

HIGH ROAD

Guidelines for California Workforce
Development Board Greenhouse Gas
Reduction Fund Administration



Table of Contents

Introduction	2
Forthcoming RFA(s).....	2
Program vs Projects	2
GGRF & Cap-and-Trade Program Background	2
CWDB/High Road as a California Climate Investments (CCI) Program	3
Purpose of CWDB Funding Guidelines	4
Program Requirements, Metrics, & Outcomes.....	4
Facilitation of GHG Emission Reductions.....	4
High Road Training Partnerships (H RTP).....	5
High Road Construction Careers (HRCC).....	7
General Project Requirements	7
Serving Benefiting Priority Populations	8
Avoiding Burdens to disadvantaged and low-income communities	9
Identifying and Evaluating Priority Populations	10
Maximizing Co-benefits	11
Process for Reporting Project-Level Data	13
Appendix I. Description of Co-benefits	14
Appendix II. Examples of Common Needs of Priority Populations.....	17
Public Health	17
Economic	17
Environmental	17
Appendix III. Relevant Legislation	18

Introduction

This document is intended to provide current grantees, potential grant applicants, state-level stakeholders, project-level participants, and members of the general public with an overview of the California Workforce Development Board's (CWDB) use of Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund (GGRF) monies for high road workforce development programs. The content of this document is informed by agency-level guidelines articulated by the California Air Resource Board's (CARB) [Climate California Investment \(CCI\) Funding Guidelines](#), and this document's contents are intended to provide an overview of the relevant components of the CCI Guidelines through a workforce development lens and to address the unique specifications of the funds allotted to the CWDB for administration to grantees.

Forthcoming RFA(s)

This document should **not** be read as a solicitation for proposals or applications—solicitations will be released by the CWDB as separate documents in conjunction with grant funds appropriated to the CWDB by the State Legislature. While those solicitation documents will provide specific project-level requirements and application instructions, this document is intended to serve as a guide to the program's underlying High Road principles while ensuring the CWDB and its grantees meet the relevant requirements set forth by the Legislature and CARB.

Program vs Projects

Readers should note the distinction between the terms "program" and "project" used throughout this document. "Program" refers to the CWDB's portfolio of activities funded through its appropriated GGRF funds collectively, under which the principles established by these guidelines are to be administered. The term "project" refers to the activities carried out by individual [High Road Training Partnerships \(H RTP\)](#) and [High Road Construction Careers \(HRCC\)](#) grantees that may be awarded GGRF funds. While H RTP and HRCC constitute programs in their own right, and are occasionally referenced as "programs" in this document, the term "program" should generally be interpreted as referring to H RTP and HRCC collectively unless denoted by an additional qualifier (e.g. the "H RTP program").

GGRF & Cap-and-Trade Program Background

California's Cap-and-Trade Program is one of the state's major policies to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, which are responsible for destabilizing the climate and creating harmful impacts such as more extreme wildfires, droughts, and floods. By putting a hard limit and price on GHG emissions, the [Cap-and-Trade Program](#) generates significant revenue in addition to helping to reduce adverse climate impacts. That revenue (roughly \$1B per year) is deposited into the Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund (GGRF) and appropriated by the State Legislature. Every year, the Legislature decides how to spend money in the GGRF on a variety of programs administered by different state agencies and departments. The suite of programs funded from the GGRF are known as [California Climate Investments \(CCI\)](#), and include programs to increase energy efficiency in buildings, deploy more zero-emission vehicles, expand public transit service, build affordable housing near transit, and plant trees and other kinds of urban greening measures.

By law, programs funded from the GGRF must facilitate greenhouse gas emission reductions and generate additional co-benefits for the economy, environment, and public health. State law also requires that at least 35% of GGRF monies spent annually are located within, and benefit residents of,

Disadvantaged Communities (DACs) and Low-Income Communities (LICs) and low-income households. DACs are communities with the highest burden and vulnerability to multiple sources of pollution, identified using the California Communities Environmental Health Screening Tool (CalEnviroScreen). Low-Income Communities and households are defined based on county-specific median household income (MHI) levels established by the U.S. Department of Housing & Urban Development and the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD). The California Air Resources Board (CARB) issues detailed [CCI Funding Guidelines](#) to help agencies administering CCI programs meet statutory requirements for reducing emissions while maximizing benefits to DACs, LICs, and low-income households (referred to as “priority populations”).

