

Appendices

A. CAAL-Skills Workforce Metrics Dashboard Methodology and Process

The 2021 CAAL-Skills Workforce Metrics Dashboard Report is the first Workforce Metrics Report to be prepared using data from the CAAL-Skills System. The process and results are summarized below:

- Beginning in January 2018, the CAAL-Skills technical team securely received FY 14-15 and FY 15-16 program data from data-sharing partners.
- Program data was linked with earning and employment data residing in the EDD's base wage file and securely provided back to the CAAL-Skills technical team.
- Data was cleansed and coded by CAAL-Skills data architects.
- Data tables displaying descriptive statistics for program enrollment, exit, completion, and outcomes were produced.
- Partner approval was sought and obtained for data tables and narratives in an iterative process.

B. Program-by-Program Participant & Eligibility Information

California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title I Program - Adults

Participant Definition – An individual who has received services under the WIOA Title I Adult program within the reported fiscal years.

Eligibility Criteria & Participant Characteristics – Under WIOA Title I, “adults” are individuals age 18 and over. The adult funding stream includes a priority of service for public assistance recipients and other low-income individuals, as well as individuals who are basic skills deficient, for receipt of career and training services.

Exit Definition – If the participant has not scheduled services for 90 days, the participant is considered exited.

Exit Date – If the participant has not scheduled services for 90 days, the participant is considered exited. The date recorded is back dated 90 days, to the last date of service. Program exit dates are system generated, unless the exit is an “exclusionary exit” (“hard” exit). The exit date for “exclusionary exits” are created by EDD staff. Hard or exclusionary exit is manually entered by staff if the individual meets one of a number of specified categories,¹ and is expected to meet the category for at least 90 days. Its purpose is to remove (“exclude”) the individual from the denominator used to measure program performance, based on

¹ Reasons include: because the participant was institutionalized; left for personal or family member medical reasons; was called to active duty; or became deceased. For youth participants, reasons also include movement from the area in the context of being a foster youth or in another mandated program.

determination that the individual left the program due to circumstances beyond their control and/or the control of the program.

Training Completion Definition – Program completion means completion of training services. Note that completion is reported only for those Title I participants who were enrolled in training services during the fiscal year in question; “completion” does not pertain to, and is not reported for, receipt of career services.²

California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title I Program – Dislocated Workers

Participant Definition – An individual who has received services under the WIOA Title I Dislocated Worker program within the reported fiscal years.

Eligibility Criteria & Participant Characteristics – As noted above, the Dislocated Worker program is designed to provide quality employment and training services to individuals who have been terminated from their last employment and are unlikely to return to their previous industry or occupation. Displaced homemakers, self-employed individuals, and the spouse of a member of the Armed Forces on active duty may also qualify for dislocated worker services.³

Exit Definition – If the participant has not scheduled services for 90 days, the participant is considered exited. The date recorded is back dated 90 days.

Exit Date – If the participant has not been scheduled services for 90 days, the participant is considered exited. The date recorded is back dated 90 days. Program exit dates are system generated, unless the exit is an “exclusionary exit” (“hard” exit). The exit date for “exclusionary exits” are created by EDD staff. Hard or exclusionary exit is manually entered by staff if the individual meets one of the following categories and is expected to meet the category for at least 90 days. Its purpose is to remove (“exclude”) the individual from the denominator used to measure program performance, based on determination that the individual left the program due to circumstances beyond their control and/or the control of the program.⁴

Training Completion Definition – Training completion means completion of training services. Note that completion is reported only for those Title I participants who were enrolled in training services during the fiscal year in question; “completion” does not pertain to, and is not reported for, participants who were enrolled in career services only⁵.

² Supportive services can, under both WIA and WIOA, only be received as an adjunct to either career or training services.

³ [Ibid.](#)

⁴ Reasons include: because the participant was institutionalized; left for personal or family member medical reasons; was called to active duty; or became deceased. For youth participants, reasons also include movement from the area in the context of being a foster youth or in another mandated program.

⁵ Supportive services can, under both WIA and WIOA, only be received as an adjunct to either career or training services.

California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title I Program – Youth

Participant eligibility – WIOA delineates two distinct types of eligibility criteria for two different types of program participants: out of school (OS) and in-school (IS) youth. Recognizing that OS youth tend to face more significant barriers to upward mobility than do IS youth, the law requires that the bulk of local funding and services (75%) be directed to out-of-school youth.⁶

Data show that individuals who drop out before attaining a high school degree have lower earnings, and are at a higher risk of becoming unemployed.⁷ Dropping out of school is also a risk factor for becoming disconnected from both the education system and the workforce over the long-term, suggesting that once a young person has quit high school, it may be difficult for them to return to the educational system.⁸

⁶ In California, WSD 17-07 (and relevant federal guidance) define this population as follows: *Not Attending School* – an individual who is not attending a secondary or postsecondary school. In addition, individuals enrolled in the following programs would be considered an OS youth for eligibility purposes: WIOA Title II Adult Education, YouthBuild, Job Corps, high school equivalency program, or dropout re-engagement programs. A youth attending a high school equivalency program funded by the public K-12 school system who is classified by the school system as still enrolled in school are the exception; the youth would be considered an IS youth (Title 20 CFR Section 681.230).

⁷ [Data compiled by the Bureau of Labor Statistics](#) show that, in the third quarter of 2019, median weekly earnings of full-time workers age 25 and older without a high school diploma were just \$606, 62% of median earnings of all full-time workers 25 and older (\$975). Data on change in unemployment since 2010 compiled by the California Employment Development Department and included in the [CWDB's 2020-2023 State Plan](#) (p. 22) show that, despite marked decreases in unemployment rates for individuals at all educational attainment levels during the recovery from the 2008-2009 economic downturn, the rate of unemployment among individuals in the labor force 16 and older without a high school degree consistently exceeded the rate among all other educational levels.

⁸ See the most recent four-year adjusted cohort data on high school graduation rates from the California Department of Education, available [here](#). It should be noted that national data from recent years suggest that dropout rates among both Hispanic and Black high-schoolers have been steadily falling (see: John Gramlich [September 29, 2017] [“Hispanic dropout rate hits new low, college enrollment at new high,”](#) Pew Research Center; Richard Fry [October 2, 2014] [“U.S. high school dropout rate reaches record low, driven by improvements among Hispanics, blacks,”](#) Pew Research Center). The likelihood of dropping out or becoming a “disconnected youth” is directly related to economic barriers. Because of systematic inequalities in economic opportunity by race and ethnicity (which include stratification of wealth, income, home ownership, and access to high-quality schools), graduation rates among Black, American Indian, and Hispanic students are higher than those among Asian students and non-Hispanic White students. Research suggests that much of this discrepancy stems from inequalities in income, wealth, and access to high quality education. Factors linked to parental socioeconomic status—such as family poverty and welfare receipt and low parental education—also impact a young person’s chances of becoming a disconnected youth. Because wealth, income, poverty rates, as well as access to quality schools, are all stratified by race—with Black, Hispanic, and Native American Californians experiencing higher poverty rates than their white non-Hispanic peers—economic sources of inequality perpetuate and reproduce inequities of educational access and outcomes. See, for example, findings of the California Lifting Children and Families Out of Poverty Task Force (AB 1520) Report (November, 2018).

Recognizing these challenges, WIOA prioritizes funding and services for out of school youth who are deemed eligible for program participation if they meet the following eligibility criteria:

- Not attending any secondary or postsecondary school (not including Title II Adult Education, YouthBuild, Job Corps, high school equivalency programs [exceptions in definitions], non-credit bearing postsecondary classes, dropout reengagement programs "start bold and italics" or charter schools with federal and state workforce partnerships).
- Age 16-24 years old.
- And, experience one or more of the following barriers:
 - A school dropout.
 - A youth who is within the age of compulsory school attendance, but has not attended school for at least the most recent complete school year quarter.
 - A recipient of a secondary school diploma or its recognized equivalent who is a low-income individual, is either basic skills deficient or an English language learner.
 - An offender.
 - A homeless individual or a runaway.
 - An individual in foster care or who has aged out of the foster care system or who has attained 16 years of age and left foster care for kinship guardianship or adoption, a child eligible for assistance under Section 477 of the *Social Security Act*, or in an out-of-home placement.
 - An individual who is pregnant or parenting (custodial and non-custodial parent including non-custodial fathers).
 - An individual with a disability.
 - A low-income individual who requires additional assistance to enter or complete an educational program or to secure or hold employment.

While WIOA reserves 75 percent of youth program funds for out-of-school youth, twenty-five percent may be used to serve youth who are still in school but who also may require additional support to complete their education.⁹

In order to receive services as an In-School youth, an individual must meet the following eligibility criteria:¹⁰

⁹ In-school youth are individuals who are enrolled in secondary or postsecondary school. If a youth is between high school graduation and postsecondary education, the youth is considered an In-School (IS) youth if they are registered for postsecondary education, even if they have not yet begun postsecondary classes. However, if the youth registers for postsecondary education, but does not follow through with attending classes, the youth is considered Out-of-School (OS) youth if the eligibility determination is made after youth decided not to attend postsecondary education. Youth on summer break are considered IS youth if they are enrolled to continue school in the fall (TEGL 21-16). [WSD 17-07](#). The same directive also provides further detail on the definition of this population. See also TEGL 21-16.

¹⁰ A youth participant's eligibility is determined at intake, meaning that the youth remains eligible for youth services until exited (i.e.—there is no "aging out" of service eligibility, once a course of services has begun). For example, an individual who is an IS youth and between the ages of 14-21 at the time of enrollment, and is now beyond the age of 21, is still considered an IS youth until exited. This also applies to eligibility as IS versus OS: for

- Attending school, including secondary and postsecondary school.
- Age 14-21 years old (A youth with disabilities who is in an individualized education program at the age of 22 may be enrolled as an IS youth [TEGL 21-16 and EC 56026]).
- Low-income individual.¹¹
- And, meets one or more of the following barriers:
 - Basic skills deficient.
 - An English language learner.
 - An offender.
 - A homeless individual or runaway.
 - An individual in foster care or who has aged out of the foster care system or who has attained 16 years of age and left foster care for kinship guardianship or adoption, a child eligible for assistance under Section 477 of the Social Security Act, or in an out-of-home placement.
 - Pregnant or parenting (custodial and non-custodial parent including non-custodial fathers).
 - An individual with a disability.
 - An individual who requires additional assistance to complete an educational program or secure and hold employment.

Here it is important to note broad differences between in-school and out-of-school youth populations in terms of their expected trajectories through the WIOA Youth program and into continuing education and the labor market.

By definition, in-school youth are school-age individuals engaged in completing their secondary education. These are younger individuals enrolled in secondary school. They are not adults who are either on the job market, employed, or out of work. Indeed, individuals in the youngest part of the age range (14-15) for program participants are too young to legally work full-time. This is important when considering employment outcomes in the data tables that follow.

OS youth, in contrast, represent a group of individuals who are older (16-24) and who have become disconnected from school. These individuals may be more likely than IS youth to be living on their own, and many not have access to resources from parents who provide for them while they attend school or training. In addition, their non-completion of secondary education

example, an individual who is an IS youth and between the ages of 14-21 at the time of enrollment, and is now beyond the age of 21, is still considered an IS youth until exited. A youth participant's eligibility is determined at intake. Therefore, the youth remains eligible for youth services until exited. For example, an individual who is an OS youth at time of enrollment and is subsequently placed in school is still considered an OS youth. Additionally, an individual who is an OS youth and between the ages of 16-24 at the time of enrollment, and is now beyond the age of 24, is still considered an OS youth until exited.¹⁰ The fact that status as in-school or out-of-school is permanent as determined at entry, is based on recognition of the fact that the two eligibility categories represent two distinct populations with differing barriers and service needs.

¹¹ See [WSD 17-07](#) for definitions and further details concerning categories of eligibility.

means that out of school youth may be more likely to require basic skills training or other forms of preparation that would enable them to participate in the kind of occupational skills training or career educational programs that their in-school peers may be able to enter immediately.

In the present report, outcome data for Youth program participants reflects outcomes for both IS and OS youth. Given the differences in these populations, one should interpret the findings with care. This is particularly true when interpreting changes in program outcomes over the course of the transition from WIA (FY 14-15) to WIOA (FY 15-16). For instance: changes in outcomes from FY 14-15 to FY 15-16 either in the aggregate or for particular participant groups could be shaped by changes in the composition of participant populations served rather than changes in the efficacy of services received. This is especially true given that OS youth, who often face greater challenges in the education system and the labor market, make up a far greater share of the population served under WIOA than they did under WIA. Future dashboard reports will address these matters by disaggregating and displaying outcome data for both groups.

Programmatic and Data Implications of the Transition to WIOA in 2015

The first year of formal enrollment under WIOA began in July 2016.

After July 1, 2015, Youth program participant eligibility was determined as follows:

- After July 1, 2015, all Workforce Investment Act (WIA) youth participants who were already enrolled in the WIA youth program were grandfathered into the WIOA youth program, even if they would not have met WIOA eligibility criteria, and without any additional action on the part of the Local Board. These individuals were allowed to complete WIA services specified in their individual service strategy.
- Youth who were enrolled later than July 1, 2015, were subject to WIOA eligibility rules and served exclusively under WIOA service categories.
- To give an example: in the data in this chapter, participants appear as served under the training category, “other basic skills training” in both FY 14-15 and FY 15-16. Other basic skills training was exclusively a WIA service category, so why do participants continue to appear in this category under WIOA? They appear in the data because of continuing enrollment of WIA enrollees who were allowed to continue the program under original service categories.¹²

¹² Eligibility rules under WIA were the more restrictive, because participant eligibility for school-attending and out-of-school youth were addressed in the same context. “Out of school” was merely one of a number of conditions that might grant an applicant eligibility to participate in the program—alongside other conditions (homelessness, basic skills deficiency, etc.)¹² The age range for all eligible Youth program participants in WIA was capped at 21. This means that it is unlikely to find a case in which an individual who would have been eligible to be served under WIA would not also have been eligible under WIOA, at the level of individual characteristics. Because WIOA expanded age eligibility for OS youth, it is definitely the case that some individuals who would not have been eligible under WIA due to their age became eligible under WIOA. However, at the aggregate level, WIOA (as discussed) definitely did impact eligibility for school-attending youth, in the sense that the share of funding dedicated to these participants (and thus, the capacity to serve them) dropped. As clarified, this was an intentional element of WIOA changes, based in the need to prioritize serving the hardest-to-serve: OS youth. Therefore, although on-paper eligibility rules for school-attending youth did not change under WIOA, the shift in funding

Participant Definition – A WIOA Title I Youth participant is an individual that has at least one career, training, or supportive service reported under the WIOA Title I Youth funding stream.

Eligibility Criteria & Participant Characteristics – Eligible youth must be 14 to 24 years of age¹³ and face one or more specified barriers to employment as discussed in the preceding pages.

Exit Definition – If the participant has not scheduled services for 90 days, the participant is considered exited. The exit date recorded is backdated 90 days.

Exit Date – If the participant has not scheduled services for 90 days, the participant is considered exited. The exit date recorded is backdated after 90 days has lapsed since the receipt of the last service. Program exit dates are system generated, unless the exit is an “exclusionary exit” which means the participant could no longer receive services because they were institutionalized, left the program for personal or family member medical reasons, were called to active military duty, became deceased, or were moved out of the Local Workforce Development Area due to their enrolment in foster care or some other mandated government program.

Training Completion Definition – Directly collected by the program, pertaining to those Title I participants enrolled in training services.

Training Completion Date – Date completed training (if applicable).

allocation likely meant that some school-attending youth enrolled under WIA may not have been eligible for services in their Local Area under WIA, because their level of demonstrated need was lesser compared with that of other applicants. For eligibility rules under WIA, please see the Employment Development Department’s [WIA Eligibility Technical Assistance Guide \(TAG\)](#), which was aimed at Local Boards and contains the most detailed information. Youth eligibility information begins on page 25. Also see [Workforce Services Directive 14-4](#), September 25, 2014 which references the guide.

¹³ These are age criteria that apply to the WIOA youth definition. Under WIA, eligibility for all Title I Youth recipients was capped at age 21. WIOA introduced a new targeting of out-of-school (disconnected) youth, whom the legislation defines as individuals between the ages of 16 and 24 who are not attending any school as defined by state law, and meet at least one of the following criteria: dropped out of school; is within compulsory school age but did not attend during the previous school year; has obtained a secondary school diploma or equivalent but is low income and basic skills deficient or an English language learner; is in the juvenile or adult justice systems; is homeless, a runaway, or either in or aged out of foster care; is pregnant or parenting; is an individual with a disability; and/or is low-income and “requires additional assistance to enter or complete an educational program or to secure or hold employment” In-school youth are low-income individuals aged 14-21 who are attending school and meet at least one of these criteria: is basic skills deficient; is an English language learner; is homeless, a runaway, or either in or aged out of foster care; is pregnant or parenting; is an individual with a disability; and/or “requires additional assistance to complete an education program or secure and hold employment” (<https://youth.workforcegps.org/resources/2017/08/29/08/48/FactSheet>).

California Department of Education (CDE) – Adult Education and Family Literacy Act (WIOA Title II) Program

Participant Definition – An individual is eligible for enrollment in an AEFLA program if they meet the following criteria:

- (1) Is at least 16 years of age;
- (2) Is beyond the age of compulsory school attendance under the law of the State or outlying area;
- (3) Does not have a secondary school diploma or its recognized equivalent; and
- (4) Is not enrolled in secondary school.¹⁴

Participant Characteristics – WIOA Title II serves Limited English Proficient (LEP) individuals, a majority of whom are immigrants. The Integrated English Literacy and Civics Education (EL/Civics) program under WIOA Title II assists immigrants with preparation for citizenship and full participation for civic life in their community. It also encourages partnership with employers and provides funding for innovative solutions such as Integrated Education and Training programs, and paves the way for training both at the workplace and during work hours.

According to CDE’s adult education annual performance report for Program Year 2015-2016, More than 3.5 million California adults “do not speak English well or not at all.” More than one-fourth of the national non-English speaking population resides in California, and more than 2.3 million of that group lack a high school credential.¹⁵

In 2015–16, 195 local agencies enrolled 448,498 learners in the AEFLA programs. Of these learners 308,288 (69 percent) qualified for NRS federal reporting. Adult learners who qualified for NRS federal reporting reflect the diversity of the state. The largest ethnic groups of learners are Hispanic (64.4 percent) and Asian (15.7 percent). Adult learners are more likely to be female (55.1 percent), and adult learners between the ages of twenty-five and forty-four (50.0 percent) comprise the largest age group.

Eligibility Criteria – Adult education is a public education program for all adults aged 16 and older. Title II funds serve people with barriers to employment, including English language learners, low-income individuals, and immigrants.

Exit Definition – Prior to PY 16-17, exit from the WIOA Title II program was not uniformly tracked. This was left to the discretion of the local agencies, where each local agency adopted its own approach. By October 1, 2016, CDE adopted the federal rule for program exit, applying this rule across local agencies. The federal definition of program exit is a participant who, in the specified fiscal year, left the WIOA Title II program for at least 90 days.

¹⁴ WIOA Law, Section 201.

¹⁵ California Department of Education. [California Annual Performance Report: Federally Funded Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act, Title II](#), Program Year July 1, 2015 – June 30, 2016; [Statewide Performance Report – WIOA Title II Adult Education Program](#) (PY 2016).

Exit Date – The date a Title II participant exited their program. ¹⁶

Training Completion Definition – CDE began collecting training completion status after the period covered in this report. Consequently, 100% of exiting participants were classified as having received an unknown type of service at the time of exit.

California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title III Program

Participant Definition – An individual who received non-self-service services under Title III during the noted fiscal year.

Eligibility Criteria & Participant Characteristics – Services are available to any jobseeker, regardless of employment status. Veterans receive priority, and disabled veterans receive the highest priority. Reemployment services are available to UI recipients.

Exit Definition – A participant who, in the specified fiscal year, left the WIOA Title III program for at least 90 days.

Exit Date – Date of the last service received.

Training Completion – N/A

California Department of Rehabilitation (DOR) – WIOA Title IV Program Vocational Rehabilitation

Participant Definition – An individual receiving services under DOR Title IV in the specified fiscal year. In the data presented in this report, only adult (18 and older) participants were included.

Eligibility Criteria – Eligibility under WIOA Title IV is determined by results of an individual assessment, as follows:¹⁷

- The individual has been determined to be an individual with a disability.

¹⁶ In Title II reporting in the MIS, a participant who ceases to attend for a period of 90 days or greater will automatically be reported as having exited the program. In program data in this chapter, a participant who ceased to attend a Title II program in one location for a period of less than 90 days but subsequently began and completed a Title II program in another locality, only had the later date reported as date of participant exit. The duration of the Title II program is 365 days. In order to accurately represent the date of a participant's exit as falling in the same fiscal year as their entry, participant dates of exit that were reported as July 1 XX in the data CAAL-Skills received (approximately 129,000 of all participants to exit in FY 14-15 and approximately 194,000 of all participants to exit in FY 15-16) were changed by CAAL-Skills to a date of June 30 XX. This had the effect of capturing these participants' dates of exit within the same fiscal year as their date of program entry and thus more accurately representing the actual timing of participation.

¹⁷ [Rehabilitation Act of 1973, as amended Through P.L. 114-95](#), enacted December 10, 2015.

- The individual requires vocational rehabilitation services to prepare for, secure, retain, advance in, or regain employment that is consistent with the individual's strengths, resources, priorities, concerns, abilities, capabilities, interests, and informed choice.
- The individual is presumed to have a goal of an employment outcome.

Participant Characteristics – Generally, the population provided services through the VR program are individuals with disabilities who are not employed or who are not employed consistent with their potential (also known as “under-employed”). The distinct needs of DOR participants (also referred to as DOR consumers) vary greatly depending upon the individual, disability-related impediment(s) to employment, and the consumer’s employment goal. In collaboration with the DOR Senior Vocational Rehabilitation Counselor-Qualified Rehabilitation Professional (SVRC-QRP), consumers engage in an interactive process to evaluate their individual disability-related functional limitations or needs and identify VR services required to prepare for, secure, retain or regain employment that is consistent with their unique strengths, resources, priorities, concerns, abilities, capabilities, interests, and informed choice.

