA Title I**

WIOA consists of Title I (Adults, Dislocated Workers, and Youth), Title II (Adult Education and Literacy), Title III (Wagner-Peyser), Title IV (Vocational Rehabilitation), and Title V (General Provisions). The program descriptions and eligibility criteria included in this section align closely with the same programs under WIA.

WIOA Title I is largely structured around three programs: Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth.<sup>6</sup> The Adult and Dislocated Worker programs provide employment and training services to assist eligible individuals find and qualify for meaningful employment, and to help employers find skilled workers.

#### **Title I Youth programs:**

Under WIOA, the definition of eligible youth includes individuals aged 16 to 24, representing an expansion in eligibility from WIA, which capped eligibility at age 21. The WIOA Title I Youth program offers services to individuals who met the following eligibility criteria:

#### **Out-of-school youth:**

- Not attending any school (as defined under State law).
- Not younger than age 16 or older than age 24; and one or more of the following:
  - A school dropout
  - A youth who is within the age of compulsory school attendance, but has not attended school for at least the most recent complete school year calendar quarter.
  - A recipient of a secondary school diploma or its recognized equivalent who is a low-income individual and is one or more of the following:
    - Basic skills deficient
    - An English language learner
    - An individual who is subject to the juvenile or adult justice system
    - A homeless individual, a homeless child or youth, a runaway, in foster care or has aged out of the foster care system, a child eligible for assistance under section 477 of the Social Security Act (42 U.S.C. 677), or in an out- of-home placement
    - An individual who is pregnant or parenting.
    - A youth who is an individual with a disability.
    - A low-income individual who requires additional assistance to enter or complete an educational program or to secure or hold employment.

#### **In-School Youth:**

---

<sup>6</sup> WIOA Title I also includes smaller programs such as Job Corps, Section 166 (Indian and Native Americans), Section 167 (National Farmworker Jobs Program), which are not discussed in this report. This is consistent with omission of discussion of the analogous programs under WIA from the 2018 workforce metrics report.

- Not younger than age 14 or (unless an individual with a disability who is attending school under State law) older than age 21
- A low-income individual; and (iv) one or more of the following:
  - Basic skills deficient
  - An English language learner.
  - An offender
  - A school dropout
  - Homeless, a runaway, or a foster child
  - Pregnant or a parent
  - A youth who is an individual with a disability
  - An individual who requires additional assistance to complete an educational program or to secure or hold employment<sup>7</sup>

#### Title I Adult programs:

WIA, which preceded WIOA, made Local Workforce Investment Boards (now, Workforce Development Boards—known as Local Boards) responsible for establishing a coordinated delivery system composed of American Job Centers (also known as One-Stop Career Centers). At these centers, the Adult and Dislocated Worker programs offered services in three tiers that provided progressively greater levels of assistance according to customers' needs: core services (information and online tools to help customers plan their careers and find employment, accessed either through self-service at an AJCC or via the internet, self-directed or requiring only modest staff assistance) would be provided initially, with subsequent provision of intensive services (assessments, workshops, job search assistance and other services requiring higher levels of staff assistance) offered only if employment was not obtained through core services—and training accessible only following service access.

WIOA more thoroughly integrates service delivery to meet individual job-seekers' needs and to provide greater flexibility to local workforce development programs. WIOA thus eliminated the tiered service model that prevailed under WIA, by merging earlier categories of "core" and "intensive" services, and by eliminating the expectation that jobseekers access career services prior to seeking training.

Under WIOA, the following adult program services are available to all customers ages 18 and older:

- **Career services:** outreach, job search and employment assistance, and labor market information as well as more comprehensive assessments, development of individual employment plans and counseling and career planning, open to all adult and dislocated worker jobseekers.
- **Training services:** Under WIOA, training services are provided to equip individuals to enter the workforce and retain employment. Training services are available for individuals who, after interview, evaluation or assessment, and case management are determined to be unlikely or unable to obtain or retain employment that leads to self-

---

<sup>7</sup> WIOA, Title I, Chapter 2, Section 129

sufficiency or higher wages than previous employment through career services alone. WIOA emphasizes that training services be “provided in a manner that maximizes consumer choice in the selection of an eligible provider of such services.”<sup>8</sup> Training services include:

- occupational skills training, including training for nontraditional employment;
- on-the-job training;
- incumbent worker training
- programs that combine workplace training with related instruction, which may include cooperative education programs;
- training programs operated by the private sector;
- skill upgrading and retraining;
- entrepreneurial training;
- transitional jobs
- job readiness training
- adult education and literacy activities, including activities of English language acquisition and integrated education and training programs

WIOA prioritizes services for low-income and basic skills-deficient individuals,<sup>9</sup> ensuring that those in greatest need receive services. In keeping with this prioritization, WIOA expanded required partners in the existing “One-Stop” system of co-located services through America’s Job Centers of California. Through these centers, jobseekers access a variety of services in a single, physical location. WIOA sec. 134(c)(3)(E) provides a statutory priority for public assistance recipients, other low-income individuals, and individuals who are basic skills deficient.