In 2017, Assembly Bill 398 (Chapter 135, Statutes of 2017) was signed into law. This state law codified California’s Cap-and-Trade Program for the 2021-2030 time period, and directed the CWDB to produce a report on the employment and training implications of implementing California’s Climate Change Scoping Plan. The state’s Scoping Plan, which is developed by CARB and must be updated every five years, outlines specific policies and programs to achieve statutory mandates for reducing greenhouse gas emissions in California.¹ The Scoping Plan organizes greenhouse gas emissions and associated climate policies and programs into six sectors: transportation, energy, industrial, waste, water, and natural and working lands (including agricultural lands). The CWDB’s forthcoming AB 398 climate and labor report is organized the same way, determining the key industries and occupations involved in each Scoping Plan Sector first and then examining issues of job quality, job access, and just transition accordingly. In discussing equity and job access issues, the CWDB’s AB 398 report identifies industries and occupations where expansion or development of new High Road Training Partnerships (HRTTP) projects, as well as connections to the High Road Construction Careers (HRCC) program, would be most opportune. Therefore, prospective applicants may find the AB 398 report to be a helpful resource for developing project applications.

CWDB/High Road as a California Climate Investments (CCI) Program

In Fiscal Year (FY) 2019-20, the Legislature appropriated \$35M to the California Workforce Development Board (CWDB) for its two primary high road workforce development programs, High Road Construction Careers (HRCC) and High Road Training Partnerships (HRTTP). Of the total funding available, **approximately \$10M** will go to the HRCC Program and \$20M to the HRTTP Program, with the remainder for technical assistance, program implementation and other important state operations at the CWDB. The CWDB will have two fiscal years to encumber this funding, which means contracts must be executed no later than June 30, 2021; all funds must be spent by June 30, 2022. While the CWDB anticipates additional funding from the GGRF at the same level in FY 2020-21 through FY 2023-24, it is not guaranteed as funding is subject to the Legislature’s annual appropriations process and to availability of revenue in the GGRF. **Decreased fossil fuel consumption due to COVID-19, economic recession, or other events may result in lower than expected revenue from the Cap-and-Trade Program, which could impact program funding in future years.**

¹ California became the first state in the country to establish an economy-wide target for reducing greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in 2006 with passage of Assembly Bill 32, which mandated that California return to 1990 levels of GHG emissions by 2020. The law was updated in 2015 and mandated that California reduce GHG emissions 40% below 2020 levels by 2030. These science-based targets are aimed at avoiding the catastrophic impacts of climate change based on the recommendations of the United Nations’ Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC).

The GGRF is an appropriate use of funding for the HRCC and H RTP Programs, as environmental sustainability and a safe climate are core elements of the CWDB’s model of high road workforce development. As CCI programs, HRCC and H RTP must adhere to the statutory requirements of expenditures from the GGRF and CARB-issued Funding Guidelines pertaining to greenhouse gas emission reductions and serving priority populations described above. To ensure consistency with these requirements, the CWDB was required to develop program-specific [GGRF Expenditure Records](#) which were prepared in March 2020 are now available on CARB’s website.

Purpose of CWDB Funding Guidelines

CARB’s CCI Funding Guidelines are intended for the CWDB and other state agencies that receive program funding from the GGRF. As such, the CCI Funding Guidelines outline the following:

- roles and responsibilities of CARB and CCI administering agencies;
- protocols for program implementation including methodologies to measure GHG emission reductions quantitatively or qualitatively;
- reporting requirements at the program and project levels;
- program design elements; and
- ways to evaluate funding applications with respect to benefits to priority populations.

The purpose of this document, therefore, is to provide a high-level understanding to prospective funding applicants of how the CWDB will administer its HRCC and H RTP programs and award funding for projects to ensure requirements in law and the CCI Funding Guidelines are met. This document will also describe the basic elements of high road workforce development programs and projects that have been established by the CWDB. It is important to note that more detailed information for prospective applicants will be provided in forthcoming Requests for Applications (RFAs); additional materials, such as Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs), may also be provided during the solicitation period.

Program Requirements, Metrics, & Outcomes

Facilitation of GHG Emission Reductions

As outlined in CARB’s CCI Funding Guidelines, all CCI programs must facilitate GHG emission reductions and further the purposes of AB 32 and related statutes. Therefore, the facilitation of GHG emission reductions is a requirement of the CWDB’s GGRF-funded workforce development program and a priority of the grant funds described in this document.

The CCI Funding Guidelines identify different allowable meanings of GHG emission reductions, which administering agencies – such as the CWDB – must follow to develop their GGRF-funded programs. The CWDB’s program most appropriately fits with the definition that requires projects to “facilitate GHG emission reductions, or do not impact GHG emissions, demonstrated through a qualitative assessment” that “describes how a program or individual projects affect GHG emission reductions.”² The CWDB is responsible for developing the qualitative assessment.

² See [CCI Funding Guidelines](#), pgs. 10-11.