Pertaining to exits and employments, during the time period of this report, July 1, 2014, through June 30, 2016, the CDOR’s federal oversight agency, the Rehabilitation Services Administration allowed the Department to close cases in sub-minimum wage. Consumers could be closed under the occupation designation of “Homemakers.” Median Wage Earnings will be impacted by the CDOR’s ability to close cases in sub-minimum wage.

Exit Definition – A participant whose case was closed in the specified fiscal year. This definition includes both DOR participants whose cases were closed as a result of having maintained employment for a 90-day period (“closed rehabilitation”) and participants whose cases were closed for other reasons (“closed other”).

DOR participants may participate in the WIOA Title IV program more than once. Therefore, multiple program exit dates may be captured for one participant.

In the workforce metrics dashboard tables, each participant is only represented once. Therefore, participants with multiple second and fourth-quarter outcomes in the same fiscal year (i.e., employed versus unemployed) must be represented as one or the other. In the report, the last known date of program exit in the fiscal year was identified, and second and fourth-quarter outcomes were reported based on that date only.

Training Completion – DOR does not collect training completion data and did not start collecting recognized credential data until FY 17-18. Due to missing or incomplete training completion and credential information, the Completed Training columns are populated with ‘Not Available.’

Community College Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) – Career Technical Education (CTE) Program

Participant Definition – The CCCCCO defines a CTE student as any student in a given academic year who completed at least one higher-level CTE course defined as ‘clearly occupational,’ ‘advanced occupation’ or ‘apprenticeship.’ Examples would include a course in advanced manufacturing; or, a course in public and protective services.

Eligibility Criteria – Eligibility for CTE is program-specific however it is generally contingent upon preparedness in basic skills.

Participant Characteristics – A 2014 assessment determined that in California’s community colleges, about two-thirds of the students who complete a CTE course are of traditional college-age (17–22 years old). A third are older (23–50 years old). As a result, most often enter college with some work experience. Some of these students also already hold a credential, such as an associate’s or bachelor’s degree, third-party or community college certificate, or journey status in a trade. Given the scale of the California community college system, the number of older students being served is significant. Among students who started community college between 2002–2006, well over a quarter of a million (272,008) “non-traditional” students took CTE coursework—accounting for one-sixth (17 percent) of all students who began community college during that time period.¹⁸

Exit Definition – A participant who, in the specified fiscal year, left the CTE program and did not return, transfer, or enroll in a CA community college for at least one (1) year.

Exit Date – The date of participant entry and exit are derived in order to define semester-based entry and exit dates at different community colleges consistently, as well as to take into account the possibility that a single student may enroll in CTE coursework at multiple community colleges. Exit dates were reported according to consistent notation: for Spring semester, the exit date is reported as of May 31st; for the summer term, it is reported as of August 31st; for the fall semester, it is reported as of October 30th; and for winter, date of exit is reported as of January 31st. Both CWDB and the Chancellor’s Office are increasingly sensitive to the fact that many community college students will take non-linear paths to completion and success within CTE that may involve completion of course credits in one period at one institution and resumption of training following a brief departure.¹⁹ In order to take non-linearity of student access and completion into account in data reporting, students departing from a CTE program at one institution for any reason and later resuming CTE at the same or another institution later on only had the exit date associated with departure from the second

¹⁸ Kathy Booth. [The Ones That Got Away: Why Completing a College Degree Is Not the Only Way to Succeed \(wested.org\)](#) September 2014.

¹⁹ Kathy Booth and Peter Bahr (2012) [What’s completion got to do with it?: Using course-taking behavior to understand community college success](#). Berkeley, California: Research and Planning Group for California Community Colleges; Kathy Booth (2015) [“Moving the Needle: Data, Success, and Accountability for Workforce Programs,” California Community Colleges, Task Force on Workforce.](#)”; CWDB [Unified State Plan for 2016-2019](#).

program/institution counted, as long as the period between enrollments was less than one (1) year.

Completion Definition & Date – Training completion is not directly reported by CCCCO but is defined in CCCCO’s own reporting as equivalent to student credential attainment. In this program narrative, a participant who attained a recognized credential within the same fiscal year that they exited the program is reported as having “completed” their program. Participants attaining recognized credentials after the fiscal year of exit but within a one-year window are still counted under the “credential attainment” metric but are not counted as completing a program. This reporting choice ensures that a participant who left CTE training in FY 14-15 but did not attain a credential until FY 15-16, for instance, is not erroneously counted in FY 15-16 completion numbers.

Employment Training Panel (ETP) – Incumbent Worker Training Program

Participant Definition – Individual trainees who participated in paid training through ETP contracts during the specified program years. Participants are enrolled and complete training entirely at the employers’ discretion. Businesses determine their own training needs and select trainees according to those specific needs.

Eligibility Criteria & Participant Characteristics – ETP funds training for currently employed (incumbent) workers and individuals who are unemployed at the start of training. ETP does not administer training; rather it reimburses employers for training costs. In general, to qualify for retraining funds, a company must demonstrate that the jobs to be retrained are threatened by out-of-state competition.

Exit Definition – A participant who dropped or was dropped, or completed training, in the specified fiscal year.

Exit Date – Date of Program Exit is determined as the date the participant stopped accruing billable hours for the training contract they participated in.

In comparison with the V1 Workforce Metrics Dashboard Report, specification of an individual participant’s date of program exit is improved in the present version: in the V.1 report, the date of exit was recorded as the contractually-defined date upon which the entire contract associated with an ETP-contracting employer ended. This date, which is prospectively defined rather than retrospectively reported, is not necessarily equivalent to an individual participant’s date of either completion or program drop and therefore represents an approximation.

In this year’s report, by contrast, participant-specific data was available to report an individual’s date of exit, using one of two measures depending upon completion status: report data utilize *either* the individual participant’s date of training completion (which is given as the date of the end of term within the relevant fiscal year) *or* his/her date of program withdrawal (recorded as “drop date” within the relevant fiscal year).

Individuals who exited without completion represent a heterogeneous group: they include ETP participants who were dropped from the program by their employer, either (1) to allow the employer to send another employee to the program in their place or (2) because the employer no longer wanted the employee to receive training services (due to a change in the employee's role or responsibilities, for instance); they also include participants who (3) were no longer employed by the employer, either because they had left voluntarily or were laid off or fired.

Training Completion Definition and Date – Training completion was reported based upon the date of the end of term in which a participant completed training.²⁰

California Department of Industrial Relations (DIR), Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS) – State Certified Apprenticeship Program

Participant Definition – A program participant is defined as any individual who was enrolled in an apprenticeship program registered with DIR-DAS during the specified program years.²¹

Participant Characteristics – Racial and ethnic minorities increased from 38,160 in 2015 to 45,796 in 2016, comprising 61.5% of all apprentices. During the same period, women's participation in apprenticeship programs increased from 3,810 to 4,683, making up 6.3% all apprentices. DAS continues to work with the CAC's Equal Opportunity in Apprenticeship standing committee to increase the number of women and minorities in apprenticeship.²²

Eligibility Criteria – Per the CA Labor Code, "apprentice" describes a person at least 16 years of age who has entered into a written agreement with an employer or the program sponsor. However, eligibility criteria are program-specific and identified by the program sponsor in individual program standards subject to approval by the chief in accordance with standards set forth in Labor Code Section 3078.5.²³ For example, programs often require that entrants meet minimum educational and other aptitude qualifications that may touch on their ability to physically perform essential functions of the job. Basic math and literacy skills are generally required, and some occupations favor candidates with additional qualifications such as those who have taken shop courses, have some knowledge of mechanical drawing, physics, blueprint reading, drafting, higher mathematics, chemistry, electricity, and/or welding. Other qualifications an apprentice candidate may be required to possess include physical fitness, a good sense of balance, eye-hand coordination, color sense, agility, ability to work at heights, mechanical aptitude, and interpersonal skills.

²⁰ By contrast, dates of actual participant exit were unavailable in data used for V1 of the Workforce Metrics Dashboard Report. The date on which the entire contract ended was utilized instead.

²¹ In addition to apprenticeship programs (which necessarily involve concurrent instructional and on-the-job elements), DAS also oversees various other on-the-job programs (see CA Labor Code Section 3093). Based on the inclusion of participants exiting having received on-the-job training only, it appears possible that some participants in such programs were also included in this chapter's data.

²² [DAS 2016 Annual Report](#)

²³ CALC Section 3077.

Based on the selection method used by the apprenticeship sponsor, additional qualification standards – such as aptitude tests, interviews, school grades, or previous work experience – may be included for qualification.

Exit Definition – A change in participant Agreement Status Code (ASC) made by the program sponsor to indicate that an apprentice has either completed or withdrawn from the program for one of a number of possible reasons.²⁴

Exit Date – Date completed or withdrew from training.

Training Completion Definition – The source of data are program petitions reporting apprentices' completions during the specified fiscal year.

Training Completion Date – The program-reported date on which an apprentice completed all program requirements.²⁵

Withdrawal Definition – A participant was determined to have withdrawn from their apprenticeship program if they exited without completion.

Withdrawal Date – The program-reported date on which a participant withdrew from their program.

²⁴ "Exit" status is determined based on a variety of possible statuses, denoting either completion of or withdrawal from a program. They include: (Completed – trade certificate issued), indicating a participant who both completed all program requirements and successfully passed an exam demonstrating competency in all areas and becoming certified in his/her field; (Cancelled – less than a year under agreement) indicating a participant whose apprenticeship agreement was cancelled due either to non-progress on requirements or for some other reason;; (Cancelled for cause); (Completed – no certificate issued) describes a situation in which a participant completed all requirements associated with his/her program, but did not successfully pass a final exam and therefore did not become certified in his/her field; (Leave granted disability or military); (Automatic cancellation new agreement – a year or more under agreement) and (Automatic cancellation new agreement – less than a year under agreement) respectively describe situations in which a participant's apprenticeship agreement was cancelled administratively, because the same individual became enrolled in a new DAS agreement; (Completed – trade certificate issued electronic) indicates a participant who completed all program requirements and successfully passed an exam demonstrating competency in all areas and becoming certified in his/her field; (Cancelled – less than a year under agreement electronic) describes a participant whose apprenticeship agreement was cancelled due either to non-progress on requirements or for some other reason; (Amended and completed – trade certificate issued) describes a scenario in which the program discretionarily deemed it appropriate to award the participant credits necessary to facilitate that participant's completion. A participant in registered apprenticeship can only be enrolled in one program at a time. It should be noted that: participants who were enrolled prior to FY 14-15, were served one day in FY 14-15, and exited on that day, were not included as participants in FY 14-15. It should also be noted that some (<50) individuals in each year exited and then re-entered. These individuals were included in the "exit" population.

²⁵ Note that date of exit and date of completion or withdrawal were provided as two separate fields.

California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) Program

Eligibility Criteria – U.S. workers who have lost their jobs or have had their hours reduced as a result of foreign trade.

Exit Definition – A participant who, in the specified fiscal year, left the TAA program for at least 90 days.

Exit Date – Exit within the specified fiscal year.

Training Completion Definition – ETP captures training completion data as a date field. Training completion status is not collected, but can be determined based on if a date is recorded.

Training Completion Date – ETP captures training completion data as a date field.

California Department of Social Services (CDSS) – CalWORKS Welfare to Work Program

Participant Definition – Welfare-to-Work participants were counted as “served” if they had 3 out of 4 consecutive months of participation in the Welfare-to-Work program with no federal or state work exemption.

Eligibility Criteria – Specific eligibility requirements include an applicant's citizenship, age, income, resources, assets, and other factors. Generally, services are available to:

- Families that have a child(ren) in the home who has been deprived of parental support or care because of the absence, disability, or death of either parent.
- Families with a child(ren) when both parents are in the home, but the principal earner is unemployed.
- Needy caretaker relatives of a foster child(ren).²⁶

Participant Characteristics – Eligibility for CalWORKs involves, for adults, means-testing via income and asset tests. Approximately 60 percent of participating CalWORKs Welfare to Work clients (Unduplicated Adults on the WTW 25's) are engaged in some form of employment activity, a level that has remained stable for over a decade.²⁷

In the most recent annual report from CDSS, active WTW participants made up approximately 24% of all CalWORKs recipients.²⁸ Between FY 2014 and 2018, 60% of actively participating CalWORKs WTW participants, in turn, were engaged in a form of employment, with the most common form being unsubsidized work.²⁹

²⁶ CDSS. [CalWORKs](#).

²⁷ [CalWORKs Annual Summary \(March 2019\)](#), p. 29.

²⁸ CDSS. [CalWORKs: California Families Working Together](#). Annual Summary, March 2020, p. 4.

²⁹ [CalWORKs Annual Summary \(March 2019\)](#), p. 29.

As noted, participation in the Welfare to Work program is a condition for receipt of benefits through the CalWORKs public assistance program (California’s version of the federal Temporary Aid to Needy Families or TANF program), which delivers cash aid and services to eligible families that have a child(ren) in the home. Eligibility for the program is means-tested, and participants are subject to a lifetime (cumulative) time limit of 48 months.³⁰

Participants may engage in a variety of activities to meet weekly work-time requirements, including employment, job training, educational activities, counseling, and other activities that advance participant educational or career goals.³¹

Welfare-to-Work participants in California are able to participate in a diverse set of activities that include unsubsidized employment, subsidized employment, on-the-job training, WIOA-defined career pathways, adult education, vocational education, employment-related education, and pursuit of higher education through the California Community Colleges.³²

Exit Definition – Program Exit is defined by a recipient no longer participating in Welfare-to-Work. This might be because the program has successfully helped them find employment that increased their earnings to a point that exceeded the program's income eligibility limits, but also might be due to other circumstances unrelated to training completion/employment attainment, such as moving out of state, eligible child aging out/leaving the home or other changes. The date of program exit was provided as the last date on which any member of the Assistance Unit (family unit receiving aid) received a CalWORKs cash grant.³³

Training Completion – Training and educational activities are not available from DSS at this time. Therefore, the Completed Training columns are populated with 'Not Available.'

C. Demographic Characteristics

Ethnicity and Race: Conceptual Overview

While definitions and interpretations of the terms vary, the American Sociological Association broadly defines “race” as *physical differences that groups and cultures consider socially significant*, and “ethnicity” as grounded in *shared culture, such as language, ancestry, practices, and beliefs*.³⁴

³⁰ With enactment of AB 79 (2020), time limits will be extended to 60 months effective May 1, 2022, or when automation is complete in the Statewide Automated Welfare Systems, whichever is later.

³¹ Ibid, p. xvi; Ibid, p. 57; also, see page 63 for a full breakdown and description of the types of education and training with which WTW participants may fulfill work-hour requirements.

³² Ibid; see page 64 for a breakdown of credential attainment from 2011-2018 among CalWORKs participants.

³³ For those participants who were still enrolled in CalWORKs at the time data were provided to CAAL-Skills, date of last service was noted as June 1, 2017 (6-01-2017). CAAL-Skills did not report any participants with this date of last service as having exited. The population of exited participants is used as the denominator to calculate employment rates and median earnings, and CAAL-Skills was concerned that inclusion of still-enrolled CalWORKs participants erroneously in this pool could lead to inaccurate calculations of both employment and particularly (given the income-based eligibility requirements associated with CalWORKs enrollment) of median earnings.

³⁴ American Sociological Association. Topics: “[Race and Ethnicity](#)”.

As has been discussed in Chapter 2 and Chapter 3 of this report, federal guidelines define “ethnicity” or “ethnic origin,” in keeping with the above sociological distinction, as a component of an individual’s identity that is separate from that individual’s racial identity. The same guidelines give preference to the use of a two-question format to establish respondent ethnic and racial identification, with the initial question pertaining only to ethnicity, which is defined to mean Hispanic or Latino origin versus non-Hispanic or Latino origin. The participant is then asked to provide racial identification in a subsequent question.³⁵

For example, a particular individual of Mexican parentage may identify her ethnicity as Latino or Hispanic while identifying racially as white and Native American.

Consistent with Office of Management and Budget guidelines and the definitions above, in the tables and graphs which follow, Race and Ethnicity are presented as separate variables. A different way of understanding this is that participants, as a whole, may be sorted according to both racial and ethnic categories.

Race and Ethnicity: The Case of Hispanic/Latino Identity

According to the United States Census Bureau, *Hispanic origin can be viewed as the heritage, nationality, lineage, or country of birth of the person or the person’s parents or ancestors before arriving in the United States.* The Census description adds that *People who identify as Hispanic, Latino, or Spanish may be any race.*³⁶

Although federal guidelines in OMB Statistical Directive 15 define Hispanic origin as an ethnicity in keeping with the preceding language and recommend collection of race and ethnic responses in two separate questions³⁷, research shows that categories of race and ethnicity are not necessarily viewed as distinctive by respondents themselves.

In particular, recent research has found that racial self-identification among Hispanic or Latino individuals is not always clear-cut. In the 2010 census, 94% of the population overall selected at least one of five OMB-defined racial categories, yet among Latinos, this was true only of 63% of respondents. Thirty-seven percent of this demographic instead wrote in a response (e.g., “Mexican,” “Hispanic,” “Latin American.”)³⁸

³⁵ The same interest in preserving race and ethnicity as separate variables is behind inclusion of language, in the 2010 Census questionnaire, instructing respondents that “For this census, Hispanic origins are not races.”

³⁶ U.S. Census. “[Hispanic Origin](#).”

³⁷ See, U.S. Census. “[Hispanic Origin](#)” which notes that U.S. federal government agencies must adhere to [standards issued by the Office of Management and Budget \(OMB\)](#) which specify that race and Hispanic origin (also known as ethnicity) are two separate and distinct concepts. These standards generally reflect a social definition of race and ethnicity recognized in this country, and they do not conform to any biological, anthropological, or genetic criteria. The standards include two minimum categories for data on ethnicity: “Hispanic or Latino” and “Not Hispanic or Latino.” Persons who report themselves as Hispanic can be of any race.

³⁸ Ana Gonzalez-Barrera and Mark Hugo-Lopez (June 15, 2015). “[Is being Hispanic a matter of race, ethnicity, or both?](#)” Pew Research Center.

And a 2015 survey by the Pew Research Center found that two-thirds of Hispanic/Latino respondents viewed their Hispanic background as a part of their racial background.³⁹

Studies of in-flux individuals' self-identification with racial categories have found, meanwhile, greater levels of variability over time in the racial self-classifications of Hispanic/Latino individuals than in the population at large.⁴⁰

With the above in mind, reporting on individuals' ethnicity separate from their race thus also provides a way to more consistently identify a large, important demographic group in the United States and California—Hispanic or Latino individuals—whose racial identification may vary.

California Employment Development Department-Administered Programs (WIOA Title I Adult, DW, Youth, WIOA Title III, TAA):

Demographic reporting for WIOA programs utilizes the PIRL ([Participant Individual Record Layout](#)) format, which adheres to OMB guidelines about the distinction of race and ethnic categories. In the reporting system utilized for Title I Adult, CalJOBS, information pertaining to an individual's ethnicity (Hispanic versus non-Hispanic origin) is collected in a separate question from the same individual's racial identification. That is: at the point at which demographic information is collected for an individual, that individual has the opportunity to respond to questions about their race separately from their ethnicity—as described above. The same was true of reporting under WIA, which also followed federal guidelines.

In the data file received, responses for Ethnicity and Race were presented for each participant as a string of values in a single column, in which the number of selections for Race (Asian; African-American or Black; Native American or Alaskan Native; Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander) was unlimited. If a participant had identified their ethnicity as Hispanic/Latino, the value "Hispanic" was also included in the string. Thus, for example, a participant identifying as "White" and "Hispanic" would have the two values, White and Hispanic. An individual participant could select an unlimited number of race values.

For some participants, neither race *nor* ethnic identification was provided.

³⁹ Ibid. According to research on census responses, while 94% of the population overall selected at least one of five OMB-defined racial categories, among Latinos this was true only of 63%. 37% of this demographic instead wrote in a response (e.g., "Mexican," "Hispanic," "Latin American").

⁴⁰ See Liebler, C. S. Rastogi, F. Fernandez, J. Noon, and S. Ennis. 2014. "[America's Churning Races: Race and Ethnic Response Changes between Census 2000 and the 2010 Census](#)". Working Paper No. CARRA-WP-2014-09. In their review of the literature, these researchers point to several reasons scholars identify for which Hispanic individuals might fail to also report a separate "race" selection: first, if race is less salient to a respondent's own self-conception than is the ethnic category (c.f., Compton et al. 2012; Rodríguez 2000); second, if a participant does not see their self-identified race category in the list of U.S. racial categories; this is especially likely to occur among participants who are immigrants, who may identify with racial categories (e.g. mulatto or mestizo [c.f. Golash-Boza and Darity 2008]) that do not exist in the U.S. classification scheme.¹⁷ Researchers also point to literature on flux in racial self-identification among immigrants as an effect of assimilation (c.f., Waters 1999).

Note that the above has no impact on separate data collection of race and ethnic information, as has been described above.

Separate breakouts for Ethnicity and Race were derived according to the following logic:

Participant Ethnicity (Table Set 1):

- A participant with a positive value for “Hispanic/Latino” → Hispanic category
- A participant with no positive value for “Hispanic/Latino” **and** a value other than “did not self-identify” → Non-Hispanic
- A participant with a value of “did not self-identify” → Did not Self-Identify

Participant Race (Table Set 2):

- A participant was reported under each one of the five OMB race categories with which they identified.
 - For example, Participant A identified as Asian. She was counted within the “Asian” category.
 - Participant B identified as American Indian and White. He was counted once under American Indian or Alaskan Native and once under White.
- Because a participant could identify with multiple race categories, count totals sum to more than each fiscal year’s total participants. To eliminate confusion, count columns have been hidden from display in Table 2, and percent shares displayed instead. Percent shares are calculated using a numerator that contains all participant selections of a given race category in the noted fiscal year (e.g., in FY 14-15, 12,853 participants were African-American or Black) over the total number of participants in the same fiscal year (57,375).
- Because an individual participant may have selected multiple race categories with which to identify, percent shares shown in Table 2 of participants served, to exit, and to complete, will not sum to 100%.
- The category, “Participant did not self-identify” is comprised of the following:
 - Participants for whom no race or ethnic identification was available
 - Participants who identified only an ethnicity (Hispanic) and did not select any racial identification.