Under WIOA, required partners to AJCCs include all of the following:

- WIOA Title I Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth
- WIOA Title II Adult Education and Literacy
- WIOA Title III Wagner-Peyser
- WIOA Title IV Vocational Rehabilitation
- Carl Perkins Career Technical Education
- Title V Older Americans Act
- Job Corps
- Native American Programs (Section 166)
- Migrant Seasonal Farmworkers (Section 167)
- Veterans
- Youth Build
- Trade Adjustment Assistance Act
- Community Services Block Grant
- Housing & Urban Development
- Unemployment Compensation

---

<sup>8</sup> WIOA Section 134 (3)(F).

<sup>9</sup> Under WIA, prioritization was only enacted if a local area demonstrated limited funds.

- Second Chance
- Temporary Assistance for Needy Families/CalWORKs

WIOA mandates that every local area have at least one comprehensive AJCC providing universal access<sup>10</sup> to the full range of employment services, training and education, employer assistance, etc.  
<sup>11</sup>

Besides the above Adult programs which have universal availability for those over 18, WIOA Title I also provides specific services for Dislocated Workers.

Dislocated Worker program services are available to an individual who:

- Has been terminated or laid off, or who has received a notice of termination or layoff, from employment;
- Is eligible for or has exhausted entitlement to Unemployment Insurance compensation; or,
- Has been employed for a duration sufficient to demonstrate, to the appropriate entity at a one-stop center, attachment to the workforce, but is not eligible for unemployment compensation due to insufficient earnings or having performed services for an employer that were not covered under a State unemployment compensation law; and is unlikely to return to a previous industry or occupation;
- Has been terminated or laid off, or has received a notice of termination or layoff, from employment as a result of any permanent closure of, or any substantial layoff at, a plant, facility, or enterprise;
- Is employed at a facility at which the employer has made a general announcement that such facility will close within 180 days; or for purposes of eligibility to receive services other than training services, career services, or supportive services, is employed at a facility at which the employer has made a general announcement that such facility will close;
- Was self-employed (including employment as a farmer, a rancher, or a fisherman) but is unemployed as a result of general economic conditions in the community in which the individual resides or because of natural disasters;
- Is a displaced homemaker; or is the spouse of a member of the Armed Forces on active duty (as defined in section 101(d)(1) of title 10, United States Code), and who has

---

<sup>10</sup> The term “access” refers to providing services through one of the following methods: Colocation – Program staff from each partner are physically present at the AJCC; Cross information sharing – Staff physically present at the AJCC are properly trained to provide information about all programs, services, and activities that may be available to the customer through other partners; direct access through real-time technology – Access through two-way communication and interaction between customers and AJCC partners that result in services being provided (for example: email or instant messaging; live chat via Skype or Facetime; identification of a single point of contact for service delivery at each partner program; establishment of an Internet portal linking all of the partners [WIOA Joint Final Rules Section 678.305]).

<sup>11</sup> State of CA Employment Development Department. [Directive WSD18-12, WIOA Memorandums of Understanding](#). April 30, 2019.

experienced a loss of employment as a direct result of relocation to accommodate a permanent change in duty station of such member; or

- Is the spouse of a member of the Armed Forces on active duty and who meets additional eligibility criteria.<sup>12</sup>

Under WIOA, local areas were given the option to transfer 100% of funds between Adult and Dislocated Worker programs.