The CWDB described how funded projects will either facilitate GHG emission reductions or will not impact GHG emissions in Expenditure Records submitted to CARB, which the CWDB was required to develop pursuant to the statutory requirements of the GGRF.³

The High Road Training Partnerships (HRTTP) program will meet the GHG emission reductions requirement by supporting projects that either:

- (A) Build climate and economic resilience through training partnerships and systems that: (a) address critical skill issues emerging as industry faces challenges of climate change and environmental sustainability; (b) increase the capacity of firms and workers to adapt and compete in a carbon-constrained economy; and (c) help California communities prosper by creating accessible local pathways into safer, healthier, and more highly skilled jobs; and Focus workforce development efforts in industries and occupations involved in: implementing climate change mitigation and adaptation measures; producing, operating, and maintaining new technologies and equipment that reduce GHG emissions; and planning to identify additional industry and workforce needs and opportunities associated with the transition to a carbon-neutral economy.

OR

- (B) Establish partnerships for comprehensive, regional economic and workforce planning to support the transition away from fossil fuels and fossil fuel-based industries.

The High Road Construction Careers (HRCC) program will meet the GHG emission reductions requirement by supporting projects that:

- Develop a skilled workforce for the construction industry, ~~which is heavily involved in implementing a variety of climate measures in multiple Climate Change Scoping Plan sectors; with a focus on trades or crafts with the highest involvement in climate change mitigation and adaptation projects;~~ and
- Increase workers' awareness of climate change and environmental sustainability via construction sector pre-apprenticeship curriculum, ~~and training, and career services~~ (e.g., mandated instruction of the Green Construction module of the Multi-Craft Core Curriculum; hands-on activities and site visits to construction projects that support climate change mitigation, ~~or adaptation, or resilience~~; and assisting pre-apprenticeship graduates secure job placement with state-registered apprenticeship programs or employers ~~with high levels of involvement~~ in climate change mitigation, ~~and/or~~ adaptation, ~~or resilience~~ projects).

More detailed descriptions of the HRTTP and HRCC programs, including how they will help further the purposes of California's climate change laws and related statutes, are provided below.

High Road Training Partnerships (HRTTP)

The High Road Training Partnerships (HRTTP) program simultaneously promotes economic equity and mobility for workers, skills and competitiveness for high road employers, and long-term environmental sustainability and climate resilience for the state. The elements of HRTTP include:

³ See Expenditure Records for [High Road Construction Careers](#) and [High Road Training Partnerships](#) programs.

- **Industry Led Problem Solving:** Foundational is that the industry – including leaders representing both employers and workers – lead the problem solving for the workforce demands unique to that industry. **Industry representation will look different for each H RTP, and projects focused on regional economic transition away from fossil fuels may form partnerships led by a variety of stakeholder groups, including labor, community organizations, and local government.**
- **Partnerships a Priority:** It is key to have strong and durable industry partnership as a goal in and of itself. Here it means a formal relationship that is neither loose nor ad hoc but forms the basis of sustained problem-solving.
- **Worker Wisdom:** These H RTPs have developed innovative ways to explicitly bring worker voice into their strategies and tactics as a core value undergirding the partnership.
- **Industry Driven Education & Training solutions:** Partnerships can tap into training already out there, develop and deliver their own programs or use a hybrid specific to their particular workforce needs.

H RTP projects are organized at the regional level, or focus on a particular industry sector, and address at least one of the following:

- Connect workers to high-quality jobs or entry-level work with clearly defined routes to advancement;
- Increase skills and opportunity for those at the lower end of the labor market while expanding career pipelines within key industries for priority populations, individuals with barriers to employment, and under-represented workers;
- Support both labor and management in improving health, safety, and professionalization of jobs;
 - Address worker, employer, and industry needs as they respond and adapt to climate change and environmental sustainability, and build community and economic resilience;
 - Respond to existing or impending industry disruption due to the transition away from fossil fuels and other climate mitigation strategies;
 - Build partnerships to connect dislocated workers to existing resources and services and to plan for long-term retraining (focusing on workers and communities impacted by fossil fuel industry decline);
 - Regional strategies developed through partnerships that support workers and communities in adapting to and creating new workforce opportunities in the transition to a carbon-neutral economy
- Transition planning to identify and implement projects that meet the criteria above
- Comprehensive, regional economic and workforce planning, targeting areas of California most impacted by the transition away from fossil fuel-based industries and toward carbon neutrality, to address economic diversification, workforce development, and worker and community impacts from declining fossil fuel industries
- Research and development to identify key stakeholders (including, but not limited to environmental justice organizations, industry and labor leaders, community-based and civic leaders, **and tribal governments**) to convene and lead industry and regional planning conversations
- Research and development to identify projects that meet the criteria above
- Technical assistance to support projects and coordinate with the CWDB team to build field capacity and expertise

For more information about the elements of H RTP, visit the [High Road Training Partnership initiative page](#).