A separate “As-Reported” table has not been created for this, or other EDD-Workforce Services administered programs, as the Race and Ethnicity categories these programs utilize are consistent with OMB categories.

California Department of Education (CDE) – Adult Education and Family Literacy Act (WIOA Title II) Program

CDE data reported a single selection among race and ethnicity options⁴¹:

- American Indian or Alaskan Native
- Asian
- Black or African American
- Hispanic or Latino
- Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander
- Two or More Races⁴²
- White
- Blank (no response)

These values were accommodated to CAAL-Skills reporting as follows:

- American Indian or Alaskan Native
- Asian
- Black or African American
- Hispanic or Latino
- Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander
- More than one Ethnicity/Race
- White
- Participant did not self-identify

California Department of Rehabilitation (DOR) – Vocational Rehabilitation (WIOA Title IV) Program – Adults

In the data CAAL-Skills received, only one selection from among race and ethnicity categories was reported per participant.

⁴¹ In providing a description of data reporting, CDE indicated that participant ethnicity (Hispanic/Latino versus non-Hispanic or Latino) is collected as a separate data element from participant race, consistent with [federal guidelines](#) which define race and ethnicity (Hispanic or non-Hispanic origin) separately. Per these guidelines, Hispanic origin is defined as “the heritage, nationality, lineage, or country of birth of the person or the person’s parents or ancestors before arriving in the United States” with an additional note that, “People who identify as Hispanic, Latino, or Spanish may be any race”. Racial categories are defined by the U.S. Office of Management and Budget in the following manner: **Asian**: “a person having origins in any of the original people of the Far East, Southeast Asia, or the Indian subcontinent including, for example, Cambodia, China, India, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, Pakistan, the Philippine Islands, Thailand, and Vietnam”. **Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander** is defined as, “a person having origins in any of the original peoples of Hawaii, Guam, Samoa, or other Pacific Islands” (Office of Management and Budget – “[Revisions to the Standards for the Classification of Federal Data on Race and Ethnicity](#)”. Federal Register vol. 62, No. 2010, Thursday, October 30, 1997, pp. 58782-58790). However, in data reported to the CAAL-Skills team, ethnicity and race selections were homogenized, with “Two or more races” (inclusive of sections of Hispanic/Latino ethnicity and an additional category or categories) reported as a derived element, which does not allow for further disaggregation of participant multiple selections. Because this element aggregates selections of both racial and ethnic categories, the value was re-termed in this report as “More than one Ethnicity/Race”.

⁴² Reported to CAAL-Skills as a derived element.

Details of reporting categories and their accommodation to CAAL-Skills values are presented below:

- Hispanic or Latino
- American Indian or Alaskan Native
- Other Asian
- Filipino
- Japanese
- Cambodian
- Chinese
- Asian Indian
- Korean
- Laotian
- Vietnamese
- Black or African American
- Guamanian or Chamorro
- Other Pacific Islander
- Samoan
- Hawaiian
- White
- Not Available

The reporting categories above were accommodated to CAAL-Skills values in the following manner:

- DOR values of White, Black, and American Indian or Alaskan Native were reported under the corresponding Office of Management and Budget (OMB)⁴³/CAAL-Skills categories.

The following categories of participant data were collapsed under the relevant OMB master categories (on the basis of federal descriptions of constituent subcategories):

- Collapsed under “Asian”:
 - Filipino
 - Chinese
 - Cambodian
 - Japanese
 - Korean
 - Asian Indian
 - Laotian
 - Vietnamese
 - Other Asian

⁴³ The Office of Management and Budget is an office within the Executive Office of the President of the United States, which evaluates, formulates, and coordinates management procedures and program objectives within and among Federal departments and agencies. OMB’s 1997 standards on race and ethnicity are used by the United States Census. [Information on these standards](#) may be found on the Census Bureau’s internet site.

- In parallel fashion, the following DOR categories were collapsed under “Pacific Islander or Native Hawaiian”:

 - Hawaiian
 - Samoan
 - Guamanian or Chamorro
 - Other Pacific Islander

- CAAL-Skills retained DOR’s classification of any participant responses not corresponding to a known value as “unknown.”
- CAAL-Skills additionally classified participant selections of “Not Available” as “unknown.”
- Finally, the CDOR category of Hispanic was reported as the OMB/ CAAL-Skills value, Hispanic or Latino.
- In the event that a participant provided null responses for *all* available categories, the participant was classified under, “Participant did not self-identify.”

A combined race-ethnicity reporting scheme was employed.

Creating a separate table for participant ethnicity was considered but ultimately rejected due to inconsistencies between treatment of racial and ethnic categories by DOR’s participant demographic reporting system and federal treatment of these categories.⁴⁴

⁴⁴ While the data that CAAL-Skills received included the category of “Hispanic,” the difficulty CAAL-Skills would face in sorting the participant pool by ethnicity lies in accurately constructing a “non-Hispanic or Latino” reference group. Under federal reporting standards, race and ethnicity are treated as distinct elements of an individual’s identity meaning that the ethnic identification of a participant (whether Hispanic/Latino or not Hispanic/Latino) cannot be discerned from their race (Asian, Black/African-American, etc.). Hispanic/Latino could be distinguished as a category of ethnic identification in DOR data, but it could not reliably be compared with anything. With a single choice reported from among ethnic *and* race categories, these categories were effectively treated as equivalent in the data CAAL-Skills received. Such treatment may cause individuals to select categories in a different manner than under a separate reporting scheme. To take a hypothetical participant who identifies racially as White and ethnically as Hispanic: an individual in this setting may have elected to choose only “Hispanic/Latino” as his identifier in lieu of selecting any race category.

Community College Chancellor’s Office (CCCCO) – Career Technical Education (CTE) Program

The CCCC’s system for reporting participants’ ethnic and racial identifications allows both for the reporting of participant Hispanic/Latino or non-Hispanic/Latino status and participant selection in a subsequent question of one or more of 20 racial and ethnic⁴⁵ categories.

Participant Race

Of these 20 racial options, three directly match with OMB categories and could be directly reported. These categories of participant response are:

- Black or African-American; White; and American Indian or Alaskan Native

In three cases, subcategories were collapsed to “roll up” participant racial selections into the larger OMB categories of which they are constituent thus creating larger, meaningful categories with cross-comparability to other programs.

Racial sub-categories were collapsed according to geographic descriptions provided by OMB of the master categories.⁴⁶

Nine categories of participant response were collapsed under Asian:

- Asian Chinese
- Asian Japanese
- Asian Korean
- Asian Laotian
- Asian Cambodian
- Asian Vietnamese
- Filipino
- Asian Indian

⁴⁵ These categories have recently been expanded, effective summer 2019. See the CCCC Data Element Dictionary, [Student Basic Data Elements. SB 38 – STUDENT EXPANDED ETHNICITY](#),

¹⁹ In the Data Elements Dictionary, CCCC itself describes all categories identified in this narrative section with the term, *ethnicity* alone. In presenting the data in this report section, CAAL-Skills has sought to accommodate both the integrity of program reporting, and OMB guidance on usage of the terms, *race* and *ethnicity*, while also presenting participant demographic information in as clear and consistent a manner as possible across programs. It is for this reason that CAAL-Skills has elected to present CTE participants’ category selections other than their initial answer to the Hispanic/Latino question in a table labeled Participant Race. Doing so allows cross-comparability with programs that report participant demographic information in an OMB-adherent manner, while identifying categories using terminology that meets federal standards.

⁴⁶ These categories are defined by OMB in the following manner: **Asian**: “a person having origins in any of the original people of the Far East, Southeast Asia, or the Indian subcontinent including, for example, Cambodia, China, India, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, Pakistan, the Philippine Islands, Thailand, and Vietnam”. **Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander** is defined as, “a person having origins in any of the original peoples of Hawaii, Guam, Samoa, or other Pacific Islands”. Office of Management and Budget – “[Revisions to the Standards for the Classification of Federal Data on Race and Ethnicity](#)”. Federal Register vol. 62, No. 2010, Thursday, October 30, 1997, pp. 58782- 58790.

- Asian Other

As a result of the category collapse, a participant selecting *any one or more than one* of the above eight categories is counted *once* within the Asian racial category.

Four categories of participant response were collapsed under Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander:

- Pacific Islander Guamanian
- Pacific Islander Hawaiian
- Pacific Islander Samoan
- Pacific Islander Other

As a result of the category collapse, a participant selecting *any one or more than one* of the above four categories is counted *once* within the Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander racial category.

Participant Ethnicity

Five categories (below) were treated as “Hispanic/Latino” in CAALSkills reporting. A participant who selected one or more of these categories was categorized as Hispanic/Latino in the Participant Ethnicity table:

- Hispanic
- Mexican, Mexican-American, Chicano
- Central American
- South American
- Hispanic other

All other participants were classified as “not Hispanic/Latino.”

In the Participant Race table, the same five categories were classified as “Other.” A participant who selected only one or more of these categories was placed in the “Unknown or Other” category.⁴⁷

An additional point to note is that the CTE participant population encompasses individuals who were enrolled in the CalWORKS program, and race/ethnic information for these individuals may be recorded using categories from both CCCCO and CDSS (which utilizes OMB classifications in which ethnicity and race are reported as separate elements of an individual’s demographic status and identity).

So as not to double-count individual participants, percent shares of population served are displayed rather than participant counts by race category.

⁴⁷ Among both years’ participants, approximately 28,000 individuals identified with one or more of the Hispanic sub-category options, but not the Hispanic master category. These individuals were treated as Hispanic.

These percent shares use as denominator the actual participant count of total served in each year as a basis on which to state (for example), “The CTE population served was 20% Asian” where the numerator is all individuals selecting “Asian” or an Asian subcategory, and the denominator is total served. This means there should be no inflation of participant count and shares are not affected.

Employment Training Panel (ETP) – Incumbent Worker Training Program

The Employment Training Panel employs a combined race-ethnicity reporting system, which is described below.

For each participant, an identification with *one* of the following was provided:

- White
- Black
- Hispanic
- American Indian
- Asian
- Pacific Islander
- Filipino
- Other, More than One
- No Data

In the ETP program, demographic information, including a participant’s ethnicity or race, is collected and reported by the individual provider/employer, according to/utilizing the categories above. The contracting employer then uploads the training information electronically to ETP.

ETP’s reporting scheme was accommodated to CAAL-Skills values in the following manner:

- ETP values of White, Black, Hispanic, American Indian, and Pacific Islander were reported using the corresponding Office of Management and Budget/CAAL-Skills category labels.
- The ETP categories, Asian and Filipino, were collapsed into a master Asian category in accordance with OMB category descriptions.
- The ETP category of Other, More than One was rendered as **Unknown or More than One Ethnicity/Race**, to most accurately capture ETP contracting employers’ and participants’ use of this category.⁴⁸

⁴⁸ ETP receives data in this category from employers with no opportunity to further disaggregate responses. Because participant demographic information is employer-provided, interpretation of the “Other” category may vary. Because the ETP reporting scheme only allows participant identification in a single category, it is possible that the “Other” category may capture in many cases participants who wish to select more than one racial and/or ethnic identifier. The CAAL-Skills team has therefore labeled this category “Other, More than One” to indicate that the category may be interpreted by individual employers/participants to indicate either the choice of a single racial/ethnic category not presented as an option in the ETP scheme, or the choice to identify with more than one category.

- No Data was reported under Participant did not Self-Identify

A combined race-ethnicity reporting scheme was employed:

- ETP employs a combined-reporting option for racial and ethnic categories (as they are defined by OMB),⁴⁹ including “Hispanic” as one option for self-identification alongside and to the exclusion of racial categories.
- It would be technically possible to create a separate breakout for ETP participants’ ethnicity (Hispanic versus non-Hispanic) using provided data by treating those participants who did not select “Hispanic or Latino” as the non-Hispanic group.

However, there are two problems with this approach:

- Because a participant can only select one named race or ethnic category (White, Black, Hispanic or Latino, etc.), participants may feel forced to choose between providing an ethnic or a racial identification.⁵⁰ This aspect of ETP’s reporting structure makes it difficult to determine whether or not a participant who selects a given racial category also identifies ethnically as Hispanic or Latino. For example, a hypothetical participant who identifies racially as Black or African American and ethnically as Hispanic or Latino would need to select only one of these bases of identification when filling out demographic information for this program. If the individual in this example identified as “Black or African American,” they would be inaccurately categorized as “non-Hispanic” in an ethnic data breakout. ETP’s reporting includes an additional category, “Other or More than One.” However, ETP receives data reported under this category directly, meaning that disaggregation cannot be performed, and it is unknown whether participants are using this category to register selections of an ethnic plus a racial identity (e.g., “White and Hispanic”), or to identify as multi-racial, or both. An inability to determine this makes construction of a reliable “non-Hispanic/Latino” comparison group challenging.

⁴⁹ The Office of Management and Budget defines race categories in the following manner: **Asian:** “a person having origins in any of the original people of the Far East, Southeast Asia, or the Indian subcontinent including, for example, Cambodia, China, India, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, Pakistan, the Philippine Islands, Thailand, and Vietnam”. **Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander** is defined as, “a person having origins in any of the original peoples of Hawaii, Guam, Samoa, or other Pacific Islands”. Office of Management and Budget – [“Revisions to the Standards for the Classification of Federal Data on Race and Ethnicity”](#). Federal Register vol. 62, No. 2010, Thursday, October 30, 1997, pp. 58782-58790,. On the other hand, OMB defines Hispanic or Latino as an ethnic category, specifically: **“Hispanic or Latino.** A person of Cuban, Mexican, Puerto Rican, Cuban, South or Central American, or other Spanish culture or origin, *regardless of race* (emphasis added)” (Ibid p. 58789).

To distinguish conceptually between race and ethnicity, the Sociological Association offers a similar definition, according to which “race” refers to physical differences that groups and cultures consider socially significant, and “ethnicity” is grounded in shared culture, such as language, ancestry, practices, and beliefs (American Sociological Association. Topics: [“Race and Ethnicity”](#)).

⁵⁰ Both federal census guidelines and the American Sociological Society (ASA) define race and ethnicity as distinct elements of an individual’s identity. According to the ASA, “race” refers to *physical differences that groups and cultures consider socially significant*, and “ethnicity” as grounded in *shared culture, such as language, ancestry, practices, and beliefs* (see, American Sociological Association. Topics: [“Race and Ethnicity”](#)).

Survey researchers have found that individuals' selection of racial and ethnic categories may vary according to the manner in which these questions are asked. This has been found to be especially true for individuals of Hispanic or Latino origin.⁵¹

With these considerations in mind, the CAAL-Skills team determined that it was preferable to retain the program's combined reporting methodology in the display of participant data.

⁵¹ See, for example, a Pew Center article "[Census History: Counting Hispanics](#)" (D'Vera Cohn, March 3, 2010) which discusses how small changes to the census "Hispanic" question have altered response rates and patterns. For example: a series of small changes in the wording of this question ahead of the 2010 Census (and 2008 American Community Survey) that included rewording of certain response categories, inclusion of an instruction that for census purposes, "Hispanic origins are not races," and other minor changes produced a -10 percentage point drop in the share of Hispanic/Latino respondents selecting "some other race," altered patterns of "other" Hispanic responses, and induced more U.S. natives to identify as Hispanic, than in the previous American Community Survey. And concerns over under-reporting of Hispanic or Latino individuals caused the U.S. Census Bureau to mull (but ultimately reject) moving to a combined "Ethnicity/Race" format for 2020 (See, "[Seeking better data on Hispanics, Census Bureau may change how it asks about race](#)" Pew Research Center). Also see Liebler, C. S. Rastogi, F. Fernandez, J. Noon, and S. Ennis. 2014. "[America's Churning Races: Race and Ethnic Response Changes between Census 2000 and the 2010 Census](#)". Working Paper No. CARRA-WP-2014-09 for a discussion and literature review concerning reasons for variability in racial identification by Hispanic or Latino individuals. Factors include variability in the level of salience of "race" in a respondent's own self-identity (c.f., Compton et al. 2012; Rodríguez 2000); non-representation of an individual's racial category identification among U.S. categories (c.f. Golash-Boza and Darity 2008); as well as flux in racial self-identification among immigrants as an effect of assimilation (c.f., Waters 1999).

California Department of Industrial Relations (DIR), Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS) – State Certified Apprenticeship Program

The terms “race” and “ethnicity” as used by sociologists typically refer to different elements of an individual’s identity.⁵²

Guidelines provided by the U.S. Office of Management and Budget define five race categories (White; Black or African American; American Indian or Alaska Native; Asian; and Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander).⁵³ Two ethnic categories—Hispanic or Latino or Not Hispanic or Latino—are reported separately by the Census per OMB guidelines. The Census specifies that persons of Hispanic/Latino origin can be of any race⁵⁴.

The Division of Apprenticeship Standards within the Department of Industrial Relations employs a combined reporting system. This system is described below:

The demographic questionnaire portion of DIR-DAS’ apprenticeship agreement form⁵⁵ allows participants to select *one* category from among the following:

- White (not of Hispanic Origin) – A person having origins in any of the original peoples of Europe, North Africa or the Middle East.
- Black (Not of Hispanic Origin) – A person having origins in any of the Black racial groups of Africa.
- Asian or Pacific Islander – A person having origins in any of the original peoples of the Far East, Southeast Asia, the Indian Subcontinent or the Pacific Islands. The area includes, for example, China, Japan, Korea, and Samoa.⁵⁶
- Asian Indian

⁵² For an overview, see the American Sociological Association’s [discussion](#) of the concepts. Sociologists also caution that the origins and use of both concepts is social rather than biological. As such, race and ethnicity are given reality through their sustained social and political use—what in sociology is known as “social construction”. As such, both concepts are inherently malleable and subject to interpretation by individuals and groups. However, at the level of the individual both are considered ascribed characteristics—characteristics that an individual is unable to change or control. The importance of tracking outcomes according to these characteristics lies in sociological findings that show inequality in the distribution of resources and opportunities on the basis of both race and ethnicity.

⁵³ U.S. Census Bureau. Topics – “[Race](#)”.

⁵⁴ U.S. Census Bureau. Topics – “[Hispanic Origin](#)”. Categories of race and ethnicity are not necessarily viewed as distinctive by respondents themselves. Research has found that Hispanic/Latino individuals may be more likely to self-identify exclusively as Hispanic or Latino than with a race category. (See, Ana Gonzalez-Barrera and Mark Hugo-Lopez (June 15, 2015). “[Is being Hispanic a matter of race, ethnicity, or both?](#)” Pew Research Center).

⁵⁵ DIR DAS Apprenticeship Agreement, <https://www.dir.ca.gov/DAS/program/DAS1.pdf>

⁵⁶ In the data reported to CAAL-Skills, some participant selections were reported under DAS’ “Asian or Pacific Islander” category directly, rather than under any constituent category. Because the respective categories of Asian and Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander form two distinct OMB race categories, these participant responses could not be included within either the Asian or the Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander category. They were instead reported directly as “Asian or Pacific Islander”. Inclusion of this category means that both Asian and Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander totals appear artificially smaller than each group’s true total of participants served.

- Asian Bangladeshi
- Asian Chinese
- Asian Cambodian
- Asian Filipino
- Asian Hmong
- Asian Indonesian
- Asian Japanese
- Asian Korean
- Asian Laotian
- Asian Malaysian
- Asian Pakistani
- Asian Sri Lankan
- Asian Taiwanese
- Asian Thai
- Asian Vietnamese
- Native Hawaiian Fijian
- Native Hawaiian Guamanian
- Native Hawaiian Hawaiian
- Native Hawaiian Samoan
- Native Hawaiian Tongan
- American Indian or Alaskan Native - A person having origins in any of the original peoples of North America, and who maintains cultural identification through tribal affiliation or community recognition.
- Hispanic – A person of Mexican, Puerto Rican, Cuban, South Central American, or other Spanish culture or origin, regardless of race.⁵⁷

DIR-DAS' reporting scheme was accommodated to CAAL-Skills values in the following manner:

- The DAS categories, American Indian or Alaskan Native directly correspond to Office of Management and Budget categories and were directly reported.
- DAS categories of White (not of Hispanic Origin) and Black (not of Hispanic Origin) were directly reported.⁵⁸
- Based upon OMB descriptions of master categories and constituent sub-categories, the following sub-categories were collapsed under "Asian" though disaggregate numbers are also reported in the section that follows this one:⁵⁹
 - Asian Indian

⁵⁷ The requirement that DAS collect participating apprentices' demographic information is found in the CA Labor Code Sec. 151.

⁵⁸ While the Office of Management and Budget's 1997 directive makes clear that race and ethnicity are distinct elements of an individual's demographic status (see a [summary](#) on the U.S. Census' site), the fact that DAS reports these race categories with a "non-Hispanic" qualifier meant that these labels had to be retained in the present report.

⁵⁹ Please see Table Set 3, Participant Ethnicity/Race as Reported, for participant data presented according to the disaggregated race categories that DAS utilizes.

- Asian Bangladeshi
 - Asian Chinese
 - Asian Cambodian
 - Asian Filipino
 - Asian Hmong
 - Asian Indonesian
 - Asian Japanese
 - Asian Korean
 - Asian Laotian
 - Asian Malaysian
 - Asian Pakistani
 - Asian Sri Lankan
 - Asian Taiwanese
 - Asian Thai
 - Asian Vietnamese
- The following DAS categories were collapsed under “Pacific Islander or Native Hawaiian”:
 - Native Hawaiian Fijian
 - Native Hawaiian Guamanian
 - Native Hawaiian Hawaiian
 - Native Hawaiian Samoan
 - Native Hawaiian Tongan
- In the data reported to CAAL-Skills, some participant selections were reported under DAS’ “Asian or Pacific Islander” category directly, rather than disaggregated under any constituent category. Responses in this category could not be disaggregated for inclusion in either the Asian or Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander OMB category; therefore, they were reported directly under the category of “Asian or Pacific Islander” in program tables.⁶⁰
 - DAS classified participant responses which did not correspond to any of the above values as “unknown.”
 - Participants who did not select any race or ethnic category were classified as “participant did not self-identify.”⁶¹
 - The DAS category of Hispanic was reported under the OMB category of Hispanic or Latino.

A combined race-ethnicity reporting scheme was employed.