WIOA Title I is implemented by multiple state and local entities:

- The **Labor and Workforce Development Agency (LWDA)** serves as the lead agency on WIOA implementation and oversees boards and departments which perform work directly related to workforce development including the Employment Development Department and California Workforce Development Board.
- The **California Workforce Development Board (CWDB)** sets statewide policy for WIOA Title I programs, including policy pertaining to Local Workforce Development Board responsibilities and policy directly relevant to the design and operations of the One-Stop job center system.
- The **Employment Development Department (EDD)** performs the majority of statewide administrative and oversight functions required by WIOA Title I. Under the LWDA, the State Workforce Board and EDD collaborate closely to implement the Governor's vision for the state's workforce system.
- **Local Workforce Development Boards (Local Boards)** ensure the provision and coordination of WIOA Title I services in the state's 45 designated Local Workforce Development Areas. Each Local Board develops service strategies designed to correspond to the socioeconomic conditions, demographics, and regional labor market of their respective Local Area. Local Boards also appoint and provide oversight for One-Stop career center operators and select eligible organizations to provide services for youth and adults.
- **America's Job Centers of California (AJCCs)**, referred to alternately as "One-Stop career centers," function as the physical locations from which job seekers can access WIOA Title I services. AJCCs offer training referrals, career counseling, job listings, and similar employment-related services.

The following program descriptions are intended to provide a general understanding of the purpose and design of the five programs for which outcome data is presented in this report. Each program is designed differently, and the distinctions among program designs and populations served are particularly important to consider before reviewing the cross-program outcomes presented in Chapter 4 and individual program outcomes presented in Chapters 5-6. A more detailed description of each program, including participants served is provided within the outcomes section for each program.

---

<sup>12</sup> WIOA, Section 3, 15.

### **2.3.2 California Department of Education (CDE) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title II Program**

The federal Adult Education and Family Literacy Act (AEFLA), enacted as Title II of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act, provides federal funding to supplement adult education programs in both public and private non-profit institutions. These funds supplement Adult Basic Education (ABE), English as a Second Language (ESL), and Adult Secondary Education (ASE) programs.

### **2.3.3 California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title III Program**

The Wagner-Peyser Act of 1933 (amended by the Workforce Investment Act of 1998 and the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act of 2014) provided for establishment of a nationwide system of public employment offices. Services provided include job search assistance, job referrals, and placement assistance to jobseekers, reemployment services to UI recipients; and assistance in identifying candidates for job openings to employers.

Per amendments to the Wagner-Peyser Act via WIA (1998) and WIOA (2014), Title III services are currently co-located within the “One-stop career centers” (America’s Job Centers of California). Title III services are administered by the Employment Development Department. EDD provides job services to 1.5 million people through Wagner-Peyser programs.<sup>13</sup>

### **2.3.4 California Department of Rehabilitation (DOR) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title IV Program - Adults**

The Department of Rehabilitation works in partnership with consumers and other stakeholders to provide services and advocacy resulting in employment, independent living, and equality for individuals with disabilities in California. DOR administers the largest vocational rehabilitation (VR) program in the country. Employment services are provided annually by approximately 1,300 staff in over eighty-five offices in California over an extended period of time to approximately 100,000 individuals with significant disabilities to assist them to prepare for and obtain competitive employment in integrated work settings at or above minimum wage.

Generally, the population provided services through the VR program are individuals with disabilities who are not employed, or who are not employed consistent with their potential (also known as “under-employed”). The distinct needs of DOR participants (also referred to as DOR consumers) vary greatly depending upon individual, disability-related impediment(s) to employment and the consumer’s employment goal. In collaboration with the DOR Senior Vocational Rehabilitation Counselor-Qualified Rehabilitation Professional (SVRC-QRP), consumers engage in an interactive process to evaluate their individual disability-related functional limitations or needs and identify VR services required to prepare for, secure, retain or regain employment that is consistent with their unique strengths, resources, priorities, concerns, abilities, capabilities, interests, and informed choice.

---

<sup>13</sup> CWDB Unified State Plan, Program Years 2016-2019.

After determining eligibility through a comprehensive assessment and planning process and in collaboration with the SVRC-QRP, the consumer develops an Individualized Plan for Employment (IPE) that identifies the employment goal and required VR services to achieve that goal. VR plan services may include, but are not limited to:

- Counseling and guidance.
- Referrals and assistance to get services from other agencies.
- Pre-Employment Transition Services
- Job search and placement assistance.
- Vocational and other training services, including, but not limited to, pre-employment training and soft skills training.
- Evaluation of physical and mental impairments.
- On-the-job or personal assistance services.
- Interpreter services.
- Rehabilitation and orientation or mobility services for individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing and/or blind or low vision.
- Occupational licenses, tools, equipment, initial stocks, and supplies.
- Technical assistance for self-employment.
- Rehabilitation assistive technology services and devices.
- Supported employment services.
- Services to the family.
- Transportation as required, such as travel and related expenses, that is necessary to enable the consumer to participate in a VR service.
- Transition services for students.
- Work Incentive Planning, which includes providing information on potential employment earning impacts to Supplemental Security Income (SSI), Social Security Disability Income (SSDI), and Ticket to Work (TTW).
- Expansion of employment opportunities for individuals with disabilities, including, but are not limited to, professional employment and self-employment.
- Post-employment services.