High Road Construction Careers (HRCC)

The High Road Construction Careers (HRCC) program entails multi-craft construction pre-apprenticeship projects that:

- Establish structured career pathways – using a standard core curriculum (i.e., the Multi-Craft Core Curriculum, or MC3) and supportive services – to quality jobs in the building and construction trades. ~~to quality jobs in the building and construction trades, with a focus on trades or crafts with the highest involvement in climate change mitigation and adaptation projects.~~
- Strengthen existing, or pilot new, systems and partnerships that increase skills, opportunity, and access for disadvantaged and underrepresented populations (women, people of color, and formerly-incarcerated and justice-involved individuals) in the building and construction trades.
- Increase awareness of climate change and environmental sustainability via pre-apprenticeship curriculum and training.
- Facilitate quality placement opportunities in jobs or educational programs that support climate change mitigation, and adaptation, and resilience.
- Technical assistance for projects to support implementation and capacity-building linked to the objectives above.

General Project Requirements

This section provides an overview of what CWDB will look for in H RTP projects, but should not be read as a rubric or comprehensive set of criteria. A single set of criteria will be included in future solicitation documents.

The CWDB is interested in funding projects that directly support jobs or a job training and placement that:

- Includes capacity building resulting in credentials (e.g., certifications, certificates, degrees, licenses, other documentation of competency and qualifications) to support long-term, stable employment and career development. Administering agencies may consider requiring applicants and/or funding recipients to develop partnerships with existing programs or institutions that provide training and skills such as community colleges, nonprofit organizations, labor management partnerships, State-certified apprenticeship programs, and high school career technical academies.
- Demonstrate local benefit and support of a clean energy and transportation economy. Job classifications and job training programs in the clean energy and transportation sector can facilitate the shift towards a sustainable workforce.
- Emphasize job quality and promote specific criteria for employers. Factors commonly considered to influence job quality include, but are not limited to:
 - Local living wages;
 - Benefits provided (i.e., health insurance, paid leave, sick leave, child care services);
 - Geographic accessibility, connectivity, and commute distance;
 - Job strain, schedule, and flexibility;
 - Worker engagement and involvement;
 - Robust metrics to measure job progress beyond self-reporting (e.g., enrollment, completion, placement, career opportunities, and documentation of labor market advancement);

- Working conditions and health risks; and
 - Job retention or duration of employment.
- Consider practices that improve employment outcomes such as targeted hiring. Targeted hiring strategies can direct opportunities to individuals with barriers to employment, residents of disadvantaged communities, and veterans, among others. Approaches for targeted hiring may include, but are not limited to:
 - Community Benefits Agreement (CBA). A CBA is a contract between community-based organizations and applicants, funding recipients, or administering agencies that identify benefits to be provided as part of a project or program. Hiring priority for low-income individuals and prevailing wage requirements are commonly found in CBAs. CBAs may also include provisions for ongoing community engagement and mechanisms to ensure continued input and success.
 - Labor agreements or community workforce provisions, **including, but not limited to: collective bargaining agreements, Project Labor Agreements, Community Workforce Agreements, first-source hiring policy or program, and local hiring policy or program.** Develop or expand comprehensive agreements between labor unions and applicants and/or funding recipients (e.g., contractors, developers, transit agencies, cities) to achieve a breadth of objectives including uniform labor standards. These agreements may extend across multiple projects. Administering agencies may choose to prioritize projects with established labor agreements or community workforce provisions that contain targeted hiring provisions.
 - ~~○ Grant agreement provisions. Provisions in the agreement between a grantee and an administering agency that include criteria for targeted hiring.~~

Quantification Methodologies

Funded projects, with assistance from CWDB, will be required to demonstrate how each project is meeting the aforementioned GHG emission reduction goals. This will be done by using CARB quantification methodologies and/or a qualitative assessment. The projects funded through this program must use a CARB quantification methodology to quantify GHG emission reductions if a CARB quantification methodology exists for the project type. Specific information, including relevant quantification tools can be found in Appendix I. The CWDB will provide qualitative assessment reporting tools specific to each RFA and will review with awarded projects during the orientation periods and throughout the grant terms.

Serving Benefiting Priority Populations

CWDB's funding through the GGRF offers a unique opportunity to elicit significant benefits for disadvantaged communities (DACs), low-income communities (LICs), and low-income households (LIHs), collectively referred to as "priority populations" **that are especially vulnerable to the impacts of climate change.**⁴ ~~Priority populations represent economically disadvantaged individuals and communities as well as communities disproportionately burdened by the impacts of climate change, exposed to multiple sources of pollution, and especially vulnerable to environmental pollutants.~~ More specifically, priority populations represent communities disproportionately burdened by multiple sources of pollution and

⁴ ~~Priority populations include residents of: (1) census tracts identified as disadvantaged by California Environmental Protection Agency per SB 535; (2) census tracts identified as low income per AB 1550; or (3) a low income household per AB 1550.~~

with population characteristics that make them more sensitive to pollution (DACs), as well as communities and households that face economic hardship (LICs and LIHs). The term community has a particular meaning and is defined at the census tract level using a specified environmental health screening tool and income thresholds.⁵

Serving disadvantaged Californians and their communities through strategic workforce programs is central to CWDB's mission, and a key strategy to achieving one of CWDB's primary policy objectives which is to enable upward mobility for all Californians. As such, the CWDB has established aggressive targets to **serve benefit** priority populations, with goals of 50% and 60% of program funding to serve priority populations through H RTP and HRCC, respectively.