⁶⁰ DAS’ most recent (2017) [annual legislative report](#) indicates that this combined category, “Asian or Pacific Islander,” is a legacy category used prior to the enactment of AB 1088 in 2011, mandating greater detail in demographic classification of Asian and/or Pacific Islander participants (DAS Annual Legislative Report for 2017, p. 4). As such, it is to be expected that incidence of the use of this category will decline as apprentices who entered prior to 2011 complete their programs.

⁶¹ No participants fell within this category in either fiscal year.

Creating a separate table for participant ethnicity was considered, but ultimately rejected, for the following reasons:

- Although DAS' form specifies that Hispanic individuals may be of any race, the questionnaire portion of the [Apprenticeship Agreement form](#) allows each participant only one selection from among both racial and ethnic categories. By offering race categories of "White" and "Black" only with the non-Hispanic qualifier, DAS' reporting method forces a participant choosing one of these two racial categories to also identify as not of Hispanic ethnicity. Being forced, identification as non-Hispanic here cannot form the basis for creating a reliable "non-Hispanic" participant pool.⁶²
- Additionally, while certain of the race categories included in the DAS form feature a "non-Hispanic" qualifier (White and Black or African-American), others do not (Asian, Native American or Alaskan Native, Pacific Islander, or Native Hawaiian). This makes creating a "non-Hispanic" comparison group unreliable since the ethnic identification of a participant cannot be known via their racial selection.

Race and ethnicity data for DAS participants have been displayed in two separate sets of tables. Table Set 2 displays participant data organized in the closest possible approximation to the OMB approach (with modifications made to DAS categories as described above).

Table Set 3 displays DAS participant race and ethnicity data using DAS reporting categories.⁶³

⁶² Readers will notice that the finalized table includes a small (<10) number of individuals who identified as "More than one race" in FY 15-16. These may be individuals enrolled in a trainee program, which may have different parameters for reporting participant race/ethnicity, or it may reflect a reporting error. In either case, participants in this category are far below <1% the total enrolled.

⁶³ While the data that CAAL-Skills received included the category of "Hispanic," the difficulty CAAL-Skills would face in sorting the participant pool by ethnicity lies in accurately constructing a "non-Hispanic or Latino" reference group. Under federal reporting standards, race and ethnicity are treated as distinct elements of an individual's identity meaning that the ethnic identification of a participant (whether Hispanic/Latino or not Hispanic/Latino) cannot be discerned from their race (Asian, Black/African-American, etc.). Hispanic/Latino could be distinguished as a category of ethnic identification in DOR data, but it could not reliably be compared with anything. With a single choice reported from among ethnic *and* race categories, these categories were effectively treated as equivalent in the data CAAL-Skills received. Such treatment may cause individuals to select categories in a different manner than under a separate reporting scheme. To take a hypothetical participant who identifies racially as White and ethnically as Hispanic: an individual in this setting may have elected to choose only "Hispanic/Latino" as his identifier in lieu of selecting any race category.

California Department of Social Services (CDSS) – CalWORKS Welfare to Work Program

The California Department of Social Services employs a combined race-ethnicity reporting system, which is described below.

Each participant is able to select *one* from among the following combined ethnic/racial categories:

- Alaska Native/American Indian
- Amerasian
- Asian Indian
- Cambodian
- Chinese
- Filipino
- Japanese
- Korean
- Laotian
- Vietnamese
- Other Asian
- Black
- Hispanic
- Guamanian
- Hawaiian
- Samoan
- White

CDSS's reporting scheme was accommodated to CAAL-Skills values in the following manner:

- CDSS values of White, Black, and Alaska Native or American Indian were reported under the corresponding OMB/CAAL-Skills categories.

The following CDSS categories were collapsed under the relevant OMB master categories (on the basis of federal descriptions of constituent subcategories):

- Collapsed under "Asian":
 - Filipino
 - Chinese
 - Cambodian
 - Japanese
 - Korean
 - Asian Indian
 - Laotian
 - Vietnamese
 - Amerasian⁶⁴
 - Other Asian

⁶⁴ Refers to a person born in Asia to an Asian mother and a U.S. (military) father.

- In parallel fashion, the following CDSS categories were collapsed under “Pacific Islander or Native Hawaiian”:
 - Hawaiian
 - Samoan
 - Guamanian
- CAAL-Skills retained CDSS’ classification of any participant responses not corresponding to one of the above values as “unknown.”
- Finally, the CDSS category of Hispanic was reported as the OMB/CAAL-Skills value, Hispanic or Latino.

A combined race-ethnicity reporting scheme was employed.

Creating a separate table for participant ethnicity was considered, but ultimately rejected, for the following reasons:

- While CDSS’ reporting scheme presents a “Hispanic” option, the difficulty CAAL-Skills would face in sorting the participant pool by ethnicity lies in accurately constructing a “non-Hispanic or Latino” reference group from CDSS’ data. Under federal reporting standards, race and ethnicity are treated as distinct elements of an individual’s identity, meaning that the ethnic identification of a participant (whether Hispanic/Latino or not Hispanic/Latino) cannot be discerned from their racial identification (Asian, Black/African-American, etc.). Hispanic or Latino could be distinguished as a category of ethnic identification on the basis of CDSS data, in other words, but it could not reliably be compared with anything.
- By allowing only one choice from among ethnic *and* race categories, CDSS reporting effectively treats these categories as equivalent. Such treatment may cause individual participants to select categories in a different manner than they would under a reporting scheme that treated race and ethnicity distinctly. To take the case of a hypothetical participant who identified in the census as (racially) White and (ethnically) Hispanic: an individual in this setting may have elected to choose only “Hispanic/Latino” as his identifier in lieu of selecting any race category.⁶⁵

⁶⁵ For an overview of the history of and issues with the counting of Hispanic or Latino individuals by the U.S. census, see [“Census History: Counting Hispanics”](#). Cohn, D’Vera. Pew Research Center. March 3, 2010. For a discussion of recent debate over an (abortive) attempt to alter the “Hispanic question” in the 2020 census, see: [“Seeking better data on Hispanics, Census Bureau may change how it asks about race”](#). Cohn, D’Vera. Pew Research Center. April 20 2017.

D. Outcome Metric Calculations

Credential attainment rate

Calculation:

The number of participants who exited during the reporting period who obtained a recognized credential during the program or within one year after exit

PLUS

The number of participants who were in a secondary education program and obtained a secondary school diploma or its recognized equivalent during the program or within one year after exit and were also employed, or in an education or training program leading to a recognized postsecondary credential within one year after exit

DIVIDED BY

The number of participants enrolled in an education or training program (excluding those in on the job training and customized training) who exited during the reporting period

2nd and 4th quarter employment rates

Calculation:

The number of participants who exited during the reporting period who are found to be employed through direct UI wage record match in the second quarter after the exit quarter

DIVIDED BY

The number of participants who exited during the reporting period

Considerations and caveats:

A participant's employment status is determined by reported wage data. Wage data is reported to the EDD by the participant's employer and is only as accurate as reported. Employers report wages to the EDD on a quarterly basis once they have been paid to the employee. Therefore, wages earned in one quarter may be reported in another quarter, depending on when the employee was paid.

- EDD maintains wage data only for covered employers, indicated on the [EDD Information Sheet: Types of Employment \(DE231TE\)](#) as subject to the Unemployment Insurance and Employment Training Tax. Therefore, this outcome is reported only for participants who are employed by such employers.
- The CAAL-Skills system does not maintain data on whether employment was subsidized or unsubsidized. Therefore, participants to be excluded for subsidized employment cannot be identified and excluded.
- The CAAL-Skills system does not maintain data on a participant's reason for exiting a program. Therefore, the participants to be excluded for reasons related to exiting the program cannot be identified and excluded.
- In this report, a participant is considered to be "employed" (and thus counted in the numerator and all calculations of median earnings) if that participant had reported earnings of more than \$0 at any point in the quarter. In the present report, individuals with any reported earnings have been included in calculations of employment rates and median earnings, given the fact that earnings are employer-reported and the EDD is

unable to audit their source. For future reports, CWDB research staff may consider alternative or additional approaches that could enable more meaningful measures of employment. A further caveat to use of administrative data for calculating employment rates is the lack of knowledge about whether individuals are actively seeking employment (are considered to be in the labor force). A final caveat is that certain types of employment may not be captured by the UI base wage data: data comes from employer reporting and therefore does not capture all employment participants may have held. For instance: gig work, day labor, or other kinds of informal or cash earnings are not captured. In addition, unlike calculation of employment rate that relies on survey methods and base employment denominators on total individuals in the labor force, it is not possible to know whether all individuals were actively seeking employment. In spite of these limitations, UI earnings data is widely recognized as superior in its reliability to self-reported earnings (which may be incomplete or biased) (for a discussion of these issues, see: Annalisa Mastri, Dana Rotz and Elias Hanno [2018] "[Comparing Job Training Impact Estimates using Survey and Administrative Data,](#)" Mathematica Policy Research).

2nd and 4th quarter median earnings

Calculation:

The middle value in the range of participant earnings at the specified post-exit stage.

Considerations and caveats:

- The median is used in this report as a measure of central tendency due to its greater resistance to influence by extreme values compared with the mean. Earnings information in the UI base wage file is employer-provided and cannot be checked or validated in the absence of a claim. The CAAL-Skills team found multiple instances of very low participant earnings (<\$100) for each program in this report. Being unable to determine the source of these very low earnings, CAAL- Skills has chosen not to exclude these earnings.

Additional considerations:

- Industry
 - 100% of an individual's earnings were reported under the sector category of majority earnings.
- Regional variation in the cost of living may impact the true meaning of earnings:
 - Cost of living varies widely across the diverse regions of the state of California.
 - It is therefore important to note that median earnings alone may not provide a full picture of an individual's economic situation. Households in urban areas face higher than average living costs, which are not always offset by increased access to well-paying jobs. Counties making up the Bay-Peninsula region, in particular, have some of the state's highest average living costs, leading to high regional levels of housing and food insecurity despite very high median earning levels. ⁶⁶

⁶⁶ According to data in a [report](#) compiled by the National Low Income Housing Coalition, the minimum hourly "housing wage" (the wage needed to afford a 2-bedroom apartment) within the San Francisco metropolitan area

On the other hand, individuals in rural areas face labor market disadvantages that stem from such regions' remoteness from employers and small population bases, which do not support the same degree of specialization (and opportunities for higher pay) as seen in urban economies.⁶⁷ However, disadvantages from such factors in the form of reduced access to well-paying jobs, higher unemployment rates, and lower wages may be partly counterbalanced by lower living costs in these areas.⁶⁸

E. Program-by-Program Service Descriptions

California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title I Adult & Dislocated Worker Programs

Services under WIOA Title I are described below:

- **Career services**
 - Outreach, job search and employment assistance, and labor market information as well as more comprehensive assessments, development of individual employment plans and counseling and career planning, open to all adult and dislocated worker jobseekers.
 - Under WIOA, career services are differentiated into basic and individualized. Basic services are those that involve less staff time and involvement, such as eligibility determinations, initial skills assessments, labor exchange services, and provision of information and/or referrals concerning available programs. Basic services are further distinguished based upon whether they are accessed by an individual (“self-service”) directly or involve staff assistance (“staff-assisted”). Individualized services are provided to an individual only when AJCC staff determine that services are required by that individual to retain or obtain employment.
 - These services involve significant staff time and customization to each individual’s need (for instance: specialized assessments, developing an individual employment plan, counseling, and work experiences, including transitional jobs).⁶⁹
 - Career services are provided via “one-stop” centers—America’s Job Centers of California—that serve as all-inclusive access points to education and training

in 2019 is \$60.96. See also: Charlotte Simmonds, “[The Silicon Valley paradox: one in four people are at risk of hunger](#),” *The Guardian* 12 December 2017.

⁶⁷ See Don Albrecht (2012) “A Comparison of Metro and Nonmetro Incomes in a Twenty-First Century Economy” *Journal of Rural Social Studies* 27(1):1-23; Paul Krugman (1991) “[Increasing Returns and Economic Geography](#)” *Journal of Political Economy* 99(31): 483-499.

⁶⁸ The California Poverty Measure (CPM) is an attempt to take into account such regional disparities in cost of living. For a discussion of the measure, see: Christopher Wimer, Marybeth Mattingly, Sara Kimberlin, Jonathan Fisher, Caroline Danielson, and Sarah Bohn. (2018) “[2.1 Million Californians in Deep Poverty. Stanford, CA: Stanford Center on Poverty and Inequality](#)”.

⁶⁹ TEGL 19-16

programs for a wide range of customers. “One-stops” are so-called because, under both WIOA and WIA which preceded it, services offered under Title I are co-located with several other required programs.⁷⁰

- By law, Local Boards may either directly provide career services, or may contract their provision using open and competitive process in order to select their AJCC Operators (WIOA Section 121[d][2][A]). Contracted service providers may be an institution of higher education; an employment service state agency established under the Wagner-Peyser Act; a community-based organization, nonprofit organization, or workforce intermediary; a private for-profit entity; a government agency; another interested organization or entity, which may include a local chamber of commerce or other business organization, or a labor organization. (WIOA Section 121[d][2][B]) ⁷¹Data in the report do not count individuals who only accessed self-services (e.g., using reading room materials in an AJCC) as “participants.” To be included in program data in this report, a participant must have received at least one staff-assisted service. In the tables that follow, services differentiated into “core” and “intensive” career services under WIA are collectively presented as “career services” for parity with the labeling of these services in the FY 15-16 data under WIOA. It is understood that this category captures the total of core and intensive service recipients in FY 14-15 and basic (self- and staff-assisted) and individualized career services in FY 15-16.

- **Training services**

- Under WIOA, training services are provided to equip individuals to enter the workforce and retain employment. Training services are available for individuals who, after an interview, evaluation, or assessment, and case management are determined to be unlikely or unable to obtain or retain employment that leads to self-sufficiency or higher wages than previous employment through career services alone. WIOA emphasizes that training services be “provided in a manner that maximizes consumer choice in the selection of an eligible provider of such services.”⁷²
- Under WIOA, training services may be provided if career center staff determines after conducting an interview, an evaluation, or assessment, and career planning, that the individual:

⁷⁰ Under WIOA Section 121, the full list of one-stop partners (required to be represented by at least one comprehensive AJCC in every Local Area) is: WIOA Title I Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth; WIOA Title II Adult Education and Literacy; WIOA Title III Wagner-Peyser; WIOA Title IV Vocational Rehabilitation; Carl Perkins Career Technical Education; Title V Older Americans Act; Job Corps; Native American Programs (Section 166); Migrant Seasonal Farmworkers (Section 167); Veterans; Youth Build; Trade Adjustment Assistance Act; Community Services Block Grant; Housing & Urban Development; Unemployment Compensation; Second Chance; Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (CalWORKS). See, WSD18-12, April 30, 2019. This list represented the result of WIOA’s expansion of required partners to include TANF and ex-offender programs. WIOA also imposed a requirement that Title III services be physically co-located in the one-stop (i.e., rather than located at a separate, stand-alone facility).

⁷¹ [WSD16-14](#), December 19, 2016

⁷² For further detail on WIOA career and training service types, see [TEGL 19-16](#).

- Is unlikely or unable to obtain or retain employment that leads to economic self-sufficiency or wages comparable to or higher than wages from previous employment through career services alone;
- Is in need of training services to obtain or retain employment that leads to economic self-sufficiency or wages comparable to or higher than wages from previous employment;
- Has the skills and qualifications to successfully participate in the selected program of training services;
- Is unable to obtain grant assistance from other sources to pay the costs of such training;
- Is a member of a worker group covered under a petition filed for Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) and is awaiting a determination. If the petition is certified, the worker may then transition to TAA-approved training. If the petition is denied, the worker will continue training under WIOA;
- Is determined eligible in accordance with the State and local priority system in effect for adults under WIOA sec. 134(c)(3)(E) if training services are provided through the adult funding stream; and
- Selected a program of training services that is directly linked to the employment opportunities in the Local Workforce Development Area or the planning region, or in another area to which the individual is willing to commute or relocate”.⁷³
- Types of training services include:
 - Occupational skills training, including training for nontraditional employment
 - On-the-job training
 - Incumbent worker training
 - Programs that combine workplace training with related instruction, which may include cooperative education programs
 - Training programs operated by the private sector
 - Skill upgrading and retraining
 - Entrepreneurial training
 - Job readiness training provided in combination with any of the services above
 - Adult education and literacy activities provided concurrently or in combination with training services, including “occupational training” or with “transitional jobs.”
 - Customized training conducted with a commitment by an employer or group of employers to employ an individual upon successful completion of the training

WIOA Title I Adult and Dislocated Workers may receive training services from state eligible training providers they select in consultation with the career planner, which includes a discussion of program quality and performance information on the available eligible training providers.⁷⁴ Providers may be community colleges; apprenticeship programs approved by the

⁷³ [TEGL 19-16](#)

⁷⁴ Under WIOA Section 122—but not under the same section of WIA— providers must meet eligibility criteria that include performance accountability; access to training throughout the state including rural areas; the degree to

Division of Apprenticeship Standards (as oversight body for individual registered apprenticeship sponsors offering programs in various occupational fields); or the Department of Labor (DOL); local adult schools; private training academies and trade schools offering programs in various fields/occupations (e.g., cosmetology; bookkeeping; trades; healthcare); extension or open campus programs via four-year colleges; as well as employers.

ITAs are not, however, the only path through which participants enrolled under Title I may receive training: they may also be enrolled in customized training, where training is performed with the commitment of an employer or group of employers to employ the trainee upon successful training completion.

Or, they may receive training on the job, where training is provided by an employer to a paid participant while engaged in productive work in a job that:

- Provides knowledge or skills essential to the full and adequate performance of the job;
- Is made available through a program that provides reimbursement to the employer of up to 50 percent of the wage rate of the participant, except as provided in section 134(c)(3)(H), for the extraordinary costs of providing the training and additional supervision related to the training; and
- Is limited in duration as appropriate to the occupation for which the participant is being trained, taking into account the content of the training, the prior work experience of the participant, and the service strategy of the participant, as appropriate.⁷⁵

Additionally, in certain circumstances, a Local Board may contract to provide training instead of going through the ITA/ETPL system.⁷⁶

In California, state law (Section 14211 of the Unemployment Insurance Code) additionally mandates that Local Boards expend 30% of their Title I Adult and Dislocated Worker program funds on workforce training programs (see SB 734 [Statutes of 2011], AB 1149 [Statutes of

which training relates to in-demand industry sectors and occupations; ways in which criteria can encourage use of industry-recognized certificates or certifications, and the ability of providers to offer recognized postsecondary credentials. Training services for eligible individuals are typically provided by training providers who receive payment for their services through an ITA. The ITA is a payment agreement established on behalf of a participant with a training provider. WIOA Title I adult and dislocated workers purchase training services from State eligible training providers they select in consultation with the career planner, which includes discussion of program quality and performance information on the available eligible training providers. Payments from ITAs may be made in a variety of ways, including the electronic transfer of funds through financial institutions, vouchers, or other appropriate methods. Payments also may be made incrementally, for example, through payment of a portion of the costs at different points in the training course. Under limited conditions, as provided in §680.320 and WIOA sec. 134(d)(3)(G), a Local WDB may contract for these services, rather than using an ITA for this purpose. In some limited circumstances, the Local WDB may itself provide the training services, but only if it obtains a waiver from the Governor for this purpose, and the Local WDB meets the other requirements of §679.410 of this chapter and WIOA sec. 107(g)(1). (20 CFR Section 680.300).

⁷⁵ WIOA Section 3 (Definitions) 44.

⁷⁶ See 20 CFR 680.30

2017]).

Qualifying training services must meet certain criteria (see Directive WSD18-10, January 31, 2019), including factors designed to ensure that training is “provided through a structured learning process,” “lead[] to the attainment of skills or competencies needed to perform work duties during the course of the workday,” and ultimately “lead to employment and/or greater labor productivity on the job.”

These include requirements that the training lead to one of the following: an industry-recognized certificate or certification, a certificate of completion of a registered apprenticeship, a license recognized by the state involved or the federal government, an associate or baccalaureate degree; a secondary school diploma or its equivalent; employment; measurable skill gains toward a credential, or employment.⁷⁷

California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Title I Program - Youth

Services under the Youth program fall under fourteen program elements:⁷⁸

- Tutoring, study skills training, instruction, and dropout prevention
- Alternative secondary school services or dropout recovery services
- Paid and unpaid work experience
- Occupational skills training
- Education offered concurrently with workforce preparation and training for a specific occupation
- Leadership development opportunities
- Supportive services
- Adult mentoring
- Follow-up services
- Comprehensive guidance and counseling
- Financial literacy education
- Entrepreneurial skills training
- Services that provide labor market information
- Postsecondary preparation and transition activities⁷⁹

Under WIA, only the first nine elements in the above list were offered. (A tenth, summer employment opportunities, was later included within the “work experience” master category).⁸⁰

⁷⁷ Note that “qualifying training types” identified by WSD 18-10 include both the 10 WIOA-defined training types above, AND the category of “transitional jobs,” which under WIOA is categorized as a type of individualized career service. [WSD18-10](#), January 31, 2019.

⁷⁸ A more detailed description of each of these service types may be found in [Workforce Services Directive 19-06](#) (December 27, 2017).

⁷⁹ Workforce Investment Act, Section 129(2).

⁸⁰ WSD 17-07

Although defined as fourteen elements, services are also categorized according to the service type of “bucket” into which they fall: training services, comprising vocational training as well as programs in post-secondary education that culminate in industry-recognized credentials (such as career technical education through community colleges); career services including provision of job-search information and resources, and supportive services, like assistance with transportation or housing.

In this chapter, Youth program services have been categorized according to their service bucket (training, career, or supportive) to be consistent with how these categories are used by the other programs in this report.^{81 82}

Below, complete descriptions of all services included under each respective service category are provided. Services added under WIOA (and thus, possible only in FY 15-16 data) are indicated with an asterisk.

Career Services

In general, services classified as “career” offered under WIOA include but go beyond the kinds of labor market attachment help that characterize career services in the Adult program—i.e., services (resume preparation, job search tools, etc.) that are designed to place individuals in jobs.