In federal fiscal year 2014, DOR provided services to approximately 98,000 eligible individuals with disabilities, including 6,500 who were blind or visually impaired; 13,300 with cognitive disabilities; 18,200 with learning disabilities; 4,900 with intellectual or developmental disabilities; 6,500 deaf or hard of hearing individuals; 19,100 with physical disabilities; 26,100 with psychiatric disabilities; 1,200 with traumatic brain injury; and 2,200 individuals with other disabilities.<sup>14</sup>

### **2.3.5 California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) – Career Technical Education (CTE) Program**

California's Community College system is the largest provider of workforce training in the nation, serving more than two million students across 114 colleges annually. The system offers

---

<sup>14</sup> CWDB, Unified State Plan for Program Years 2016-2019, pp. 66-7

more than 200 Career Technical Education (CTE) programs, which generally entail a multiyear sequence of courses that integrates core academic knowledge with technical and occupational knowledge, ultimately leading to a pathway to a career and/or further postsecondary education.

California Community Colleges' CTE programs operate under the purview of the Chancellor's Office, which provides strategic direction, oversight, and technical assistance to locally operated programs. Within the Chancellor's Office, the Workforce and Economic Development Division (WEDD) serves as administrator for several state and federal funding streams that support CTE, including:

- Governor's Career Technical Education Pathways Initiative (Senate Bill 1070)
- Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Act of 2006
- Proposition 98 dollars for Apprenticeship, Economic & Workforce Development (EWD) and Career Technical Education

CTE programs are designed to meet the demands of the state's regional labor markets through collaboration among employers, organized labor, local communities, community colleges and other education entities. Seven Regional Consortia guide this collaboration and seek to ensure that CTE programs remain responsive to the workforce needs of businesses and industries in their respective region.

### **2.3.6 California Employment Training Panel (ETP) – Incumbent Worker Training Program**

The Employment Training Panel (ETP) provides funding to employers to assist in upgrading the skills of their workers through training that leads to good paying, long-term jobs. The ETP was created in 1982 by the California State Legislature and is funded by California employers through a special payroll tax. ETP does not use federal or state General Funds to fund its core program.<sup>15</sup> The ETP is a funding agency, not a training agency, and all of its contracts are performance-based to promote program success. Businesses determine their own training needs and how to provide training. ETP staff is available to assist in applying for funds, proposal development, and assistance in monitoring the progress of a contract. In general, to qualify for retraining funds, a business must demonstrate that workers' jobs face competition from outside of the state.

ETP is governed by eight Panel members: Three members are appointed by the Governor. Two are appointed by the Speaker of the Assembly. Two are appointed by the Senate Pro Tem. The Director of the Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development (GO-Biz), or his/her designee, shall serve as an ex officio, voting member.<sup>16</sup>

ETP funds training for two types of workers: new hire trainees and retrainees. New hire trainees are individuals who are unemployed at the start of ETP-funded training and are receiving Unemployment Insurance (UI) benefits at the time of hire, or have exhausted their benefits

---

<sup>15</sup> Employment Training Panel Annual Report for FY 2015-2016, p. 2.

<sup>16</sup> Employment Training Panel. "[About Us](#)".

within the previous 24 month period. Workers who have received a layoff notice from their employer are also eligible to become a new hire trainee. Retraitees, who account for 90% of program participants, are currently employed (incumbent) workers who meet one of the following criteria:

- Workers employed full-time for a minimum of 90 days with a single employer, and are participants in the training program;
- Workers who have been employed for less than 90 days with their current employer and have a work history of being employed for at least an average of 20 hours per week for at least 90 days by an ETP eligible employer(s) during the 180 day period preceding their current hire date;
- Workers who were employed less than 90 days prior to the start date of employment with their current employer and were collecting UI benefits, or had exhausted their benefits within the previous two years.