To support the aforementioned service targets for priority populations, the CWDB seeks to directly fund projects that do at least one of the following:

- Prioritize quality jobs and upward mobility for members of priority populations with immediate and/or long-term impact and benefits.
- Conduct workforce development programming that facilitates GHG emission reductions and support other types of environmental improvement within priority population areas, especially within disadvantaged communities.
- Perform research, planning, and development of workforce development programs in industries where industry-based partnerships do not currently exist and high road training partnerships can directly benefit priority populations.

Avoiding Burdens to disadvantaged and low-income communities

The CWDB will engage with past grantees, community groups, and other stakeholders to identify potential burdens and ensure program design, expectations, and requirements are realistic, inclusive, and address the specific needs of priority populations. CWDB will make programmatic adjustments to eligibility criteria, and ultimately funding decisions, as necessary to avoid potential substantial burdens.

For instance, the CWDB will engage with community and workforce leaders to determine thresholds and situations that could affect eligibility for, or continuation of, public assistance. The CWDB will provide guidance to applicants and require that they identify responses and pro-active solutions to address this potential substantial burden; the CWDB will evaluate and consider these measures in project selection.

Further, the CWDB will engage with communities and community leaders to address environmental concerns (including but not limited to GHG emissions) in order to identify key issues within a geographical area that can be addressed by these programs.

⁵ Disadvantaged communities are identified by the California Environmental Protection Agency (CalEPA) as the top 25% most impacted census tracts in [CalEnviroScreen 3.0](#) – a screening tool used to help identify communities disproportionately burdened by multiple sources of pollution and with population characteristics that make them more sensitive to pollution. Low-income communities and households are defined as the census tracts and households, respectively, that are either at or below 80 percent of the statewide median income, or at or below the threshold designated as low-income by the California Department of Housing and Community Development's (HCD) [2016 State Income Limits](#).

The CWDB will encourage regional training partnerships to include community-based, faith-based, or non-profit organizations with expertise in working with priority populations and ability to anticipate and meet participants' needs through supportive services.

Identifying and Evaluating Priority Populations

The CWDB's targets of 50% and 60% for H RTP and HRCC, respectively, are minimum levels of total program expenditures that must benefit priority populations. Consequently, individual projects must support these minimum target levels, while doing so in a way that is feasible based on factors such as the project's area of service and the workers or job-seekers to be served. Applicants and grantees that claim their project should count toward the CWDB's targets for priority populations must benefit residents living within a disadvantaged or low-income community, or directly benefit members of low-income households anywhere in the state. To the extent feasible, projects that intend to benefit priority populations should locate training sites within disadvantaged community or low-income community census tracts. This will help to ensure that the proximity to training – and by extension, travel time and cost – does not become a barrier to, or burden for, priority populations.

As part of the grant application process, the CWDB will determine whether a proposed project meets the criteria for providing direct, meaningful, and assured benefits to priority populations and addresses an important community need using the following evaluation approach:

- **Step 1:** Identify the priority population(s). Directly benefit residents living within a census tract that has been identified as a disadvantaged or low-income community, or directly benefit members of a low-income household. And to the extent feasible, locate project sites within a disadvantaged or low-income community;
- **Step 2:** Address a need. Meaningfully address an important community or household need for the identified priority population(s); and
- **Step 3:** Provide a benefit. Using the evaluation criteria, identify at least one direct, meaningful, and assured benefit that the project provides to priority populations. The benefit provided must directly address an identified need. Only investments that meet these criteria will count toward achieving the statutory investment minimums identified for priority populations. **Projects must meet at least one of the following benefit criteria in order to count toward the priority populations requirement:**
 - Project provides high-quality (e.g., local living wages, health insurance, paid leave) jobs to, and enables upward mobility for, priority populations.
 - Project provides job training to priority populations that is part of a program with an established placement record.
 - Project provides job training to priority populations that includes capacity building that leads to industry-recognized credentials (e.g., certifications, certificates, degrees, licenses, other documentation of competency and qualifications).
 - Project provides workforce development programming that facilitates GHG emission reductions or other types of environmental improvement within priority population areas, especially within disadvantaged communities.

- Project provides research, planning, and development of workforce development programs in industries where industry-based partnerships do not currently exist and high road training partnerships can directly benefit priority populations.
- Projects will also benefit priority populations by including workers and their representatives and community groups in comprehensive, regional economic and workforce planning.

Additional Resources

Please refer to CARB's [Priority Population Investments](#) webpage for maps and information to help identify priority populations. Appendix II provides examples of common needs of priority populations.