This may be because the Youth program recognizes that many of its participants are school-age (or close) youth who may require preliminary education or assistance to reach a level of preparation that will allow them to benefit from more advanced education or occupational training. For example, many apprenticeship programs that train electricians require entrants to have at least a passing grade in algebra to ensure they have command of mathematical formulas and will be able to make competent calculations when planning work that involves electrical currents. There are similar examples from many other occupations. If participants lack these prerequisite abilities, they will be barred from entering the training programs that act as pathways into high-quality jobs. Additionally, participants may lack “job-readiness” skills (interpersonal skills, normative styles of communication, etc.) that either training programs or employers may value.⁸³

⁸¹ For the most part, the classification of individual services did not change from WIA to WIOA. In some cases, similar services under WIA and WIOA are classified under different buckets. This includes basic skills training, which was classified as a training service under WIA, but is classified as a career service under WIOA.

⁸² For this conversion, see the [attachment](#) to Workforce Services Directive 19-06. See the column which provides the conversion to the PIRL code. In general, Youth services are career services unless coded as 1303 (indicating the service is a training service) or 1409 (indicating a supportive service). Please also note that this is not always the same as the category under which a service is classified in case reporting in the CalJOBS system.

⁸³ For literature on unequal access to building “soft” or non-cognitive skills, and its role in unequal employment outcomes for young people, as well as discussion of the ascendancy of these skills in a service-based economy, see pp. 105-106 in Joann Golann [2015] “The Paradox of Success at a No-Excuses School” *Sociology of Education* 88[2]: 103–119. Sociologist of work Vicki Smith has also found that an expectation jobseekers will cultivate their own “employability” (self-presentation, such as speech, dress, and interpersonal norms) has become increasingly

Some research on educational approaches to at-risk youth has shown that the very culturally-valued skills employers, university admissions teams, or instructors may value are skills that may not be taught to these individuals—even in the context of programs that stress academic achievement.⁸⁴

The Youth program also offers services (such as basic skills training,⁸⁵ and training geared specifically toward preparation for apprenticeship) that seek to overcome these barriers and prepare participants for future or concurrent occupational training. Similarly, other career services offered for Youth participants are geared toward assisting in-school youth with study skills and other kinds of support to prevent dropping out in the first place and/or to enable participants to receive their equivalency degree (GED).

Also introduced by WIOA are preparatory or transitional services geared toward facilitating enrollment and success in both traditional higher education (preparation for the SAT, college admission assistance) and registered apprenticeship (which, like a four-year college application, has formalized admissions criteria and processes that youth may require assistance in navigating).

Ideally, these kinds of services will address not only academic barriers but inequalities of access to the cultural skills or knowledge that are also necessary for advancement. The diversity of services also indicates the diversity of participants and potential paths (e.g., traditional higher education or vocational training) the program envisions.

In this report, career services include the following:

- **Tutoring, Study Skills Training & Instruction** – Evidence-based dropout prevention and recovery strategies enabling the participant to complete secondary school diploma requirements, or its recognized equivalent (including a recognized certificate of attendance or similar document with individuals with disabilities); or for a recognized post-secondary credential.
- **Basic skills training** – Training for Youth participants whose English, writing, and/or computing skill level are at or below the eighth-grade level; training includes reading, writing, mathematics, problem-solving, and interpersonal skills training to enable the Youth to communicate in English, use math, or obtain a high school diploma or GED (if applicable), to become eligible for post-secondary education or training, and to develop into a productive, employable citizen.
- **Various types of career exploration** (specific service types including Career Awareness, Career Exploration).

prevalent at all occupational levels. See: Vicki Smith (2010) “Enhancing employability: Human, cultural, and social capital in an era of turbulent unpredictability” *Human Relations* 63(2): 279–303.

⁸⁴ See, Joann Golann [2015] “The Paradox of Success at a No-Excuses School” *Sociology of Education* 88[2]: 103–119.

⁸⁵ Under WIA basic skills training was classified as a training, not a career, service. Implications of this are discussed in the next section.

- **Comprehensive Guidance and Counseling which include one or more of the following:**
 - Activities leading to secondary school diploma attainment, or it's equivalent; preparation for post-secondary education and training opportunities;
 - Strong linkages between academic instruction and occupational education that lead to the attainment of recognized post-secondary credentials;
 - Preparation for unsubsidized employment opportunities;
 - Effective connections to employers, including small employers, on in-demand industry sectors and occupations within the Youth's local and regional labor markets; or
 - Drug and alcohol abuse counseling, mental health counseling, and referral to partner programs as appropriate. If referring a Youth to necessary counseling that cannot be provided by the local Youth program or its service providers, the local youth program must coordinate with the organization it refers to in order to ensure continuity of service.
- **Secondary education** – Both traditional and including programs of alternative secondary school services or dropout recovery services.
- **Adult Education** (GED)
- **Internship**
- **Job shadowing** – A work experience option that is a temporary, unpaid exposure to the workplace in an occupational area of interest to the participant. Youth witness firsthand the work environment, employability and occupational skills in practice, the value of professional training, and potential career options.
- **Leadership development services** – May be any of a number of opportunities that encourages leadership development, responsibility, confidence, employability, self-determination, and other positive social behaviors, such as:
 - Exposure to postsecondary educational possibilities;
 - Community and service-learning projects;
 - Peer-centered activities, including peer mentoring and tutoring;
 - Organizational and team work training, including team leadership training;
 - Training in decision-making, including determining priorities and problem-solving;
 - Citizenship training, including life skills training such as parenting and work behavior training;
 - Civic engagement activities which promote the quality of life in a community; or
 - Other leadership activities that place youth in a leadership role such as serving on youth leadership committees, such as a Standing Youth Committee.
- **Adult mentoring** – A formal relationship between a youth participant and an adult mentor that includes structured activities where the mentor offers guidance, support, and encouragement to develop the competence and character of the mentee. Mentoring may include workplace mentoring where the local program matches a youth participant with an employer or employee of a company.

- **Work experience** (whether paid or unpaid) and youth on-the-job training (*WIOA introduced a requirement that Local Boards expend 20% of Youth formula funds on work experience [Title 20 CFR Section 681.620]*).
- **Pre-apprenticeship training** – Readiness training to provide skills and competencies (for example: of literacy, reading comprehension, mathematical ability) needed to enroll in an apprenticeship program. Pre-apprenticeship training is provided via a Pre-Apprenticeship (PA) program that has a documented partnership with at least one Registered Apprenticeship program and program of training and curriculum that are based on industry standards approved by the documented Registered Apprenticeship partner(s).
- **Youth on-the-job training** – On-the-job training experience in the private, for-profit, nonprofit, or public sector workplace for a limited time period.
- ***Post-secondary transition services** – Services that enable the participant to transition to higher education and training (including technical training schools, community colleges, 4-year colleges and universities, and registered apprenticeship). Services delivered under this category may include assisting youth to prepare for SAT/ACT testing; assisting with college admission applications; searching and applying for scholarships and grants; filling out the proper financial aid applications and adhering to changing guidelines, and connecting youth to postsecondary education programs.
- ***Education offered concurrently with occupational skills training received through an ETPL provider** – Out-of-school Youth participants 16 and older may enroll in training programs offered through providers (e.g., community colleges; trade schools; registered apprenticeship programs) listed in the state’s Eligible Training Provider List (see Training Service Status at Exit table for more discussion). These individuals may also enroll in education concurrent to their training, which is captured separately as a type of career service.
- ***Education offered concurrently with workforce preparation and training** – An integrated education and training model that teaches workforce preparation activities, basic academic skills, and hands-on occupational skills training within the same time frame and connected to training in a specific occupation, occupational cluster, or career pathway.
- ***Entrepreneurial skills training** – Entrepreneurial skills training provides the basics of starting and operating a small business. This training helps youth develop the skills associated with entrepreneurship and the gig economy, such as the ability to take initiative, creatively seek out and identify business opportunities, develop budgets and forecast resource needs, understand various options for acquiring capital and the trade-offs associated with each option, and communicate effectively and market oneself and one’s ideas.
- ***Financial Literacy Education** – Education in budgeting, banking and credit, personal financial decision-making, financial literacy, etc.

Training Services

In the WIOA Youth program, services that provide instruction and/or experiential training in a distinct occupation or field are classified as “training” services. (This may help to clarify why certain services with “training” in the name are nevertheless classified as career services above).⁸⁶

They include:

- **Occupational skills training** – Refers to an organized program of study that provides specific vocational skills that lead to proficiency in performing actual tasks and technical functions required by certain occupational fields at entry, intermediate, or advanced levels. Occupational skills training:
 - Is outcome-oriented and focused on an occupational goal specified in the individual service strategy for the youth;
 - is of sufficient duration to impart the skills needed to meet the occupational goal; and
 - Leads to the attainment of a recognized postsecondary credential.
- Individuals enrolled through the Youth program can receive occupational skills training from a provider of youth-specific training (listed on the state’s Youth Provider list); alternatively, out-of-school youth who are at least 16 can—like Adult program participants—receive training from approved programs on the Eligible Training Provider List (ETPL) by being provided with an Individual Training Account (ITA). Through this means, participants can access skill training programs offered by community colleges; apprenticeship programs approved by the Division of Apprenticeship Standards; adult schools; private training academies and trade schools offering programs in various fields/occupations (e.g., cosmetology; bookkeeping; trades; healthcare); and extension or open campus programs via four-year colleges; as well as employers).⁸⁷
- **Apprenticeship Training** – Training through a Registered Apprenticeship Program listed on the ETPL. Registered apprenticeship programs, overseen by the Division of Apprenticeship Standards of the state’s Department of Industrial Relations, are programs that combine on-the-job and classroom training and involve collaboration in the design and development of standards from employers, educational institutions, in many cases labor, and government. Registered apprenticeship culminates in industry-recognized credentials, and participants are also employed for the duration of their training. In the context of training types under the WIOA Youth program, apprenticeship is accessed via providers (apprenticeship sponsors) listed in the ETPL that offer apprenticeship training in specific industries and occupations (e.g., building trades).
- **Post-Secondary Education** – A Youth participant possessing a high school or a GED diploma can enroll, with WIOA Youth Title I funds, into a post-secondary program that

⁸⁶ In Table Set 12.7.1.1 and associated figures, trivial (<0.01% of total) numbers of individuals who were reported in program data as enrolled in WIOA Title I program training yet whose training codes do not match with WIOA Youth program codes, were included in the calculation of statistics based on aggregate training enrollments in both years. As these individuals were reported by the program to have received training services, the decision was made not to remove them from each year’s training total, or calculation of associated statistics.

⁸⁷ The full, current, ETPL may be accessed through the CalJOBS system.

provides the skills, education, and/or training for an in-demand occupation or industry and grants recognized credentials or degrees.

- **Pre-apprenticeship training with Occupational Skills Training**– Pre-apprenticeship training (as described above) when this training also provides occupational skills training that leads to an industry-recognized certificate, credential, or license upon completion.
- ***(For participants enrolled/served under WIA, only) Other Basic Skills Training** - Training including, but not limited to: reading comprehension, math computation, writing, speaking, listening, problem-solving, and reasoning.

Supportive Services

- Child/Dependent Care
- Transportation Assistance
- Medical services
- Temporary Shelter
- Tools/Clothing
- Housing Assistance
- Utilities
- Educational Testing
- Needs-Related Payments
- Linkages to Community Services
- Post-Secondary Educational Materials
- Incentive Payments⁸⁸
- Other supportive services⁸⁹

In the Youth program, “training” encompasses several kinds of occupational or vocational training (including apprenticeship), as well as traditional, post-secondary education.

In data presented here, **occupational skills training, post-secondary education, and pre-apprenticeship training** that includes occupational skills training are all categorized as “Occupational Skills Training (Youth)”:⁹⁰

- **Occupational skills training** refers to an organized program of study that provides specific vocational skills that lead to proficiency in performing actual tasks and technical functions required by certain occupational fields at entry, intermediate, or advanced levels. Occupational skills training:

⁸⁸ Incentive payments are payments provided, according to a contract agreed by the Local Board and a participant, which are offered in recognition of the participant’s achieving certain predefined training, education, or work experience goals.

⁸⁹ Services provided to Youth participants also include follow-up services, which are provided after a participant’s exit and include types of support or counseling or other transitional services (e.g., counseling or assistance with a new job). Since data in this report do not include services provided following a participant’s program exit, which is the definition of a follow-up service.

⁹⁰ See: Workforce GPS, [Youth Connections](#) for service descriptions. See also: [TEGL 21-16](#) and [WSD 17-07](#). See also, for more on service types (and crosswalks), [WSD 19-06](#).

- Is outcome-oriented and focused on an occupational goal specified in the individual service strategy for the youth;
- is of sufficient duration to impart the skills needed to meet the occupational goal; and
- Leads to the attainment of a recognized postsecondary credential.
- Individuals enrolled through the Youth program can receive occupational skills training from a provider of youth-specific training (listed on the state’s Youth Provider list).
- Alternatively, out-of-school youth who are at least 16 can—like Adult program participants—receive training from approved programs on the Eligible Training Provider List (ETPL) by being provided with an Individual Training Account (ITA). Through this means, participants can access skill training programs offered by community colleges; apprenticeship programs approved by the Division of Apprenticeship Standards; adult schools; private training academies and trade schools offering programs in various fields/occupations (e.g., cosmetology; bookkeeping; trades; healthcare); and extension or open campus programs via four-year colleges; as well as employers).⁹¹

Occupational Skills Training (Youth)” combines several distinct training and education types into one: the first is vocational or occupational training that is given through individual registered youth providers (which may, for example, be county offices of education or local school districts) on the Youth Provider Training List,⁹² or (for out of school participants 16 and older, training offered via adult ETPL providers (community colleges; apprenticeship programs approved by the Division of Apprenticeship Standards (as an oversight body for individual registered apprenticeship sponsors offering programs in various occupational fields); local adult schools; private training academies and trade schools offering programs in various fields/occupations (e.g., cosmetology; bookkeeping; trades; healthcare); extension or open campus programs via four-year colleges; as well as employers).⁹³ Also included under this training category is post-secondary education that is specifically geared toward training and certification in a particular field or occupation. The clearest example would be a career technical education program offered through a community college. The final type is pre-apprenticeship training, or readiness training aimed specifically at teaching the set of skills and competencies (for example: of literacy, reading comprehension, mathematical ability) that are needed to enroll and succeed in an apprenticeship program if the pre-apprenticeship program in question also has an occupational skill training component. (Otherwise, it is classified as a type of career service).

- **Post-Secondary Education** – A Youth participant possessing a high school or a GED diploma can enroll, with WIOA Youth Title I funds, into a post-secondary program that provides the skills, education, and/or training for an in-demand occupation or industry, and grants recognized credentials or degrees.

⁹¹ The full, current, ETPL may be accessed through the CalJOBS system.

⁹² For details on the Youth provider procurement in CA, see: [Workforce Services Directive 16-19](#), May 26, 2017.

⁹³ The full, current, ETPL may be accessed through the CalJOBS system.

- **Pre-apprenticeship training with Occupational Skills Training** – Readiness training that is aimed specifically at teaching the set of skills and competencies (for example: of literacy, reading comprehension, mathematical ability) needed to enroll in an apprenticeship program. Pre-apprenticeship training is provided via a Pre-Apprenticeship (PA) program that has a documented partnership with at least one Registered Apprenticeship program, and program of training and curriculum that are based on industry standards approved by the documented Registered Apprenticeship partner(s).
- **Apprenticeship Training** – Youth participants can also enroll directly in Registered Apprenticeship programs certified under the Department of Industrial Relations – Division of Apprenticeship Standards. State-registered apprenticeship represents a collaboration of industry, an educational institution, government (in the form of DAS), and the apprentice. Defined by a combination of concurrent classroom-based instruction and on-site work experience and by the joint involvement of employers, workers and their representatives, and educational entities in defining and maintaining standards-- apprenticeship is also unique as a model in which every trainee is simultaneously a worker, earning sustainable pay subject to transparent increases as they learn and attain full command of their craft.⁹⁴ Registered apprenticeship also culminates in industry-recognized credentials. In the Youth program, apprenticeship is accessed via providers (apprenticeship sponsors) listed in the ETPL that offer apprenticeship training in specific industries and occupations (e.g., building trades).

The absence of any Youth participants enrolled in apprenticeship training through the Youth program in the two fiscal years of this report may be because this training type was a relatively new option for Youth program participants during the years in question. Local Boards may have been unfamiliar with the option, or there may have been an insufficient connection between Local Boards, local registered apprenticeship programs, and participants. Lack of prerequisite training among participants is another possibility. It is likely that the number of Youth participants who are enrolled either directly in apprenticeship, or in pre-apprenticeship programs with an occupational skills training component, has increased in the years since this data was collected. CWDB expects that the next iteration of this report may show evidence of these numbers increasing.

⁹⁴ See general information on the [DIR-DAS webpage](#). For more on theory and practice of apprenticeship, as well as research findings of gains to participants and employers., see: Damon Clark and René Fahr (2001) “The Promise of Workplace Training for Non-College-Bound Youth: Theory and Evidence from German [Apprenticeship](#).” IZA Discussion Paper No. 378. Bonn, Germany; Fersterer, Josef, Jorn-Steffen Pischke, and Rudolf Winter-Ebmer (2008) “Returns to Apprenticeship Training in Austria:Evidence from Failed Firms.” *Scandinavian Journal of Economics*. 110(4). 733-753); Deborah Reed, Albert Yung-Hsu Liu, Rebecca Kleinman, Annalisa Mastro. Davin Reed, Samina Sattar, and Jessica Zieglerl (2012)“[An Effectiveness Assessment and Cost-Benefit Analysis of Registered Apprenticeship in 10 States](#).” Washington, DC: Office of Apprenticeship, U.S. Department of Labor. Skills Initiative – Expanding apprenticeship in the U.S.—Lessons from the German Dual Education System” [Embassy of the Federal Republic of Germany).

- Finally, many participants in this report’s data were enrolled in “**Other Basic Skills Training**”—a WIA training category that includes instruction in reading comprehension, math computation, writing, speaking, listening, problem-solving, and reasoning.

For participants enrolled under WIOA, these services (delivered under the code, “Basic Skills Training”) would have been captured as a type of career—not training—service. This inconsistency in reporting between the two periods will be carefully noted throughout this section.

Small numbers of participants that appear in other training categories in Table Set 12.9.1.1 likely represent imperfect exclusions or other reporting-related issues in the data, possibly due to the changeover from WIA to WIOA. In the graphs that follow, these participants and associated categories are not shown so as to present appropriate comparisons.

California Department of Education (CDE) – Adult Education and Family Literacy Act (WIOA Title II) Program

Title II is an adult education program that addresses literacy needs of individuals by providing adults with the skills and knowledge necessary to: (a) gain employment or better their current employment; (b) obtain a high school diploma (HSD) or high school equivalency (HSE) certificate; (c) attain skills necessary to enter postsecondary education and training; (d) exit public welfare and become self-sufficient; (e) learn to speak, read, and write the English language; (f) master basic academic skills to help their children succeed in school; and (g) become U.S. citizens, exercise their civic responsibilities, and participate in a democratic society.

California Department of Rehabilitation (DOR) – WIOA Title IV Program Vocational Rehabilitation

DOR Title IV clients may participate in a variety of services, which are tailored according to their individual needs and goals as defined in the client’s Individualized Plan of Employment (IPE), the document that sets forth DOR’s responsibilities and the client’s responsibilities.

DOR acts as a direct service provider, as well as contracting (often at the county level) with external service providers to provide vocational rehabilitation and other services including skill assessment counseling and guidance; job placement services; on-the-job training; and adaptive technology to meet the needs of the individual client. Additionally, Title IV funds are used to provide ancillary services to clients enrolling in other educational or training services (for example: to cover or augment tuition or supply fees for a client enrolling in Career Technical Education (CTE) courses at a community college).

DOR also contracts with other agencies (for example, county mental health services) in order to braid resources and offer clients cooperative employment services.

The services received by an individual client will be defined in accordance with that individual’s needs and employment goals as established in their IPE.

Examples of DOR services (and, parenthetically, their CAAL-Skills service types) include but are not limited to:

- Job services/job placement (*career services*)
- Job coaching (*career services*)
- Post-employment services that facilitate continued employment and upward mobility (*supportive services*)
- Situational assessment, meaning an assessment of a client’s existing skills and abilities (*career services*)
- Work adjustment training (*training services*)
- Rehabilitation counseling/guidance and referral (*career services*)
- Fees, registration, tuition for a junior college or a four-year school paid at California state rate⁹⁵ (*training services*)⁹⁶
- On the job training arranged by DOR counselor and willing employer (*training services*)
- Assistive technology—meaning, a product (for instance, a hearing aid; a keyboard modification) used to increase, maintain, or improve functional capabilities of individuals with disabilities (*supportive services*)
- Work incentive planning (*career services*)
- As well as other, specialized programs – such as the Orientation Center for the Blind, a program serving individuals who have lost or are losing their sight, as well as youth programs.⁹⁷

Title IV participants are eligible, depending on their needs and goals as established in the Individual Plan of Employment, for a variety of training services.

In order to translate training service categories used by DOR to common CAAL-Skills values, a crosswalk was used. This crosswalk is available as an appendix to the report. The (CAAL-Skills) training service types in which CAAL-Skills participants were found to have engaged in the 14-15 and 15-16 fiscal years are summarized below, along with a brief description and/or example of their constituent DOR service categories.

- **Adult basic education or English as a second language with training:** This training category comprises tuition, courses, examinations, as well as ancillary costs (transcript and progress report provision; books and supplies; parking, and other fees) associated with a participant’s enrollment in ASE or ESL training.

⁹⁵ DOR covers the cost of college after the student has applied for financial aid. Financial aid pays a portion, and DOR covers the remainder.

⁹⁶ Certain types of services which are provided as a support to participant training (such as, books or supplies provided to facilitate primary, secondary, post-secondary, or adult education) are classified in the data for this program under the training category for which they were provided as supports (in the case of post-secondary education: as Occupational Skills Training; in the case of primary education: as Prerequisite Training; and in the case of Adult Education, as Adult Basic Education or English as a Second Language in Conjunction with Training). This means that participants captured in Training Services Only may have received such ancillary services as a support provided to their training in one of the noted categories.

⁹⁷ Only adult Title IV participants are included in data for the present report.