During the FYs covered in this report, ETP supported job creation and workforce development throughout California by supporting projects with the greatest impact on the economy. Through the establishment of funding priorities, the Panel maximized its limited funds prioritizing:

- Job creation projects
- Projects with a demonstrated investment in California's economy
- Projects serving drought-impacted regions of the state
- Critical Proposals - GO-BIZ References
- Projects serving veteran trainees
- Small business projects

The Panel also prioritized industries critical to the state's economy including:

- Agriculture
- Allied Healthcare
- Biotechnology and Life Sciences
- Construction
- Goods Movement and Transportation Logistics
- Green/Clean Technology Services
- Manufacturing
- Multimedia/Entertainment
- Technical Services<sup>17</sup>

Given ETP's funding prioritization by projects and industries, trainee selection is left to the discretion of contractors in accordance with their needs.

---

<sup>17</sup> ETP Annual Report for FY 2015-2016, p. 4.

### **2.3.7 California Department of Industrial Relations (DIR), Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS) – State Certified Apprenticeship Program**

The Department of Industrial Relations-Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DIR-DAS) oversees the state's apprenticeship system—the largest apprenticeship system in the nation with more than 86,000 apprentices across a variety of occupations.<sup>18</sup>

DIR-DAS administers California apprenticeship law and enforces apprenticeship standards regarding wages, hours, working conditions, and the specific skills required for state certification. While DIR-DAS does not directly operate apprenticeship programs, it promotes apprenticeship training through the creation of partnerships, consults with program sponsors, and monitors programs to ensure high standards for on-the-job training and supplemental classroom instruction.

Apprenticeship is a proven approach for preparing workers for jobs through progressive skills and wage gains, while meeting the needs of employers. It is an employer-driven, “earn and learn” model that combines on-the-job training, provided by an employer that hires the apprentice, with job-related instruction in curricula tied to the attainment of state skills standards provided by apprenticeship training centers, technical schools, community colleges, and other educational institutions. Apprentices can be new hires, or businesses can select current employees who need skill upgrades to join the apprenticeship program.

Apprenticeship program sponsors establish qualifications to apply for a program, which may include minimum educational attainment, ability to physically perform the essential functions of the job, or other criteria. Based on the selection method used by the sponsor, additional qualification standards – such as aptitude tests, interviews, school grades, or previous work experience – may be included for qualification. The length of an apprenticeship program depends on the complexity of the occupation and the type of program model the sponsor chooses. Apprenticeship programs range in length from six months to six years. After completion of an apprenticeship program, an apprentice earns an industry-recognized credential that is “portable” in that other employers in that industry will recognize its value, and “stackable” in that an apprentice can build on their training to move on to more advanced training and education.

### **2.3.8 California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) Program**

The Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) program is a federal program administered by the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL) and, at the state level, by the EDD. The TAA program was established under the Trade Act of 1974 to provide assistance to workers who are laid off as a result of increased imports or a shift in production to a foreign country. The program provides

---

<sup>18</sup> Department of Industrial Relations – Division of Apprenticeship Standards. [About the Division of Apprenticeship Standards.](#)

eligible workers with a Trade Readjustment Allowance (TRA) during periods of unemployment and assists workers in regaining satisfactory employment through the use of employment services, classroom and/or on-the-job training, job search assistance, and relocation allowances.

To qualify for the program, a petition must be filed to the DOL by or on behalf of a group of affected workers. If the DOL determines the petition to be valid, it will issue a certification of eligibility so that employees who have been laid off or had their hours reduced may apply for assistance from the TAA program. Workers who are part of a group whose petition has been certified must contact their local EDD office to apply for the program. EDD then determines if the worker is covered by the certification, and whether basic qualifying requirements have been met. Basic qualifying requirements are:

- The worker must have been laid off for lack of work on or after the impact date and before the termination date of the certification.
- The worker must have had weekly wages of \$30 or more in adversely affected employment in at least 26 of the previous 52 weeks, ending with the week of the worker's separation.<sup>19</sup>

### **2.3.9 California Department of Social Services (CDSS) – Welfare to Work Program**

CalWORKs is a public assistance program that provides cash aid and services to eligible families that have a child(ren) in the home. The program serves all 58 counties in the state and is operated locally by county welfare departments.<sup>20</sup>

CalWORKs programs provide a wide array of services, including education and training, ancillary supportive services such as childcare and transportation support, and help with domestic violence and substance abuse issues. The CalWORKs caseload is approximately 530,000 cases, which equates to about 1.2 million Californians. Approximately 270,000 of these cases are eligible for welfare-to-work programs.<sup>21</sup>

## **2.4 About the Data**

This section provides detail about the program data included in the report, as well as an overview of the statewide estimates included for benchmarking purposes. Methodological details for and caveats to the use of the latter are included in Chapter 3.