Maximizing Co-benefits

CCI programs must maximize economic, environmental, and public health benefits to the state where applicable and to the extent feasible, pursuant to state law and as described in CARB's CCI Funding Guidelines. Co-benefits identified in state law (AB 1532, Chapter 807, Statutes of 2012) include:

- Foster job creation by promoting in-state greenhouse gas emissions reduction projects carried out by California workers and businesses;
- Complement efforts to improve air quality;
- Direct investment toward the most disadvantaged communities and households in the state;
- Provide opportunities for businesses, public agencies, **tribal governments**, nonprofits, and other community institutions to participate in and benefit from statewide efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions; and
- Lessen the impacts and effects of climate change on the state's communities, economy, and environment.

The CWDB's CCI program will help achieve or promote most of these co-benefits by: building the skills and capacity of California workers and businesses to support in-state GHG emission reductions and compete in carbon-constrained economy, as applicable to the industry sector involved; focusing on serving priority populations via targeted recruitment, training, supportive services, and job placement or career advancement; and ensuring that the appropriate businesses, public agencies, nonprofits, and community institutions are represented in training partnerships in addition to workers and their representatives.

In addition, CARB has developed methodologies (quantitative and qualitative) to assess additional co-benefits⁶, including:

- Jobs supported by the project, including direct, indirect, and induced jobs
- Reductions in air pollutant emissions
- Travel cost savings
- Changes in vehicle miles traveled
- Energy and fuel cost savings
- Water savings
- Soil health and conservation
- Climate adaptation

⁶ See [CCI Co-Benefit Assessment Methodologies](#) for more information.

- Community engagement
- Heart and lung health
- Anti-displacement
- Accelerated implementation of technology

CWDB-supported projects may help achieve or support these co-benefits depending on the industry sector and occupation(s) involved. Prospective applicants and grantees should refer to Appendix I for a description of these co-benefits, which could help inform project development and funding applications; also refer to CARB’s [CCI Co-Benefit Assessment Methodologies](#) for resources and tools. **Applicants may also identify relevant and meaningful co-benefits other than those listed above.** The CWDB may also provide further guidance to applicants and grantees on the use of the co-benefit assessment methodologies during the funding solicitation and grant reporting phases.

Additional Reporting Requirements

Per the requirements of the CCI Guidelines, the CWDB will submit program-level information to CARB, for all funded projects⁷. Grantees may be required to provide CWDB with relevant information in order to meet this requirement. Program-level information submitted by CWDB to CARB will include the below data points. CWDB-funded projects may be asked to provide the CWDB with this information, in addition to any other information specified in the relevant RFA:

- Project description
- How the program facilitates the achievement of GHG emission reductions
- How the program provides benefits to priority populations
- Co-benefits provided by the program
- The role of cost-effectiveness and other effectiveness metrics
- Program schedule
- Solicitation process and outcomes (e.g., number of applicants, requested funds, leveraged funds)
- Public transparency and outreach events (e.g., dates, locations, topics, attendees)
- Funding to intermediaries to cover administrative costs of program implementation
- Fiscal reports including administrative costs incurred by CWDB

CWDB may also request grantees provide information that supplements the above data points. While grantees should reference the specific requirements set forth in the relevant RFA, grantees should expect to report information including *but not limited to* the following:

Qualitative Elements

- Job Quality
- Industry-Based Training Partnership Development
- Impact on Climate Change
- Worker Voice

When possible, each of these elements should also be measured quantitatively. For example, “Job Quality” will be captured through various measures of employment outcomes (e.g. Earnings After Exit) in addition to qualitative information.

⁷ See: [CCI Guidelines](#) (p. 49)

Quantitative Elements

- Participant Demographics
 - Race
 - Ethnicity
 - Gender
 - Age at Program Entry
 - Home Census Tract / # Participants Served from [SB 535 Disadvantaged Communities and AB 1550 Low-Income Communities](#)
 - [Low-income Status at Program Entry](#)
 - Formerly-Incarcerated / Justice-Involved Status
 - Veteran Status
- Types of Services Received
 - Includes career services, training services, supportive services, and combinations of each
- Project Outcomes
 - Total Participants Served
 - Training Completion Status at Exit
 - Length of Participation
 - Credentials Earned
 - Industry Sector Employment
 - Earnings After Exit
 - Program Location(s)

Process for Reporting Project-Level Data**Instructions**

Grantees will complete customized templates and report quarterly on progress, challenges, successes, and outcomes. CWDB will determine data-collection and reporting requirements prior to project implementation and provide guidance. CWDB will report to CARB semi-annually through the tracking and reporting system, consistent with CARB guidance.

Frequency

Specific performance reporting requirements will be set forth in the applicable RFA; however for all projects, performance reporting shall be outlined on a monthly, quarterly, and annual basis to capture progress towards meeting the goals of CWDB's GGRF program. CWDB may review and revise the performance criteria with each grantee.