- **Apprenticeship training:** This category describes a Title IV participant who is enrolled in apprenticeship training.⁹⁸
- **Customized training:** In the context of Title IV, customized training includes training services that are tailored to the needs of specific employers (typically offered to Title IV clients placed in jobs with these employers).
- **On the job training:** On the job training provided to a Title IV participant
- **Other basic skills training:** this category includes various kinds of work-based learning experiences, as well as independent living training services.
- **Other occupational skills training:**⁹⁹ In the context of the Title IV program, this category describes both tuition and ancillary services (including transcripts; registration; tuition; books and supplies; etc.) provided to Title IV participants to facilitate their participation in post-secondary education (community and four-year college; graduate school) as well as secondary and adult education.
- **Prerequisite training:** Describes ancillary services (transcripts, books and supplies, tuition) as well as tutoring at secondary and primary educational levels.

⁹⁸ The DOR apprenticeship program began in 2015-16.

⁹⁹ In the fiscal years of data included in this report, support services offered to facilitate participant training were reported under the training service category for which they were offered as an ancillary support (e.g., books or supplies for post-secondary education) Because support services thus classified were necessarily provided in conjunction with training, the numbers shown in Table Set 7.4.4.1 do not represent an overcount of DOR participants enrolled in training in each fiscal year. In future years' reporting, such services are captured as supportive services.

Community College Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) – Career Technical Education (CTE) Program

Career Technical Education is defined as a sequence of courses that integrate core academic knowledge with technical and occupational knowledge in order to provide students with a pathway to both postsecondary education and careers.¹⁰⁰ CTE instruction is offered in ten priority and emerging industry sectors, as well as five major “career cluster” areas.¹⁰¹ CTE objectives include teaching academic subjects in a hands-on manner that is linked to areas of career interest. CTE courses may also emphasize instruction in soft skills, such as teamwork, time management, and communication; providing students with technical skills leading to postsecondary education or jobs; and helping the state to meet workforce goals of producing more workers trained for middle-skill careers (i.e., careers requiring training beyond high school but less than a four-year degree¹⁰²) within the next decade.¹⁰³

Employment Training Panel (ETP) – Incumbent Worker Training Program

Because ETP is an incumbent worker training program, the set of training types represented in a given fiscal year will necessarily be shaped by the composition of contracts approved within that period.

The information below provides both a general guide to training types available through/under ETP contracts/ETP-funded training types, and crosswalk with common CAAL-Skills values:

Training Types - ETP can fund a wide variety of training. The following are the standard types:¹⁰⁴

- Business Skills → (represented with CAAL-Skills value of Skill Upgrading)
- Commercial Skills → Other Basic Skills Training
- Business Skills → Skill Upgrading
- Commercial Skills → Other Basic Skills Training
- Computer Skills → Other Basic Skills Training
- Continuous Improvement Skills → Other Basic Skills Training
- Green/Clean Skills → Other Basic Skills Training
- Hazardous Materials Skills → Customized Training
- Job Readiness → Other Basic Skills Training
- Literacy Skills → Other Basic Skills Training
- Management Skills → Other Basic Skills Training

¹⁰⁰ California Department of Education. “[Career Technical Education](#).”

¹⁰¹ Legislative Analyst’s Office, “[Overview of High School Career Technical Education](#),” February 21, 2018. The areas are: Agriculture and Natural Resources; Arts, Media, and Entertainment; Building and Construction Trades; Business and Finance; Education, Child Development, and Family Services; Energy, Environment and Utilities; Engineering and Architecture; Fashion and Interior Design; Health Science and Medical Technology; Hospitality, Tourism, and Recreation; Information and Communication Technologies; Manufacturing and Product Development; Marketing, Sales, and Service; Public Services; Transportation.

¹⁰² Public Policy Institute of California. [Career Technical Education in California](#).

¹⁰³ Legislative Analyst’s Office, “Overview of High School Career Technical Education,” October 2, 2017.

¹⁰⁴ Employment Training Panel, “[Training Methods](#)”. These can vary in what is allowed based on delivery methods.

- Manufacturing Skills → Other Basic Skills Training
- Medical Skills → Customized Training
- Apprenticeship RSI → Apprenticeship Training

Some of the Training Types listed can be delivered with:

- **Advanced Technology:** Highly technical skills training customized to specific occupations that do the majority of their work on a computer or utilizing special computerized equipment. AT is approved on a case-by-case basis. Generally allowed under Commercial, Commercial, and Manufacturing training types. → Skill Upgrading
- **Safety Training:** Courses on safety topics in the general safety category or under Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA). Generally allowed under Commercial and Manufacturing training types. → Customized Training

ETP training may be delivered through a variety of methods:

- **Classroom (Class):** Formal instruction provided in a classroom setting that is removed from the trainees' usual work environment. Training is provided regularly under the direct guidance of a qualified trainer.
- **Laboratory (Lab):** Hands-on instruction or skill acquisition conducted in a non-productive environment, or simulated work setting. Training may require specialized equipment or facilities. Trainer time is dedicated exclusively to instruction of trainees.
- **Productive Laboratory (PL):** Hands-on training under the direction and supervision of a trainer dedicated exclusively to the instruction of the trainees. Training will be designed to provide trainees with the opportunity for closely supervised, on-the-job training at the work site.
- **Electronic Training (E-Learning):** Training is conducted in a virtual environment utilizing a Web-based platform (i.e., WebEx, GoTo Meeting) with designated start and end times. Training is a real-time interactive class session with an instructor. Trainees interact with instructor/students during class via computer monitor (i.e. audio, visual, or computer-generated messages).
- **Video Conference:** Distance learning provided through videoconferencing (no Web-based platform is used) with a live interactive class session and a live instructor. Trainees interact with instructor/students during class via video session (i.e., audio, visual).
- **Computer-based Training (CBT):** Training delivered through a computer program at a pace set by the trainee. There is no live trainer, and training is not interactive.

California Department of Industrial Relations (DIR), Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS) – State Certified Apprenticeship Program

State-registered apprenticeship represents collaboration of industry, an educational institution, government, and the apprentice. Within the Department of Industrial Relations (DIR), the Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS or the Division) works closely with industry to develop apprenticeship programs that train apprentices to employers' specific requirements. Apprenticeship is an opportunity for workers to learn skills necessary for a career in a chosen

field on the job, in the culture and environment of the workplace, while studying the theory behind their trade or profession. Without leaving the workforce, apprentices are trained using specifically designed classroom instruction and directly apply their newly developed skills on-the-job.¹⁰⁵

To be considered a program of apprenticeship, three criteria must be fulfilled: program design must combine classroom instruction in the skill or craft with concurrent of on-the-job training at a worksite, and apprentices must receive regular and formally scheduled wage progression as they advance.

Apprenticeship comprises a classroom instruction component and jobsite-based training component. Classroom instruction may be delivered either in a dedicated training center owned and staffed by the employer, union, or joint labor-management committee that operates the apprenticeship program, or by an educational provider (such as a community college career technical education program) that is identified under the apprenticeship agreement. Crucial to this model is trainees' status as employed, and actively advancing in their field (with concomitant pay increases) for the duration of their training.¹⁰⁶

Apprenticeship programs vary in model but all are identified by this dual "earn-and-learn" model.

A small number of individuals in each year represent participants in shorter-term trainee programs; these individuals only receive training on the job.

California Employment Development Department (EDD) – Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) Program

The program provides eligible workers with wage subsidies and income support during periods of unemployment and assists workers in obtaining employment through the use of employment and case management services, classroom and/or on-the-job training, job search assistance, and relocation allowances.

¹⁰⁵ For more on theory and practice of apprenticeship, as well as research findings of gains to participants and employers, see: Damon Clark and René Fahr (2001) "The Promise of Workplace Training for Non-College-Bound Youth: Theory and Evidence from German [Apprenticeship](#)." IZA Discussion Paper No. 378. Bonn, Germany; Fersterer, Josef, Jorn-Steffen Pischke, and Rudolf Winter-Ebmer (2008) "Returns to Apprenticeship Training in Austria: Evidence from Failed Firms." *Scandinavian Journal of Economics*. 110(4). 733-753); Deborah Reed, Albert Yung-Hsu Liu, Rebecca Kleinman, Annalisa Mastri, Davin Reed, Samina Sattar, and Jessica Zieglerl (2012) "[An Effectiveness Assessment and Cost-Benefit Analysis of Registered Apprenticeship in 10 States](#)." Washington, DC: Office of Apprenticeship, U.S. Department of Labor. Skills Initiative – Expanding apprenticeship in the U.S. – Lessons from the German Dual Education System" [Embassy of the Federal Republic of Germany).

¹⁰⁶ For a more extensive discussion of apprenticeship, see: DAS' annual reporting (most recent available [here](#)).

California Department of Social Services (CDSS) – CalWORKS Welfare to Work Program

CalWORKS provides a wide array of services and supports for families to enter and remain in the workforce. Parents and caretaker adults, unless exempt from work requirements, are required to participate in Welfare-to-Work (WTW) activities as a condition of receiving aid. WTW activities include unsubsidized and subsidized employment, work experience, on-the-job training, grant-based on-the-job training, work-study, self-employment, community service, adult basic education, job skills training, vocational education, job search/job readiness assistance, mental health counseling, substance abuse treatment, domestic abuse services, and other activities necessary to assist recipients in obtaining employment.

Supportive services, including child care, transportation, ancillary expenses, barrier mitigation, and personal counseling, are available for families participating in WTW activities. If needed supportive services needed are not available, the recipient has good cause for not participating. Special supportive services and intensive case management services are also available for pregnant and parenting teens.

F. Program-by-Program Data Notes, Guide to Program Tables, Caveats & Limitations

California Employment Development Department-Administered Programs (WIOA Title I Adult, DW, Youth, WIOA Title III, TAA):

Service Duration

Each CAAL-Skills' partner program has its own unique signature for service duration. For the WIOA Title I, Title III, and Trade Adjustment Act (TAA) administered programs the Program Entry Date is the date that the participant started in the program (i.e., their first service in any program). The Program Exit Date is the date of the last service across programs. The Exit Date can only be determined after 90 days of no service in any program. After 90 days of no service, then the Program Exit Date is backdated to the last date of service. In the data provided by EDD, all participants had both a non-NULL entry and exit date.

For example, if a participant starts receiving services on 4/1/2020, this would be their Program Entry Date. If their last service was provided on 7/1/2020, the participant would not exit until approximately 10/1/2020, but the program Exit Date would be 7/1/2020. If a participant is co-enrolled in multiple programs (Title 1, Title 3, TAA, or National Farmworker Jobs Program), the participant will not exit until 90 days have passed from the last service in ALL programs serving the participant. For example, the participant may no longer be receiving services in Title I, but since Title 1 continues to serve the participant, the participant will not have a Program Exit Date until all programs are done serving the participant.

Participant Identification

For this Dashboard, the CAAL-Skills Team grouped participant information by 4 PII fields:

- Participant First Name
- Participant Last Name
- Participant Date of Birth
- Participant SSN

Prior Dashboards grouped participants using these fields plus participant gender and zip code. The CAAL-Skills Team determined that grouping on the 6 PII fields artificially inflated participant counts and decided to use the more conservative grouping. For this reason, the participant counts in Served is generally lower than the counts in the original Dashboard.

Served Rule and Percentage

EDD service records may span several fiscal years. The logic to determine the Served fiscal year is:

1. If the DPE is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015 = Served in FY14-15.
2. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is Null = Served in FY14-15.
3. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is on or after July 1, 2014 = Served in FY14-15.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Served' in FY 15-16.

The Served Percentage calculates the percentage of each served count in relation to the total number of served.

Exited Rule and Percentage

A participant is considered as 'Exited' in FY 14-15 if the following are true:

1. Participant was classified as 'Served' in the fiscal year.
2. If the DPX is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Exited' in FY 15-16.

The Exited Percentage calculates the percentage of the exited count in relation to the total exited count.

Completed Training Population and Percentage

If a participant was served and had an exit date in the fiscal year of interest, then the participant is reported as completed training for the fiscal year.

The Completed Training Percentage calculates the percentage of the total Completed Training count for the fiscal year.

Employed Rule and Percentage

Employment is considered 2 and 4 quarters after a participant's maximum exit date for the fiscal year. The participant is considered employed if participant's SSN matches a wage record greater than \$0 in the calendar year and quarter of interest.

The Employed Percentage calculates the percentage of the employed count in relation to the exited count for the same row.

The Industry Sector Table does not follow this employed percentage rule because it lacks Exited counts. For the Industry Sector table, the Employed Percentage reflects the proportion of the employed count on each row in relation to the total employed for the fiscal year.

Wage Data

If a participant is considered employed, then wages can also be calculated. All wage records matched to a participant are summed and the total earnings is considered the participant's wages for the quarter of interest. The median wage uses the total earnings for all participants in the row.

Attained Credential

The population of participants that attained credentials is always a sub-set of the population that was exited. The attained credentials field is stored in a separate data file with participant ID, application ID, credential ID, and date of attained credential. The date for attained credential can have a NULL value. If an identified participant has a record in the attained credential data file and the date field is between the start and four quarters after the

participant exited, then the participant is marked as attaining credential for the fiscal year.

The Attained Credential Percentage calculates the percentage of the attained credentials count in relation to the Exited count for the same row except for Type of Recognized Credential table. For the Type of Recognized Credential table, the Attained Credential Percentage reflects the proportion of attained credential count on each row in relation to the total attained credential count for the fiscal year.

TABLES

Dashboard Tables Share the Same Rules

All Dashboard tables use the standard rules for Served, Exited, Completed training, and Employed to obtain the participant populations. The Program Performance Table is developed first and subsequent Dashboard tables are broken down into subgroups within each column.

The rules listed above are used to derive these populations from the raw data, and that each population is derived from the prior population in the chain:

Raw Population → Served in Fiscal Year → Exited in Fiscal Year → Employed n quarters after Exit

The Program Performance Dashboard is the simplest dashboard because it counts and reports the total population count for 'Served', 'Exited', and the 'Employed' groups for the four combinations of the fiscal year and quarter. Other dashboard tables group the participants using an additional attribute such as gender, ethnicity, age group, industry sector, etc.

With few exceptions, all of these dashboards must produce matching populations of 'Served,' 'Exited' and 'Employed.' For this reason, once the Program Performance Dashboard has been developed and validated, it becomes the template for all other dashboard, and its population counts become the benchmark used to validate the totals on all other dashboards.

The below sub-sections describe the unique grouping each dashboard uses, as well as logic specific to that dashboard table.

Program Performance

The Program Performance Dashboard implements the standard rules for 'Served,' 'Exited,' 'Employed,' 'Median Wages,' 'Completed Training,' and 'Attained Credential.' There are no other categorizations or rules that apply.

Participant Ethnicity

In the reporting system utilized for the WIOA Title I, Title III, and TAA programs, participant's ethnicity (Hispanic vs. non-Hispanic origin) are collected in a separate question from the same participant's racial identification.

- If a participant has the value 'Hispanic/Latino,' the participant will be reported as 'Hispanic/Latino.'
- If a participant does not have the value 'Hispanic/Latino' and a value other than 'Did not self-identify,' then the participant is reported as 'Not Hispanic/Latino.'
- If a participant has the value 'Did not self-identify,' the participant is reported as 'Did not self-identify.'

Participant Race

Race reporting for WIOA programs adheres to Office of Management and Budget guidelines with the following race options:

- Asian
- African-American or Black
- Native American or Alaskan Native
- Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander
- White

If a participant selected multiple race categories, then the participant was reported in the race categories selected. If a participant has the value 'Did not self-identify,' or has the value 'Hispanic/Latino' and did not select a race, the participant is reported as 'Did not self-identify.' Otherwise, the participant is reported as the single race they selected.

Since a participant could identify with multiple race categories, count totals sum to more than each fiscal year's total participants.

Percent shares are calculated using the fiscal year total participants as the denominator.

Gender

The Gender Dashboard groups participants by sex/gender (SEX, DED #014) values: 'Male,' 'Female,' or did not respond to the question. Participants who did not provide a gender are counted under the category 'Unknown,' but there were no participants in this category for Title I programs. If multiple genders were associated with the participant, the gender from the latest record was used for the table.

Age Group at Entry

The Age Group at Entry Dashboard calculates the age of each participant at the time they entered service in the given fiscal year with the participant's birthdate (DOB, DED #013). It then groups these ages in the following buckets:

- Under 25
- 25-54
- 55 and Older
- Unknown

Veteran Status

The Veteran Status Dashboard groups the participants by the veteran status values (VET, DED #018): 'Yes,' 'No,' and 'Not Applicable.' The Veteran Status field contains only the values 0 ('No') and 1 ('Yes'). The Veteran Status Dashboard counts each participant once and when a participant has more than one Veteran Status value, the dashboard reports them under the maximum value. Therefore when a participant reports both 0 and 1 values for veteran status, the dashboard counts them under value 1.

Training Completion Status

The Training Completion Status Dashboard counts the participants on whether or not they completed their training within the fiscal year. Those that completed were counted under the 'Yes' category, those that did not complete their training were counted under the 'No' category. All participants were counted under Yes or No, none were counted under 'Other,' 'Not Applicable,' and 'Unknown.'

Type of Recognized Credential

Type of Recognized Credential groups participants by their credential type (TRC, DED #063) values. Credential type values correspond to the following credential descriptions:

-1 = NULL

0 = No Recognized Credential

1 = High School Diploma or Equivalency

2 = Associate's Degree

3 = Bachelor's Degree

4 = Post-Graduate Degree

5 = Occupational Skills License

6 = Occupational Skills Certificate

7 = Occupational Certification

8 = Other Recognized Diploma, Degree, or Certificate

If a participant had multiple values for credential type, then the participant was assigned to the 'More than One Type of Recognized Credential' category.

Industry Sector

The Industry Sector Dashboard groups participants by the first two digits of the North American Industry Classification System (NAICS) code (ISC, DED #074) in which they have earned wages 2 and 4 quarters after exiting the program. It omits the 'Served' and 'Exited' counts, because participants cannot be grouped by industry/sector without determining their wages, a step that is part of the 'Employed' rule, but not part of the 'Served' or 'Exited' rule.

If a participant worked in multiple industry sectors during the reporting period, their total wages from all industry sectors are reported under the industry sector in which they showed the largest earnings and that industry/sector could be 'Unknown.'

The industry descriptions were found on the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) website and

NAICS webpage on the census.gov website and may undergo periodic updates.

Quarterly Earnings

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard operates on the Exited population. It finds the maximum exit date for each participant and matches them to the wage table to find earnings 2 and 4 quarters after exit.

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard shows four earnings statistics, one row each for 2 quarters and 4 quarters after exit:

- **Minimum Earnings:** The minimum earnings among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Lower Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 25% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Median Earnings:** The middle value in the entire list of participant earnings totals.
- **Upper Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 75% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Maximum Earnings:** The maximum earnings are calculated with the following rules, IF the true maximum earnings value is greater than the Upper Quartile+(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile), THEN display Upper Quartile +1.5 (Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile).

Outliers: Individual values which fall far below or above the middle 50% of participant earnings and do not represent the trend of the data—have been excluded from display.

California Department of Education (CDE) – Adult Education and Family Literacy Act (WIOA Title II) Program

Served Rule: Missing SSNs

92% of the CDE participant records lack an SSN. CDE provides value '99' for SSN in these records to indicate they lack a value. CAAL-Skills is unable to look-up and match wages for participants lacking SSN, so the CAAL-Skills Team looked-up the CDE participants in other programs to fill in missing SSN. CAAL Skills preserved the original SSN value in a field named Participant_SSN_Original and updated the Participants' value with the SSN value from the matching record. This filled in SSN values for approximately 300,000 participants.

Served Rule: Justice Involved Data Exclusion

The Justice Involved Data Exclusion rule acknowledges that CDE programs include participants taking adult courses while incarcerated. The rule allows justice-involved participants to be included in the Served participant counts but excludes them from all other Dashboard counts. The rule is implemented by filtering justice-involved participants out of the Exited population, which feeds all other populations, except Served, from which Exited is derived.

The rule excludes participants receiving training from CDCR and County Jails. The list of providers is excluded from the Exited and subordinate population counts on the Dashboard can

be found in the workbook on the tab, CDCR-Jail Providers.

Served Rule: 366-Day Service

In the prior version of the CDE Dashboard, before calculating the Served fiscal year(s) for each service record, there was a rule that looked for service records that span longer than one fiscal year. In reality, these services take place within a single fiscal year, but the local agency providing the service frequently lists the first day of the next fiscal year as the exit date. To align service records with fiscal years, records were detected and changed so the exit date is the last day of the fiscal year (6/30/xx) instead of the first day of the next fiscal year (7/1).

One way of implementing this rule is to count the number of days between the program entry and exit dates and subtracting one day from the exit day when the duration is > 364. However, upon further consideration, this logic didn't work for FY 15-16 because 2016 was a leap year and contained an extra day. Therefore, the rule was changed to the following:

```
IF [program entry year]=[program exit year]-1
AND [program_entry_month]=7
AND [program_exit_month]=7
AND [program_exit_day]=1
AND [program_entry_day]=1
THEN Subtract 1 Day From [program_exit_date]
```

Served Rule: Calculate Served Fiscal Year

All CDE service records occur within a single fiscal year. Therefore they all have a single fiscal year value for 'Served.' This is in contrast to other programs like DAS, whose service records frequently span multiple fiscal years. The logic to determine the Served fiscal year is:

1. Use shifted exit date from 366-day rule.
2. If the DPE is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015 = Served in FY 14-15.
3. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is Null = Served in FY 14-15.
4. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is on or after July 1, 2014 = Served in FY 14-15

Served Rule: Served Percentage

The Served Percentage calculates the percentage of each served count in relation to the total number of served.

Exited Rule and Percentage

A participant is considered as 'Exited' in FY 14-15 if the following are true:

1. Participant was classified as 'Served' in the fiscal year.
2. If the DPX is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Exited' in FY 15-16.

The Exited Percentage calculates the percentage of the exited count in relation to the total

exited count.

Completed Training Population and Percentage

These outcomes are not available for the CDE Dashboard.

Employed Rule and Percentage

Employment is considered 2 and 4 quarters after a participant's maximum exit date for the fiscal year. The participant is considered employed if participant's SSN matches a wage record greater than \$0.