The source of participant earnings data is the Unemployment Insurance base wage file prepared by the Tax Branch of the Employment Development Department. The file contains

---

<sup>19</sup> Employment Development Department. Fact Sheet: Trade Adjustment Assistance.

<sup>20</sup> California Department of Social Services. [California Work Opportunity and Responsibility to Kids \(CalWORKs\)](#).

<sup>21</sup> CWDB, Unified State Plan for Program Years 2016-2019.

employer-provided earnings data that is collected and maintained in order to process unemployment benefit claims.

The use of the UI base wage file as the source of participant earnings data means that reported earnings are subject to certain limitations:

- UI base wage data is provided by employers who participate in the Unemployment Insurance program.
- Self-employment, informal employment (e.g. day labor), and gig-type employment are excluded.
- The employer-provided earnings data in the UI base wage file cannot be validated in circumstances other than a claim being filed. This means that earnings data provided relies fully on employer reporting for accuracy.<sup>22</sup>
- Earnings data from the UI base wage file was also used as the basis for deriving participant employment outcomes. A participant who received any reported earnings within a designated period is considered, for UI purposes, to have been employed during that period. This means that employment outcomes in this report are unable to make distinctions between full versus under-employment.<sup>23</sup>
- In the present report, participants were matched with wage data on the basis of SSN. However, in the following year's report, EDD TAX will also provide participant name data. This will provide an additional level of validation, ensuring that participants are accurately matched with their earnings data.
- Appendix B provides detail on the methodology utilized for wage-matching in the report.

In order to provide the industry sector in which a given program participant was employed, EDD's Labor Market Information Department (LMID) matches employer information from the UI base wage file with employer address and industry sector code information.

Employer-provided wage data in the UI base wage file also forms the basis of the resource used in the report as a statewide estimate of average earnings within industry sectors, the Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW). Greater detail on QCEW methodology and associated caveats, as well as its use as a comparator in the present report, can be found in Chapter 3.

Participant racial and ethnic data was provided by program partners, based upon participant self-reporting. Detail on racial and ethnic reporting systems can be found in the report's Appendix.

---

<sup>22</sup> For further information including the guidance issued by EDD Tax to employers, see the [2022 California Employer's Guide](#).

<sup>23</sup> "Underemployment" is typically defined to refer to various forms of worker under-utilization resulting in economic insecurity in spite of employment, such as involuntary part-time employment; very low earnings; or other forms of labor market distress.

In this report, statewide estimates generated by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) are provided to allow for comparison with recorded program outcome data. BLS estimates for statewide working age population, labor force population, and median quarterly earnings by participant demographics, region, and sector of employment are given in Chapter 3 to provide a basis against which performance outcomes of the workforce development programs included in this report can be considered.

## **2.5      Reported Outcomes**

For each of the 11 programs featured in the final report, five participant outcomes are reported.

These outcomes were selected as a common set of indicators for purposes of consistency. Their selection is also based upon performance accountability indicators established by WIOA.<sup>24</sup>

Descriptions of each outcome are provided below, with greater methodological detail and full caveats to their reporting provided in Appendix C.

- Credential Attainment - Percentage of participants enrolled in an education or training program (excluding on the job training and customized training) who attained a recognized postsecondary credential or a secondary school diploma, or its recognized equivalent, during participation in or within one year after exit from the program
- Employment Rate – Second Quarter After Exit - Percentage of program participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from the program.
- Employment Rate – Fourth Quarter After Exit - Percentage of program participants in unsubsidized employment during the fourth quarter after exit from the program
- Median Earnings – Second Quarter After Exit - Median earnings of program participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the second quarter after exit from the program, as established through UI wage record match.
- Median Earnings – Fourth Quarter After Exit - Median earnings of program participants who are in unsubsidized employment during the fourth quarter after exit from program, as established through UI wage record match.

### **2.5.1      Data Comparisons with Benchmarks**

Throughout the report, participant enrollments by demographic category are compared with the estimated shares of the state’s labor force population using data from a national survey.<sup>25</sup>

---

<sup>24</sup> For a complete listing of WIOA performance accountability indicators and their descriptions, see: United States Department of Labor, Employment and Training Administration. [“WIOA Performance Indicators and Specific Performance Measures.”](#)

<sup>25</sup> For one program in this report, Vocational Rehabilitation offered under WIOA Title IV, shares of the state population with a disability have been utilized in preference to labor force shares.