Appendix I. Description of Co-benefits

While all co-benefits listed below will not apply to each funded program, grantees should report on all applicable co-benefits.

Co-benefit	Description
Job Creation: Directly Supported (source)	Directly supported jobs refer to labor to complete California Climate Investments projects, through direct employment or contracted work paid with GGRF dollars (e.g., housing construction, ecosystem restoration, or technical assistance) and labor to produce equipment or materials purchased with GGRF dollars (e.g., manufacturing zero-emission vehicles or anaerobic digesters).
Job Creation: Indirectly Supported	Indirectly supported jobs exist in the supply chains supporting California Climate Investments projects. Funding a project generates demand for intermediate inputs of materials and equipment needed to complete the project, leading to expanded production and employment in the relevant upstream industries (e.g., manufacturing construction equipment, zero-emission vehicle parts, or solar panel components).
Job Creation: Induced	Induced jobs are linked to the spending of income from directly and indirectly supported jobs. The personal consumption expenditures of workers in jobs directly and indirectly supported by California Climate Investments projects (i.e., increased household spending) stimulate demand for goods and services in the wider California economy.
Job Quality	Promotes specific criteria for employers. Factors commonly considered to influence job quality include, but are not limited to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local living wages; • Benefits provided (i.e., health insurance, paid leave, sick leave, child care services); • Geographic accessibility, connectivity, and commute distance; • Job strain, schedule, and flexibility; • Worker engagement and involvement; • Robust metrics to measure job progress beyond self-reporting (e.g., enrollment, completion, placement, career opportunities, and documentation of labor market advancement); • Working conditions and health risks; and • Job retention or duration of employment.
Partnership Building	Assesses the grant’s impact on working relationships that advance the project’s goals and objectives, which may not have been established were funding from the grant not awarded
Travel Cost Savings	Travel cost savings refers to a change in the overall cost of travel for users of the transportation system who receive a subsidy for travel (e.g., transit voucher) or switch travel modes (e.g., switch from driving a car to riding mass transit, biking, or walking) as a result of a California Climate Investments project. Mode shift may occur because a California Climate Investments project creates new transit, biking, or walking infrastructure, or new housing or land use strategies that enable residents to make better use of existing transit, biking, and walking opportunities. This methodology uses the most up-to-date travel price data available at the time

Co-benefit	Description
	of publication; CARB may modify default price values as the original source material is updated. (source)
Air Pollutant Emissions	Estimated reduction of air pollutants as a result of project activity. (see also)
Vehicle Miles Traveled	Estimated reduction in vehicle miles traveled. (see also)
Energy and Fuel Cost Savings	Energy and fuel cost savings refers to a change in the overall cost of energy or fuel to project applicants and funding recipients as a result of a California Climate Investments project. Energy and fuel costs are affected by energy and fuel prices, fuel and equipment efficiency, and average useful lifetimes of equipment. This methodology uses the most up-to-date energy and fuel price data available at the time of publication; CARB may modify default price values as the original source material is updated. (source)
Water Savings	Water savings refers to change in the quantity of water consumed as a result of a California Climate Investments project. Water savings is affected by water demand, including water use (the total amount of water withdrawn from its source to be used). California Climate Investments can cause positive or negative water savings co-benefits. These co-benefits may accrue directly (as a central objective of the project) or indirectly (as a consequence of project activities). (source)
Soil Health and Conservation	Soil conservation refers to the prevention of soil loss and degradation from water and wind erosion, typically resulting from urbanization, deforestation, overgrazing, and intensive agricultural cultivation. Soil conservation also refers to the restoration of soil productivity and health. (source)
Climate Adaptation	Climate adaptation refers to activities that improve resiliency to the impacts of climate change. The <i>Safeguarding California Plan: 2018 Update</i> ⁸ provides the following definition of climate adaptation: Adjustment in natural or human systems to a new or changing environment. Adaptation to climate change refers to adjustment in natural or human systems in response to actual or expected climatic stimuli or their effects, which moderates harm or exploits beneficial opportunities.
Community Engagement	Community engagement refers to the process of cultivating active public participation in, or leadership of, affairs of importance to the community. According to the Centers for Disease Control ⁹ , community engagement is: The process of working collaboratively with and through groups of people affiliated by geographic proximity, special interest, or similar situations to address issues affecting the well-being of those people. It is a powerful vehicle for bringing about environmental and behavioral changes that will improve the health of the community and its members. It often involves partnerships and coalitions that help mobilize resources and influence systems, change relationships among partners, and serve as catalysts for changing policies, programs, and practices. (source)
Heart and Lung Health	Heart and lung health co-benefit refers to the expected change in the incidence of premature cardiopulmonary mortality, hospitalizations for cardiovascular and respiratory illness, and emergency room visits for respiratory illness and asthma as