The Employed Percentage calculates the percentage of the employed count in relation to the exited count for the same row. The Industry Sector Table does not follow this employed percentage rule because it lacks Exited counts. For the Industry Sector table, the Employed Percentage reflects the proportion of the employed count on each row in relation the total employed for the fiscal year.

Wage Data

If a participant is considered employed, then wages can also be calculated. All wage records matched to a participant are summed and the total earnings is considered the participant's wages for the quarter of interest. The median wage uses the total earnings for all participants in the row.

Attained Credential

A participant is counted as 'Attained Credential' if they served and exited in the fiscal year, and attained a credential any time between their exit date through 4 quarters after that date. CDE provides a column (attained_recognized_credential_dt) that is compared with the date range representing the date the participant exited the program and the date representing 4 quarters after that exit.

The Attained Credential Percentage calculates the percentage of the attained credentials count in relation to the Exited count for the same row. The Type of Recognized Credential table does not follow this attained credential percentage calculation. For the Type of Recognized Credential table, the Attained Credential Percentage reflects the proportion of attained credential count on each row in relation to the total attained credential count for the fiscal year.

TABLES

Dashboard Tables Share the Same Rules

All Dashboard tables use the standard rules for Served, Exited, Completed training, Employed and Attained Credential to obtain the participant populations. The Program Performance Table is developed first and subsequent Dashboard tables are broken down into subgroups within each column.

The rules listed above are used to derive these populations from the raw data, and that each

population is derived from the prior population in the chain:

Raw Population → Served in Fiscal Year → Exited in Fiscal Year → Employed in quarters after Exit

The Program Performance Dashboard is the simplest dashboard because it counts and reports the total population count for 'Served', 'Exited' and the 'Employed' groups for the four combinations of the fiscal year and quarter. Other dashboard tables group the participants using an additional attribute such as gender, ethnicity, age group, industry sector, etc.

With few exceptions, all of these dashboards must produce matching populations of 'Served,' 'Exited,' and 'Employed.' For this reason, once the Program Performance Dashboard has been developed and validated, it becomes the template for all other dashboard, and its population counts become the benchmark used to validate the totals on all other dashboards.

The below sub-sections describe the unique grouping each dashboard uses, as well as logic specific to that dashboard table.

Program Performance

The Program Performance Dashboard implements the standard rules for 'Served,' 'Exited,' 'Employed,' 'Median Wages', and 'Attained Credential.' There are no other categorizations or rules that apply.

Participant Ethnicity – Race

The Ethnicity/Race Dashboard groups participants by the ethnicity/race as participants reported to CDE. A participant can report more than one ethnicity/race within a fiscal year. In this scenario, the participant will be counted in a group named 'Two or More Races.' Participants may fail to report any ethnicity/race and in this scenario, the participant is classified as 'Participant did not self-identify.'

Gender

The Gender Dashboard groups participants by sex/gender (SEX, DED #014) values: 'Male,' 'Female,' or did not respond to the question. Participants who did not provide a gender are counted under the category 'Unknown or Not Provided.'

Age Group at Entry

The Age Group at Entry Dashboard calculates the age of each participant at the earliest time of program entry (DPE, DED #051) in the fiscal year with the participant birthdate (DOB, DED #013). It then groups these ages in the following buckets:

- Under 25
- 25-54
- 55 and Older
- Unknown

Participants counted in the Unknown category would presumably lack a date of birth. However, in the current collection of CDE data, all participants have dates of birth values.

Veteran Status

The Veteran Status Dashboard groups the participants by the veteran status values (VET, DED #018): 'Yes,' 'No,' and 'Not Applicable.' The Veteran Status field contains only the values 0 ('No') and 1 ('Yes'). The Veteran Status Dashboard counts each participant once and when a participant has more than one Veteran Status value, the dashboard reports them under the maximum value. Therefore when a participant reports both 0 and 1 values for veteran status, the dashboard counts them under value 1. There are no null or other values in the CDE data.

Training Completion Status

CDE began collecting training completion status after the period covered in this report. Consequently, 100% of exiting participants were classified as having received an unknown type of service at the time of exit.

Type of Recognized Credential

The Type of Recognized Credential Dashboard uses a single column to determine the credential each participant earned during the given fiscal year. This column, Credential_Type_ID, contains the following values:

- 1 = 'Unknown'
- 1 = 'High School Diploma or Equivalency'
- 8 = 'Other Recognized Diploma, Degree, or Certificate'

Participants with both values 1 and 8 are counted in the group 'More Than One Type of Recognized Credential' and will be considered as attained credential if there is at least one valid attained credential date. Per CASAS, the user cannot select the option 'No recognized credential.'

As explained in the Attained Credential Rule above, this table does not follow the standard attained credential percentage calculation. For the Type of Recognized Credential table, the Attained Credential Percentage reflects the proportion of attained credential count on each row in relation to the total attained credential count for the fiscal year.

Industry Sector

The Industry Sector Dashboard groups participants by the first two digits of the NAICS code (ISC, DED #074) in which they have earned wages 2 and 4 quarters after exiting the program. It omits the 'Served' and 'Exited' counts because participants cannot be grouped by industry/sector without determining their wages, a step that is part of the 'Employed' rule but not part of the 'Served' or 'Exited' rule.

If a participant worked in multiple industry sectors during the reporting period, their total wages from all industry sectors are reported under the industry sector in which they showed the largest earnings, and that industry/sector could be 'Unknown.'

The industry descriptions were found on the BLS web site and NAICS webpage on the census.gov website and may undergo periodic updates.

Quarterly Earnings

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard operates on the Exited population. It finds the maximum exit date for each participant and matches them to the wage table to find earnings 2 and 4 quarters after exit.

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard shows four earnings statistics, one row each for 2 quarters and 4 quarters after exit:

- **Minimum Earnings:** The minimum earnings among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Lower Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 25% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Median Earnings:** The middle value in the entire list of participant earnings totals.
- **Upper Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 75% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Maximum Earnings:** The maximum earnings are calculated with the following rules, IF the true maximum earnings value is greater than the Upper Quartile+(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile), THEN display Upper Quartile +1.5(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile).

Outliers—individual values which fall far below or above the middle 50% of participant earnings and do not represent the trend of the data—have been excluded from display.

California Department of Rehabilitation (DOR) – Vocational Rehabilitation (WIOA Title IV) Program – Adults

DOR Service Duration

The Department of Rehabilitation provides very lengthy service compared to many other CAAL-Skills programs. The duration of the service records in the data DOR provided ranges from 1 day to almost 26 years. This simply means that the same service record may be counted among the served participants in many fiscal years. But, of course, each service record will be counted as exited in, at most, one fiscal year.

Fill-in Missing Program Entry Dates

Approximately 39,000 participants lack a program entry date in the DOR dataset. CAAL-Skills filled in these missing entry dates by substituting the exit date minus one day when an exit date exists. Program entry dates were filled-in for 32,396 participants.

Youth Exclusion

Participants under the age of 18 at the date of program entry have been excluded.

Served Rule and Percentage

The logic to determine the Served fiscal year is:

1. If the DPE is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015 = Served in FY14-15
2. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is Null = Served in FY14-15
3. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is on or after July 1, 2014 = Served in FY14-15

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Served' in FY 15-16.

The Served Percentage calculates the percentage of each served count in relation to the total number of served.

Exited Rule and Percentage

A participant is considered as 'Exited' in FY 14-15 if the following are true:

1. Participant was classified as 'Served' in the fiscal year
2. If the DPX is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Exited' in FY 15-16.

The Exited Percentage calculates the percentage of the exited count in relation to the total exited count.

Completed Training Population and Percentage

DOR does not collect training completion data and did not start collecting recognized credential data until FY 17-18. Due to missing or incomplete training completion and credential information, the Completed Training columns are populated with 'Not Available.'

Employed Rule and Percentage

Employment is considered 2 and 4 quarters after a participant's maximum exit date for the fiscal year. The participant is considered employed if participant's SSN matches a wage record greater than \$0.

The Employed Percentage calculates the percentage of the employed count in relation to the exited count for the same row. The Industry Sector Table does not follow this employed percentage rule because it lacks Exited counts. For the Industry Sector table, the Employed Percentage reflects the proportion of the employed count on each row in relation to the total employed for the fiscal year.

Wage Data

If a participant is considered employed, then wages can also be calculated. All wage records matched to a participant are summed and the total earnings is considered the participant's wages for the quarter of interest. The median wage uses the total earnings for all participants in the row.

Attained Credential

DOR does not issue recognized credentials for the training received. Therefore, all Dashboards indicate 'Not Available' for the Attained Credential (through 4 quarters after exit) columns.

TABLES

Dashboard Tables Share the Same Rules

All Dashboard tables use the standard rules for Served, Exited, Completed training, Employed and Attained Credential to obtain the participant populations. The Program Performance Table is developed first and subsequent Dashboard tables are broken down into subgroups within each column.

The rules listed above are used to derive these populations from the raw data, and that each population is derived from the prior population in the chain:

Raw Population → Served in Fiscal Year → Exited in Fiscal Year → Employed n quarters after Exit

The Program Performance Dashboard is the simplest dashboard because it counts and reports the total population count for 'Served,' 'Exited' and the 'Employed' groups for the four combinations of fiscal year and quarter. Other dashboard tables group the participants using an additional attribute such as gender, ethnicity, age group, industry sector, etc.

With few exceptions, all of these dashboards must produce matching populations of 'Served,' 'Exited' and 'Employed.' For this reason, once the Program Performance Dashboard has been developed and validated, it becomes the template for all other dashboard, and its population counts become the benchmark used to validate the totals on all other dashboards.

The below sub-sections describe the unique grouping each dashboard uses, as well as logic specific to that dashboard table.

Program Performance

The Program Performance Dashboard implements the standard rules for 'Served,' 'Exited,' 'Employed,' 'Median Wages', and 'Attained Credential.' There are no other categorizations or rules that apply.

Participant Ethnicity – Race

The Ethnicity/Race Dashboard groups participants by the ethnicity/race as participants reported to DOR. A participant can be report more than on ethnicity/race within a fiscal year. In this scenario, the participant will be counted in a group named 'More than One Ethnicity.' Participants may fail to report any ethnicity/race, and in this scenario, the participant is classified as 'Unknown.'

Race – As Reported

DOR provided detailed ethnicity-race descriptions that were aggregated into groups on the Ethnicity-Race Dashboard. The Race - As Reported Dashboard groups and counts participants by these values.

Gender

The Gender Dashboard groups participants by sex/gender (SEX, DED #014) values: 'Male,' 'Female,' or did not respond to the question. Participants who did not provide a gender are counted under the category 'Unknown or Not Provided.'

Age Group at Entry

The Age Group at Entry Dashboard calculates the age of each participant at the earliest time of program entry (DPE, DED #051) in the fiscal year with the participant birthdate (DOB, DED #013). It then groups these ages in the following buckets:

- Under 25
- 25-54
- 55 and Older
- Unknown

Participants counted in the Unknown category would presumably lack a date of birth, but all participants provided a date of birth.

Veteran Status

The Veteran Status Dashboard counts each participant once and when a participant has more than one Veteran Status value, the dashboard reports them under the maximum value.

Therefore when a participant reports both 0 and 1 values for veteran status, the dashboard counts them under value 1.

Training Completion Status

DOR does not collect training completion data. Therefore the Training Completion Status Dashboard repeats the Program Performance totals in the Unknown category.

Type of Recognized Credential

DOR started collecting credential attainment data in FY1718. Therefore the FY1415 and FY1516 dashboards repeat the Program Performance totals in the 'Unknown' category.

Industry Sector

The Industry Sector Dashboard groups participants by the first two digits of the NAICS code (ISC, DED #074) in which they have earned wages 2 and 4 quarters after exiting the program. It omits the 'Served' and 'Exited' counts because participants cannot be grouped by industry/sector without determining their wages, a step that is part of the 'Employed' rule but not part of the 'Served' or 'Exited' rule.

If a participant worked in multiple industry sectors during the reporting period, their total

wages from all industry sectors are reported under the industry sector in which they showed the largest earnings and that industry/sector could be 'Unknown.'

The industry descriptions were found on the BLS website and NAICS webpage on the census.gov website and may undergo periodic updates.

Quarterly Earnings

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard operates on the Exited population. It finds the maximum exit date for each participant and matches them to the wage table to find earnings 2 and 4 quarters after exit.

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard shows four earnings statistics, one row each for 2 quarters and 4 quarters after exit:

- **Minimum Earnings:** The minimum earnings among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Lower Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 25% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Median Earnings:** The middle value in the entire list of participant earnings totals.
- **Upper Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 75% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Maximum Earnings:** The maximum earnings are calculated with the following rules, IF the true maximum earnings value is greater than the Upper Quartile+(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile), THEN display Upper Quartile+1.5 (Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile).

Outliers: Individual values which fall far below or above the middle 50% of participant earnings and do not represent the trend of the data—have been excluded from display.

Community College Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) – Career Technical Education (CTE) Program

Service Duration

Each CAAL-Skills' partner program has its own unique signature for service duration. CCCCCO provides entry/exit timeframes in the form of school semesters like 'SPRING YYYY,' 'SUMMER YYYY,' 'FALL YYYY' and 'WINTER YYYY,' where YYYY is the semester year. These were converted to fully-formed start and end dates representing the exact days the semesters started and ended.

CCCCO services span up to 5 years. This means that the same participant can be counted as Served in multiple fiscal years. However, a single service record will only be counted as exited in the fiscal year when the service ended.

Participant Identification

For this CCCCCO Dashboard, the CAAL-Skills Team grouped participant information by 4 PII fields:

- Participant First Name
- Participant Last Name

- Participant Date of Birth
- Participant SSN

Prior CCCCCO Dashboards grouped participants using these fields plus participant gender and zip code. The CAAL-Skills Team determined that grouping on the 6 PII fields artificially inflated participant counts and decided to use the more conservative grouping. For this reason, the participant counts in Served is generally lower than the counts in the original CCCCCO Dashboard.

As in the prior tables, only the CTE participants were counted. The CAAL-Skills Team limited the participants to those who received services where the training occupational code value is 'A,' 'B' or 'C.'

Served Rule and Percentage

CCCCCO service records may span several fiscal years. The logic to determine the Served fiscal year is:

1. If the DPE is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015 = Served in FY14-15.
2. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is Null = Served in FY14-15.
3. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is on or after July 1, 2014 = Served in FY14-15.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Served' in FY 15-16.

The Served Percentage calculates the percentage of each served count in relation to the total number of served.

Exited Rule and Percentage

A participant is considered as 'Exited' in FY 14-15 if the following are true:

1. Participant was classified as 'Served' in the fiscal year.
2. If the DPX is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015.
3. Participant did not return, transfer, or enroll in a CA community college for at least one (1) year.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Exited' in FY 15-16.

The Exited Percentage calculates the percentage of the exited count in relation to the total exited count.

Completed Training Population and Percentage

CCCCCO doesn't provide a completion status value but provides the date the participant attained a credential. The instructions say to classify participants with a date as 'Completed' and those lacking a date as 'Not Completed.'

The Completed Training Percentage calculates the percentage of the completed training count in relation to the exited count.

Employed Rule and Percentage

Employment is considered 2 and 4 quarters after a participant's maximum exit date for the fiscal year. The participant is considered employed if the participant's SSN matches a wage record greater than \$0 in the calendar year and quarter of interest.

The Employed Percentage calculates the percentage of the employed count in relation to the exited count for the same row.

The Industry Sector Table does not follow this employed percentage rule because it lacks Exited counts. For the Industry Sector table, the Employed Percentage reflects the proportion of the employed count on each row in relation to the total employed for the fiscal year.

Wage Data

If a participant is considered employed, then wages can also be calculated. All wage records matched to a participant are summed and the total earnings are considered the participant's wages for the quarter of interest. The median wage uses the total earnings for all participants in the row.

Attained Credential

Most of the dashboards include a column labeled '# Attained Credential,' listing the count of participants who obtained a certificate or some other credential when they completed their training. It is always positioned as one of the columns in the Q4 section of the dashboard for both fiscal years.

To populate this column, the dashboard queries count a participant as 'Attained Credential' if they served and exited in the fiscal year, and attained a credential any time between their exit date through 4 quarters after that date.

The Attained Credential Percentage calculates the percentage of the attained credentials count in relation to the Exited count for the same row except for the Type of Recognized Credential table. For the Type of Recognized Credential table, the Attained Credential Percentage reflects the proportion of attained credential count on each row in relation to the total attained credential count for the fiscal year.

TABLES

Dashboard Tables Share the Same Rules

All Dashboard tables use the standard rules for Served, Exited, Completed training, and Employed to obtain the participant populations. The Program Performance Table is developed first and subsequent Dashboard tables are broken down into subgroups within each column.

The rules listed above are used to derive these populations from the raw data, and that each population is derived from the prior population in the chain:

Raw Population → Served in Fiscal Year → Exited in Fiscal Year → Employed n quarters after Exit

The Program Performance Dashboard is the simplest dashboard because it counts and reports the total population count for 'Served,' 'Exited' and the 'Employed' groups for the four combinations of fiscal year and quarter. Other dashboard tables group the participants using an additional attribute such as gender, ethnicity, age group, industry sector, etc.

With few exceptions, all of these dashboards must produce matching populations of 'Served,' 'Exited' and 'Employed.' For this reason, once the Program Performance Dashboard has been developed and validated, it becomes the template for all other dashboard, and its population counts become the benchmark used to validate the totals on all other dashboards.

The below sub-sections describe the unique grouping each dashboard uses, as well as logic specific to that dashboard table.

Program Performance

The Program Performance Dashboard implements the standard rules for 'Served,' 'Exited,' 'Employed,' 'Median Wages', and 'Attained Credential.' There are no other categorizations or rules that apply.

Participant Ethnicity

The Ethnicity Dashboard groups participants by whether or not they reported as members of the Hispanic ethnicity, non-Hispanic, or Unknown.

Participant Race

The CCCCO's system for reporting participants' ethnic and racial identifications allows both for the reporting of participant Hispanic/Latino or non-Hispanic/Latino status, and participant selection in a subsequent question of one or more of 20 racial and ethnic categories.

Of these 20 racial options, three directly match with OMB categories: Black or African-American; White; and American Indian or Alaskan Native.

Racial sub-categories were collapsed and a participant selecting a sub-category would be counted in the overall category. Please see the sheet **Race Xwalk** for how the sub-categories were grouped ([see Appendix C above](#)).

Race – As Reported

CCCO provides a 21-character ethnicity field, where each position indicates a different race. The Disaggregated Race Dashboard uses these detailed values to group participants according to their declared, detailed race designation. In a few cases, a participant reported up to two races

in the same fiscal year. In these instances, the Dashboard uses the first race they reported. Out of 942,633 served participants in fiscal year 1415, 273 participants reported more than one race. Please see the sheet **Race Xwalk** for the position of each race category ([see Appendix C above](#)).

Gender

The Gender Dashboard groups participants by sex/gender (SEX, DED #014) values: 'Male,' 'Female,' or did not respond to the question. Participants who did not provide a gender are counted under the category 'Unknown.'

Age Group at Entry

The Age Group at Entry Dashboard calculates the age of each participant at the time they entered service in the given fiscal year with the participant birthdate (DOB, DED #013). It then groups these ages in the following buckets:

- Under 25
- 25-54
- 55 and Older
- Unknown

Veteran Status

The Veteran Status Dashboard groups the participants by the veteran status values (VET, DED #018): 'Yes,' 'No,' and 'Not Applicable.' The Veteran Status field contains only the values 0 ('No') and 1 ('Yes'). The Veteran Status Dashboard counts each participant once and when a participant has more than one Veteran Status value, the dashboard reports them under the maximum value. Therefore when a participant reports both 0 and 1 values for veteran status, the dashboard counts them under value 1.

Training Completion Status

The Training Completion Status Dashboard counts the participants on whether or not they completed their CCCCCO training within the fiscal year. Those that completed are counted under the 'Yes' category, those that did not complete their training were counted under the 'No' category. All participants were counted under Yes or No, none were counted under 'Other,' 'Not Applicable' and 'Unknown.'

Type of Recognized Credential

The Type of Recognized Credential Dashboard counts participants based on the Credential Type CCCCCO associated with their education. This populated five categories out of the 14 available categories.

Industry Sector

The Industry Sector Dashboard groups participants by the first two digits of the NAICS code (ISC, DED #074) in which they have earned wages 2 and 4 quarters after exiting the program. It omits the 'Served' and 'Exited' counts, because participants cannot be grouped by industry/sector without determining their wages, a step that is part of the 'Employed' rule, but

not part of the 'Served' or 'Exited' rule.

If a participant worked in multiple industry sectors during the reporting period, their total wages from all industry sectors are reported under the industry sector in which they showed the largest earnings and that industry/sector could be 'Unknown.'

The industry descriptions were found on the BLS website and NAICS webpage on the census.gov website and may undergo periodic updates.

Quarterly Earnings

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard operates on the Exited population. It finds the maximum exit date for each participant and matches them to the wage table to find earnings 2 and 4 quarters after exit.

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard shows four earnings statistics, one row each for 2 quarters and 4 quarters after exit:

- **Minimum Earnings:** The minimum earnings among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Lower Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 25% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Median Earnings:** The middle value in the entire list of participant earnings totals.
- **Upper Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 75% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Maximum Earnings:** The maximum earnings are calculated with the following rules, IF the true maximum earnings value is greater than the Upper Quartile+(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile), THEN display Upper Quartile+1.5(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile).

Outliers: Individual values which fall far below or above the middle 50% of participant earnings and do not represent the trend of the data—have been excluded from display.

Employment Training Panel (ETP) – Incumbent Worker Training Program

Service Duration

Each CAAL-Skills' partner program has its own unique signature for service duration. Some programs provide service strictly within a single fiscal year; others, like ETP, frequently span more than one fiscal year. Specifically, ETP data demonstrates up to 640 days of service in a single service record. This means some ETP service records will have multiple Served fiscal years. This is an important aspect to take into account when writing ETP queries that count 'Served' participants. If the service entry date occurs in the middle of a fiscal year and has a maximum duration of 640 days, it could be counted in up to two fiscal years.

Data Issue: No Date of Birth Available

ETP provided the value '99' in place of all participant's dates of birth, indicating they lack the data. In order to produce the Age Group at Entry Dashboard, CAAL-Skills harvested dates of

birth values from participant records provided by other programs. CAAL-Skills was able to fill in dates of birth for 86,830 participants, which represents only 18% of the total population. The Age Group at Entry Dashboard will be affected by this data issue as only a subset of the participants are represented therein.