A caveat concerns the use of percentage points to perform both types of comparison above. Percentage points make it possible to compare different statistics with each other. A percentage point difference is found by subtracting one percentage from the other.

While percentage points thus make it possible to show whether two percentages (say, the training completion share for Asian participants with Asian participants' program enrollments) are different from each other, attempting to infer differences in magnitude from percentage point comparisons may be misleading. This is most evident when looking at percentage point differences between small percentages: if a group accounts for 0.5% of a program's participants but only 0.1% of its training completions, then its share of all participants is five times as large as its training completion share. This is true even though the difference in percentage point terms may appear small (-0.4 percentage point).

To the extent possible, care has been taken throughout the report to raise and account for such issues.

### **2.5.2 Outputs**

The outputs identified below are reported by program and for the state workforce development system (adult participants only). If the data required to calculate an output was not provided by a participating program, the CWDB did not calculate the output for that program.

To provide an example: the WIOA Title III Wagner-Peyser program is a system of employment related labor exchange services such as job search assistance, job referral, and placement assistance and as such does not provide training services to participants and is not held to the credential attainment performance indicator.

Program Participation - The total number of participants in the program / system within the measured fiscal year(s), by:

- a. Participant Ethnicity
- b. Participant Race
- c. Participant Ethnicity / Race
- d. Participant Sex / Gender
- e. Participant Age Group at Entry
- f. Participant Veteran Status

Training Completion – The total number of participants to complete training within the measured fiscal year(s), by:

- a. Participant Ethnicity
- b. Participant Race
- c. Participant Ethnicity / Race
- d. Participant Sex / Gender
- e. Participant Age Group at Entry
- f. Participant Veteran Status

- g. Regional Planning Unit of Provider
- h. Training Service Status at Exit

**Credential Attainment Rate** – The percentage of participants to attain a recognized credential in or within 4 quarters after program / system exit, by:

- a. Participant Ethnicity
- b. Participant Race
- c. Participant Ethnicity / Race
- d. Participant Sex / Gender
- e. Participant Age Group at Entry
- f. Participant Veteran Status
- g. Regional Planning Unit of Provider
- h. Participation Status at Exit
- i. Training Service Status at Exit
- j. Training Completion Status
- k. Type of Recognized Credential

**2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter Employment Rate** – The percentage of participants employed in the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter after program / system exit, by:

- a. Participant Ethnicity
- b. Participant Race
- c. Participant Ethnicity / Race
- d. Participant Sex / Gender
- e. Participant Age Group at Entry
- f. Participant Veteran Status
- g. Regional Planning Unit of Provider
- h. Participation Status at Exit
- i. Training Service Status at Exit
- j. Training Completion Status
- k. Type of Recognized Credential
- l. Industry / Sector of Employment

**4<sup>th</sup> Quarter Employment Rate** – The percentage of participants employed in the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter after program / system exit, by:

- a) Participant Ethnicity
- b) Participant Race
- c) Participant Ethnicity / Race
- d) Participant Sex / Gender
- e) Participant Age Group at Entry
- f) Participant Veteran Status
- g) Regional Planning Unit of Provider
- h) Participation Status at Exit
- i) Training Service Status at Exit
- j) Training Completion Status

- k) Type of Recognized Credential
- l) Industry / Sector of Employment

2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter Median Earnings – The median earnings of participants in the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter after program / system exit, by:

- a) Participant Ethnicity
- b) Participant Race
- c) Participant Ethnicity / Race
- d) Participant Sex / Gender
- e) Participant Age Group at Entry
- f) Participant Veteran Status
- g) Regional Planning Unit of Provider
- h) Participation Status at Exit
- i) Training Service Status at Exit
- j) Training Completion Status
- k) Type of Recognized Credential
- l) Industry / Sector of Employment

4<sup>th</sup> Quarter Median Earnings – The median earnings of participants in the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter after program / system exit, by:

- a. Participant Ethnicity
- b. Participant Race
- c. Participant Ethnicity / Race
- d. Participant Sex / Gender
- e. Participant Age Group at Entry
- f. Participant Veteran Status
- g. Regional Planning Unit of Provider
- h. Participation Status at Exit
- i. Training Service Status at Exit
- j. Training Completion Status
- k. Type of Recognized Credential
- l. Industry / Sector of Employment

Quarterly Earnings – The earnings of participants in the 2<sup>nd</sup> and the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter after program / system exit, including:

- a. Minimum Earnings
- b. Lower Quartile
- c. Median Earnings
- d. Upper Quartile
- e. Maximum Earnings

Program Performance – The overall performance of the program based on the following performance accountability indicators:

- a. Program Participation - The total number of participants in the program within the measured fiscal year(s).
- b. Program Exit - The total number of participants to exit the program within the measured fiscal year(s).
- c. Training Completion – The total number of participants to complete training within the measured fiscal year(s).
- d. Credential Attainment – The percentage of participants to attain a recognized credential in or with 4 quarters after program exit.
- e. 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter Employment Rate - The percentage of adult participants employed 2 quarters after program exit.
- f. 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter Education and Employment Rate - The percentage of youth participants employed or receiving workforce education or training, 2 quarters after program exit.
- g. 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter Employment Rate - The percentage of adult participants employed 4 quarters after program exit.
- h. 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter Education and Employment Rate - The percentage of youth participants employed or receiving workforce education and training, 4 quarters after program exit.
- i. 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter Median Earnings - The median earnings of participants 2 quarters after program exit.
- j. 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter Median Earnings - The median earnings of participants 4 quarters after program exit.

Appendix E provides an index for the reported outputs.

### 2.5.3 Reading the Data Tables

This section provides a guide to reading and interpreting data tables that will be presented in the body of the report.

Throughout the report, table title, row, and column headers are utilized with consistency across the different programs covered, to enable clear readability and comparison.

Table examples are provided and described below.

#### 2.5.3.1 Participant Data Tables

FY 2014-2015 1											
Participant Sex / Gender 3	# Served 4	# Exited 5	# Completed Training 6	2 Quarters After Exit 2			4 Quarters After Exit				
				# Employed 7	% Employed 8	Median Earnings 9	# Attained Credential 10	% Attained Credential 11	# Employed 12	% Employed 13	Median Earnings 14
Male											
Female											
Unknown or Not Provided											
<b>TOTAL</b>											

1. The fiscal year that applies to the outcome data reported.

2. The calendar quarter that applies to the outcome data reported.
3. The variable applied to the outcome data reported.
4. The number of participants in the program within the measured fiscal year.
5. The number of participants to exit the program within the measured fiscal year.
6. The number of participants to complete training within the measured fiscal year.
7. The number of participants earning wages, from a covered employer, within 2 quarters after exiting the program.
8. The percent of participants earning wages, from a covered employer, within 2 quarters after exiting the program.
9. The median earnings of participants earning wages, from a covered employer, within 2 quarters after exiting the program.
10. The number of participants to attain a recognized credential in or within 4 quarters after program exit.
11. The percent of participants to attain a recognized credential in or within 4 quarters after program exit.
12. The number of participants earning wages, from a covered employer, within 4 quarters after exiting the program.
13. The percent of participants earning wages, from a covered employer, within 4 quarters after exiting the program.
14. The median earnings of participants earning wages, from a covered employer, within 4 quarters after exiting the program.

## 2.6 Limitations

While this report adheres to the requirements of CUI Section 14013(i) as amended by AB 2148 and AB 1336, the findings of this report are limited in their ability to measure the impact of programs due to several factors:

- Employment and wage outcomes do not represent a complete assessment of a program's efficacy. The labor market outcomes of individuals participating in and exiting the programs covered in this report may be attributable to a range of external factors unrelated to a program's content or quality.
- Data presented in this report indicate how a participant fared in the labor market at discrete time periods after program exit and do not capture longer-term outcomes.
- The processes used to collect participant data varied by program, resulting in some inconsistencies in the types of data reported across programs (for example, race/ethnicity data collection). This particular challenge is discussed further in Section III (Chapter 3).

As previously noted, AB 1336 imposed the additional requirement that, in preparing the annual workforce metrics report, *"[state] board shall determine the approach for measuring labor market impacts, provided that, to the extent feasible, the board uses statistically rigorous methodologies to estimate, assess, and isolate the impact of programs on participant outcomes."*

- The present report does not represent an attempt to statistically isolate labor market impacts of individual programs. The State Board is currently working with partners to secure access to the means for statistically rigorous methodology that will enable isolation and assessment of individual program impacts upon participants' labor market outcomes.
- Given the limitations described above, this report should not be viewed as an apples-to-apples comparison of programs and should not be used to assess the state's return on investment in these programs. Rather, this report is designed to provide policymakers, program managers, and other stakeholders with a general overview of program outcomes.