⁸ [Link to the California Natural Resources Agency Safeguarding California Plan: 2018 Update](#)

⁹ [Link to the Principles of Community Engagement Report, Second Edition](#)

Co-benefit	Description
	a result of California Climate Investments. These health impacts occur because California Climate Investments projects change the emissions of particulate matter (PM2.5), diesel particulate matter (diesel PM), and nitrogen oxides (NOX). (source)
Anti-displacement	Research indicates that projects that increase property value will generally result in the displacement of low-income households from their vicinity. Thus, CCI projects that create new physical assets for neighborhoods, such as new rail stations, new open spaces, and new street trees, may increase displacement risks – a negative co-benefit. However, the Affordable Housing and Sustainable Communities (AHSC) program funds projects that include affordable housing targeted at households that cannot afford market-rate rents in the neighborhoods in question, which can act as a partial counterweight to displacement trends in those neighborhoods. The Transformative Climate Communities program may also possess the capacity to support such projects or take other measures to minimize or reverse displacement from areas of new public investment. (source)
Accelerated Implementation of Technology	The “accelerated implementation of technology” co-benefit is defined as any situation in which a CCI contributes to the development or diffusion of a given technology faster than it would have occurred in the absence of the CCI. This can occur in three types of situations. Some CCI, such as the Low Carbon Transportation Advanced Technology Freight Demonstration Projects, are directly investing in the development of new technology. Other CCI technology investments, such as high-speed rail, already exist in other parts of the world, but still may be new to California or the United States, and would not likely be implemented in the absence of a CCI. Still others, such as low-emission transit vehicles, already exist even in California, but will proliferate more rapidly as a result of the incentives that CCI projects provide beyond market forces. (source)

Appendix II. Examples of Common Needs of Priority Populations

<p>Public Health</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Reduce health harms (e.g., asthma) suffered disproportionately by priority populations due to air pollutants. 2. Reduce health harms (e.g. obesity) suffered disproportionately by priority populations due to the built environment (e.g., provide active transportation, parks, playgrounds). 3. Increase community safety. 4. Reduce heat-related illnesses and increase thermal comfort (e.g., weatherization and solar energy can provide more efficient and affordable air-conditioning; urban forestry can reduce heat island effect). 5. Increase access to parks, greenways, open space, and other community assets.
<p>Economic</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Create quality jobs and increase family income (e.g. targeted hiring for living-wage jobs that provide access to health insurance and retirement benefits with long term job retention, using project labor agreements with targeted hire commitments, community benefit agreements, community workforce agreements, partnerships with community-based workforce development and job training entities, State-certified community conservation corps). 2. Increase job readiness and career opportunities (e.g. workforce development programs, on-the-job-training, industry-recognized certifications). 3. Revitalize local economies (e.g. increased use of local businesses) and support California-based small businesses. 4. Reduce housing costs (e.g., affordable housing). 5. Reduce transportation costs (e.g., free or reduced cost transit passes) and improve access to public transportation (e.g., new services in under-served communities) 6. Reduce energy costs for residents (e.g., weatherization, solar). 7. Improve transit service levels and reliability on systems/ routes that have high use by disadvantaged and/or low- income community residents or low-income riders. 8. Bring jobs and housing closer together (e.g., affordable housing in transit oriented development and in health, high opportunity neighborhoods). 9. Preserve community stability and maintain housing affordability for low-income households (e.g., prioritize projects in jurisdictions with anti-displacement policies). 10. Provide educational and community capacity building opportunities through community engagement and leadership.
<p>Environmental</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Reduce exposure to local environmental contaminants, such as toxic air contaminants, criteria air pollutants, and drinking water contaminants (e.g., provide a buffer between bike/walk paths and transportation corridors). 2. Prioritize zero-emission vehicle projects for areas with high diesel air pollution, especially around schools or other sensitive populations with near-roadway exposure. 3. Reduce exposure to pesticides in communities near agricultural operations. 4. Greening communities through restoring local ecosystems and planting of native species, improving aesthetics of the landscape, and/or increasing public access for recreation.

Appendix III. Relevant Legislation

- **Assembly Bill 32 (Nuñez, Chapter 488, Statutes of 2006)**
- Assembly Bill (AB) 1532 (Pérez, Chapter 807, Statutes of 2012),
- Senate Bill (SB) 535 (de León, Chapter 830, Statutes of 2012),
- SB 1018 (Budget and Fiscal Review Committee, Chapter 39, Statutes of 2012),
- SB 862 (Budget and Fiscal Review Committee, Chapter 36, Statutes of 2014), and
- AB 1550 (Gomez, Chapter 369, Statutes of 2016)
- California Unemployment Insurance Code, Section 14230, Subdivision (e), specifies requirements pertaining to the curriculum and targeted participants for construction pre-apprenticeship programs in California.
- AB 74 (Ting, Chapter 23, Statutes of 2019).