Served Rule and Percentage

ETP service records may span up to two fiscal years. The logic to determine the Served fiscal year is:

1. If the DPE is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015 = Served in FY14-15.
2. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is Null = Served in FY14-15.
3. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is on or after July 1, 2014 = Served in FY14-15.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Served' in FY 15-16.

The Served Percentage calculates the percentage of each served count in relation to the total number of served.

Exited Rule and Percentage

A participant is considered as 'Exited' in FY 14-15 if the following are true:

1. Participant was classified as 'Served' in the fiscal year.
2. If the DPX is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Exited' in FY 15-16.

The Exited Percentage calculates the percentage of the exited count in relation to the total exited count.

Completed Training Population and Percentage

1. Select only participants classified as "Exited" in the fiscal year.
2. If Training Completion Status=1 and Training Completion Status Date is within the exited fiscal year, then the participant is counted as 'Completed Training'.

The Completed Training Percentage calculates the percentage of the completed training count in relation to the total number of completed training.

Employed Rule and Percentage

Employment is considered 2 and 4 quarter after a participant's maximum exit date for the fiscal year. The participant is considered employed if participant's SSN matches a wage record greater than \$0 in the calendar year and quarter of interest.

The Employed Percentage calculates the percentage of the employed count in relation to the exited count for the same row.

The Industry Sector Table does not follow this employed percentage rule because it lacks Exited counts. For the Industry Sector table, the Employed Percentage reflects the proportion of the employed count on each row in relation the total employed for the fiscal year.

Wage Data

If a participant is considered employed, then wages can also be calculated. All wage records matched to a participant are summed and the total earnings is considered the participant's wages for the quarter of interest. The median wage uses the total earnings for all participants in the row.

Attained Credential

ETP does not issue recognized credentials for the training received. Therefore, all the Dashboards indicate 'Not Available' for the 'Attained Credential' columns.

TABLES

Dashboard Tables Share the Same Rules

All Dashboard tables use the standard rules for Served, Exited, Completed training, and Employed to obtain the participant populations. The Program Performance Table is developed first and subsequent Dashboard tables are broken down into subgroups within each column.

The rules listed above are used to derive these populations from the raw data, and that each population is derived from the prior population in the chain:

Raw Population → Served in Fiscal Year → Exited in Fiscal Year → Employed n quarters after Exit

The Program Performance Dashboard is the simplest dashboard because it counts and reports the total population count for 'Served', 'Exited' and the 'Employed' groups for the four combinations of fiscal year and quarter. Other dashboard tables group the participants using an additional attribute such as gender, ethnicity, age group, industry sector, etc.

With few exceptions, all of these dashboards must produce matching populations of 'Served,' 'Exited' and 'Employed.' For this reason, once the Program Performance Dashboard has been developed and validated, it becomes the template for all other dashboard, and its population counts become the benchmark used to validate the totals on all other dashboards.

The below sub-sections describe the unique grouping each dashboard uses, as well as logic specific to that dashboard table.

Program Performance

The Program Performance Dashboard implements the standard rules for 'Served,' 'Exited,' 'Employed,' 'Median Wages', and 'Attained Credential.' There are no other categorizations or rules that apply.

Participant Ethnicity – Race

The Ethnicity/Race Dashboard groups participants by the ethnicity/race they reported to CDE. Sometimes, a participant will report more than one ethnicity/race within a fiscal year. In this scenario, the participant will be counted in a group named 'More than One Ethnicity.' There were no participants who failed to report at least one ethnicity/race.

Race – As Reported

The ethnicity-race values ETP provided also included the category 'Filipino.' The Race - As Reported table disaggregates these values from the category 'Asian.'

Gender

The Gender Dashboard groups participants by sex/gender (SEX, DED #014) values: 'Male,' 'Female,' or did not respond to the question. Participants who did not provide a gender are counted under the category 'Unknown.'

Age Group at Entry

The Age Group at Entry Dashboard calculates the age of each participant at the time they entered service in the given fiscal year with the participant birthdate (DOB, DED #013). It then groups these ages in the following buckets:

- Under 25
- 25-54
- 55 and Older
- Unknown

As mentioned in the section 'Data Issue: No Dates of Birth Available', only 18% of the participant records have a birth date filled in. Therefore, the largest count will be found in the 'Unknown' category.

Veteran Status

The Veteran Status Dashboard groups the participants by the veteran status values (VET, DED #018): 'Yes,' 'No,' and 'Not Applicable.' The Veteran Status field contains only the values 0 ('No') and 1 ('Yes'). The Veteran Status Dashboard counts each participant once and when a participant has more than one Veteran Status value, the dashboard reports them under the maximum value. Therefore when a participant reports both 0 and 1 values for veteran status, the dashboard counts them under value 1. There are no null or other values in the ETP data.

Training Completion Status

Training Completion Status is provided as a true/false field. When a participant has both true and false values, the true value is recorded. These correspond to Yes and No categories on the Training Completion Status Dashboard.

Type of Recognized Credential

ETP does not issue credentials at the conclusion of their training. For this reason, the Type of Recognized Credential Dashboard simply repeats the all Program Performance numbers under the category 'Not Applicable.'

Industry Sector

The Industry Sector Dashboard groups participants by the first two digits of the NAICS code (ISC, DED #074) in which they have earned wages 2 and 4 quarters after exiting the program. It omits the 'Served' and 'Exited' counts, because participants cannot be grouped by industry/sector without determining their wages, a step that is part of the 'Employed' rule, but not part of the 'Served' or 'Exited' rule.

If a participant worked in multiple industry sectors during the reporting period, their total wages from all industry sectors are reported under the industry sector in which they showed the largest earnings and that industry/sector could be 'Unknown.'

The industry descriptions were found on the BLS web site and NAICS webpage on the census.gov website and may undergo periodic updates.

Quarterly Earnings

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard operates on the Exited population. It finds the maximum exit date for each participant and matches them to the wage table to find earnings 2 and 4 quarters after exit.

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard shows four earnings statistics, one row each for 2 quarters and 4 quarters after exit:

- **Minimum Earnings:** The minimum earnings among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Lower Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 25% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Median Earnings:** The middle value in the entire list of participant earnings totals.
- **Upper Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 75% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Maximum Earnings:** The maximum earnings are calculated with the following rules, IF the true maximum earnings value is greater than the Upper Quartile+(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile), THEN display Upper Quartile+1.5 (Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile).

Outliers—individual values which fall far below or above the middle 50% of participant earnings and do not represent the trend of the data—have been excluded from display.

California Department of Industrial Relations (DIR), Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS) – State Certified Apprenticeship Program

Served Rule

1. If the DPE is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015 = Served in FY14-15.

2. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is Null = Served in FY14-15.
3. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is on or after July 1, 2014 = Served in FY14-15.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate Served in FY 15-16.

Exited Rule

1. Select only participants who are classified as “Served” in the fiscal year.
2. If the DPX is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015 = Exited in FY14-15.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate Exited in FY 15-16.

Completed Training Population

Most of the dashboards include a column labeled ‘# Completed Training,’ listing a number of participants who exited the program, having completed their training. This population is a direct subset of the Exited population. DAS provided a column called TrainingCompletionStatus. The dashboard queries count a participant as completed training if the participant was served in the fiscal year, they exited in the same fiscal year and their TrainingCompletionStatus flag=1.

Employed Rule

Join participants to latest wage file using SSN only to match. Add 2 and 4 quarters to each participant’s exit date (within the given fiscal years) and sum the wages for that year/quarter/SSN from the wage file.

Wage Data

The Employed Rule relies on a complete store of wage data for all of the participants so the queries can accurately determine who received wages in given timeframe and count them as employed. The wage used to calculate the median is the sum of all wages associated with a participant for the relevant fiscal year and quarter. There are approximately 247 million wage records, spanning the time-frame Q2 1999-Q1 2019.

Attained Credential

Most of the dashboards include a column labeled ‘# Attained Credential,’ listing the count of participants who obtained a certificate or some other credential when they completed their training. It is always positioned as one of the columns in the Q4 section of the dashboard, for both fiscal years.

To populate this column, the dashboard queries count a participant as ‘Attained Credential’ if they served and exited in the fiscal year, and attained a credential any time between their exit date through 4 quarters after that date. We use column CredentialAttainmentDate to determine the date the participant received the credential, and we use column CredentialAttainmentStatus to confirm the participant received a credential (where CredentialAttainmentStatus=1).

TABLES

Dashboard Tables Share the Same Rules

The Program Performance Dashboard was developed first. It consists of three output queries that provide the count of participants served in the fiscal year, the count exited in the fiscal year, and the count of participants earning wages n quarters after program exit. It's important to understand that the rules listed above are used to derive these populations from the raw data, and that each population is derived from the prior population in the chain:

Raw Population → Served in Fiscal Year → Exited in Fiscal Year → Employed n quarters after Exit

The Program Performance Dashboard is the simplest dashboard because it counts and reports the total population count for Served, Exited and the Employed groups for the four combinations of fiscal year and quarter. Other dashboard tables group the participants using an additional attribute such as gender, ethnicity, age group, industry sector, etc.

With few exceptions, all of these dashboards must produce matching populations of Served, Exited and Employed. For this reason, once the Program Performance Dashboard has been developed and validated, it becomes the template for all other dashboard, and its population counts become the benchmark used to validate the totals on all other dashboards.

The below sub-sections describe the unique grouping each dashboard uses, as well as logic specific to that dashboard.

Program Performance

Program Performance implements the Served Rule, Exited Rule and Employed Rule to output the population count for served and exited, and the population count and median earnings for the employed population in quarters after exit.

Industry Sector

The Industry Sector Dashboard groups participants by the first two digits of the NAICS code in which they have earned wages n quarters after exiting the program. It omits the Served and Exited counts, because participants cannot be grouped by Industry/Sector without determining their wages, a step that is part of the Employed rule, but not part of the Served or Exited rule.

Participant's wage record was associated with the Industry/Sector where the participant earned the highest wages and the industry/sector could be 'Unknown.'

The industry descriptions were found on the BLS web site and NAICS webpage on the census.gov website and may undergo periodic updates.

Ethnicity – Race

The Ethnicity/Race Dashboard aggregates the detailed ethnicity attribute for each participant and groups them into collections of ethnicities such as:

- American Indian or Alaskan Native
- Asian
- Asian or Pacific Islander
- Black or African American
- Hispanic of Latino
- Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander
- Unknown
- White

The actual ethnicity values DAS provided are much more detailed and form a longer list:

- American Indian or Alaskan Native
- Asian or Pacific Islander (unspecified)
- Bangladeshi
- Cambodian
- Chinese
- Filipino
- Hmong
- Indian
- Indonesian
- Japanese
- Korean
- Laotian
- Malaysian
- Pakistani
- Sri Lankan
- Taiwanese
- Thai
- Vietnamese
- Fijian
- Guamanian
- Hawaiian
- Samoan
- Tongan
- Black
- Caucasian
- Did not self-identify
- Hispanic

For the Ethnicity/Race Dashboard, each of these as reported ethnicities is mapped to one of the collection of ethnicities in the first list using a CAAL Skills cross-walk table.

The individual Ethnicity/Race value 'Asian or Pacific Islander' is special. It is an individual designation that appears on the Disaggregated Race dashboard, and it grouped by itself on the Ethnicity/Race Dashboard. It should not be grouped with the 'Asian' grouping, nor the 'Asian or Pacific Islander' grouping.

Race - As Reported

The Race - As Reported Dashboard is similar to the Ethnicity/Race Dashboard but more straightforward. Rather than map the detailed ethnicity attributes DAS provided to groupings of ethnicities, the Race - As Reported Dashboard groups participants by those detailed values.

The queries include logic to detect when the same participant reports more than one ethnicity, and categorizes their ethnicity as 'More than One Ethnicity/Race'. In the current batch of data, there appear to be no participants that reported more than one ethnicity within a given fiscal year.

Gender

The Gender Dashboard groups the participants by Male/Female/Unknown, where Unknown acknowledges that no gender value was provided. This dashboard is very simple. All participants were tagged with a valid gender and none reported more than one gender. Therefore all participants are correctly reported under one of the two genders and none appear under Unknown.

Age Group at Entry

The Age Group at Entry Dashboard calculates the age of each participant at the earliest time of program entry in the fiscal year. It then groups these ages in the following buckets:

- Under 25
- 25-54
- 55 and Older
- Unknown

Unknown is used when participants lack date of birth. We found no instances of unknown ages in the latest DAS data.

Veteran Status

The Veteran Status Dashboard groups the participants by the veteran status values Yes, No and Not Applicable. It uses the same queries as the Program Performance Dashboard, modified to gather the maximum value of the veteran status indicator within the fiscal year. The maximum value is used because if someone is not initially tagged as a veteran early in the fiscal year, they might still exit the fiscal year as a veteran.

Training Completion Status

DAS provided the values 0, 1 indicate whether or not the participant completed training in a fiscal year. This dashboard re-interprets the values as Yes (value=1), No (value=0) and Not Applicable (value=99). All participants were correctly classified as Yes or No.

Like the Veteran Status Dashboard, this dashboard finds the maximum value of Training Completion Status within the fiscal year. If a participant has more than one record that falls in the fiscal year and at least one of the records flags them as completing the training, the participant get classified in the Yes row.

Type of Recognized Credential

DAS provided a column called CredentialType, that contains the values 0, 6 or 7 and this table groups participants by their CredentialType values. CredentialType values correspond to the following credential descriptions:

- 0 = No Recognized Credential
- 6 = Occupational Skills Certificate
- 7 = Occupational Certification

Participant Status

The Participant Status Dashboard does not follow the template provided by the Program Performance Dashboard. This is because it counts participants in the following statuses:

- Participating in the Program
- Completed the Program
- Withdrew from the Program

The basis for this dashboard is the Served population for the given fiscal year. This dashboard skips finding the Exited population and joins all Served participants to the wage table. This allows the dashboard to include non-Exiters in the Participating in Program status.

There is logic in place to detect participants still in the program and to use the last day of the fiscal year as the exit date instead of the participant's actual exit date, which extends beyond the fiscal year. There is additional logic to detect when a participant has more than one status within the fiscal year, and assign priorities to the statuses to count the participant under the most meaningful value:

- Priority 0 - Participating in the Program
- Priority 1 - Withdrew from the Program
- Priority 2 - Completed the Program

Whenever a participant has more than one status, the logic takes the highest priority value and counts the participant under that status. For example, if a participant has two service records, one that show their status to be 'Participating' and another for 'Completed,' the logic counts the participant under 'Completed. Likewise, for participants who have statuses of 'Withdrew' and 'Completed,' the logic counts them under 'Completed.' Participants without a participant status because their exit date was before their entry date did not have a participant status and were excluded from the table.

Quarterly Earnings

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard operates on the Exited population. It finds the maximum exit date for each participant and matches them to the wage table to find earnings 2 and 4 quarters after exit.

The dashboard query calculates the Minimum Earnings as the truly minimum total earnings by any one participant in the target population. The Lower Quartile is calculated as the value representing the top of the 25% quartile. The Median Earnings is calculated as the value representing the middle value in the entire list of participant earnings totals. The Upper Quartile is calculated as the value representing the top of the 75% quartile.

Outliers—individual values which fall far below or above the middle 50% of participant earnings and do not represent the trend of the data—have been excluded from display. There the Maximum Earnings are calculated with the following rules: If the true maximum earnings value is greater than the Upper Quartile+(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile), then display Upper Quartile+1.5(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile).

California Department of Social Services (CDSS) – CalWORKS Welfare to Work Program

Served Rule and Percentage

For the CDSS Welfare to Work workforce metrics dashboard, the CDSS participant was considered "Served" if the participant was an adult and met the entry and exit criteria for being served in the fiscal year.

Using FY1415 as an example, the calculation for served is shown below:

1. Participant must be at least 18 years old at time of program entry.
2. If the DPE is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015 = Served in FY14-15.
3. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is Null = Served in FY14-15.
4. If the DPE is before July 1, 2014 and the DPX is after July 2, 2014 = Served in FY14-15.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Served' in FY 15-16.

The Served Percentage calculates the percentage of each served count in relation to the total number of served.

Exited Rule and Percentage

A participant is considered as 'Exited' in FY 14-15 if the following are true:

1. Participant was classified as 'Served' in the fiscal year.
2. If the DPX is between July 1, 2014 and June 30, 2015.

Corresponding rules were derived to calculate 'Exited' in FY 15-16.

The Exited Percentage calculates the percentage of the exited count in relation to the total

exited count.

Completed Training Population and Percentage

Training and educational activities are not available from DSS at this time. Therefore, the Completed Training columns are populated with 'Not Available.'

Employed Rule and Percentage

Employment is considered 2 and 4 quarter after a participant's maximum exit date for the fiscal year. The participant is considered employed if participant's SSN matches a wage record greater than \$0.

The Employed Percentage calculates the percentage of the employed count in relation to the exited count for the same row. The Industry Sector Table does not follow this employed percentage rule because it lacks Exited counts. For the Industry Sector table, the Employed Percentage reflects the proportion of the employed count on each row in relation the total employed for the fiscal year.

Wage Data

If a participant is considered employed, then wages can also be calculated. All wage records matched to a participant are summed and the total earnings is considered the participant's wages for the quarter of interest. The median wage uses the total earnings for all participants in the row.

Attained Credential

Training and educational activities are not available from DSS at this time. Therefore, the Completed Training columns are populated with 'Not Available.'

TABLES

Dashboard Tables Share the Same Rules

All Dashboard tables use the standard rules for Served, Exited, Completed training, Employed and Attained Credential to obtain the participant populations. The Program Performance Table is developed first and subsequent Dashboard tables are broken down into subgroups within each column.

The rules listed above are used to derive these populations from the raw data, and that each population is derived from the prior population in the chain:

Raw Population → Served in Fiscal Year → Exited in Fiscal Year → Employed n quarters after Exit

The Program Performance Dashboard is the simplest dashboard because it counts and reports the total population count for 'Served,' 'Exited' and the 'Employed' groups for the four combinations of fiscal year and quarter. Other dashboard tables group the participants using an additional attribute such as gender, ethnicity, age group, industry sector, etc.

With few exceptions, all of these dashboards must produce matching populations of 'Served,' 'Exited' and 'Employed.' For this reason, once the Program Performance Dashboard has been developed and validated, it becomes the template for all other dashboard, and its population counts become the benchmark used to validate the totals on all other dashboards.

The below sub-sections describe the unique grouping each dashboard uses, as well as logic specific to that dashboard table.

Program Performance

The Program Performance Dashboard implements the standard rules for 'Served,' 'Exited,' 'Employed,' 'Median Wages', and 'Attained Credential.' There are no other categorizations or rules that apply.

Participant Ethnicity – Race

The Ethnicity/Race Dashboard groups participants by aggregated ethnicity/race categories that represent groupings of the more detailed race descriptions DSS provided.

Race – As Reported

The Race - As Reported Dashboard groups participants by the detailed race value they reported to DSS. The CAAL-Skills Team used a cross-walk table to reformat the race values to more readable, mixed-case race descriptions. See **Race as Reported Xwalk** sheet to view the crosswalk data. (See Appendix C above).

The Race - As Reported Dashboard groups participants by the detailed race value they reported to DSS. The CAAL-Skills Team used a cross-walk table to reformat the race values to more readable, mixed-case race descriptions. See **Race as Reported Xwalk** sheet to view the crosswalk data.

Gender

The Gender Dashboard groups participants by sex/gender (SEX, DED #014) values: 'Male,' 'Female,' or did not respond to the question. Participants who did not provide a gender are counted under the category 'Unknown or Not Provided.' There were none of these. There were also no participants that reported more than one gender.

Age Group at Entry

The Age Group at Entry Dashboard calculates the age of each participant at the earliest time of program entry (DPE, DED #051) in the fiscal year with the participant birthdate (DOB, DED #013). It then groups these ages in the following buckets:

- Under 25
- 25-54
- 55 and Older
- Unknown

Participants counted in the Unknown category would presumably lack a date of birth but all participants provided a date of birth.

Veteran Status

The Veteran Status Dashboard counts each participant once and when a participant has more than one Veteran Status value, the dashboard reports them under the maximum value. Therefore when a participant reports both 0 and 1 values for veteran status, the dashboard counts them under value 1.

Training Completion Status

As mentioned earlier in this document, DSS does not have training completion data. Therefore the Training Completion Status Dashboard repeats the Program Performance totals in the Unknown category.

Type of Recognized Credential

DSS does not provide training completion status information. Therefore, the Program Performance numbers were placed in the 'Unknown' category.

Industry Sector

The Industry Sector Dashboard groups participants by the first two digits of the NAICS code (ISC, DED #074) in which they have earned wages 2 and 4 quarters after exiting the program. It omits the 'Served' and 'Exited' counts, because participants cannot be grouped by industry/sector without determining their wages, a step that is part of the 'Employed' rule, but not part of the 'Served' or 'Exited' rule.

If a participant worked in multiple industry sectors during the reporting period, their total wages from all industry sectors are reported under the industry sector in which they showed the largest earnings and that industry/sector could be 'Unknown.'

The industry descriptions were found on the BLS website and NAICS webpage on the census.gov website and may undergo periodic updates.

Quarterly Earnings

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard operates on the Exited population. It finds the maximum exit date for each participant and matches them to the wage table to find earnings 2 and 4 quarters after exit.

The Quarterly Earnings Dashboard shows four earnings statistics, one row each for 2 quarters and 4 quarters after exit:

- **Minimum Earnings:** The minimum earnings among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- **Lower Quartile:** The earnings amount representing the 25% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.

- Median Earnings: The middle value in the entire list of participant earnings totals.
- Upper Quartile: The earnings amount representing the 75% quartile among all of the participants in the employed population for the given quarter.
- Maximum Earnings: The maximum earnings are calculated with the following rules, IF the true maximum earnings value is greater than the Upper Quartile+(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile), THEN display Upper Quartile+1.5(Upper Quartile-Lower Quartile).

Outliers—individual values which fall far below or above the middle 50% of participant earnings and do not represent the trend of the data—have been excluded from display.